

U. S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D. C.

_____)	
In the Matter of:)	
STAR ENTERPRISE)	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT
Respondent.)	AED/MSEB - 4856
_____)	

THIS AGREEMENT is made and entered into by and between the United States Environmental Protection Agency (hereafter "EPA") and Star Enterprise, 12700 Northborough Drive, Houston, Texas 77067 (hereafter "Respondent" or "Star").

Preliminary Statement

1. On December 28, 1998, a Notice of Violation ("Notice") was issued to Respondent for a violation of § 211(k) of the Clean Air Act ("Act"), 42 U.S.C. § 7545, and the reformulated gasoline ("RFG") regulations promulgated thereunder at 40 C.F.R. Part 80 ("regulations"). See Attachment 1. This law provides that only RFG may be sold in a covered area and sets out certain minimum and maximum standards for such gasoline. This law also provides that no person shall manufacture and sell or distribute, offer for sale or distribution, dispense, supply, offer for supply, store, transport, or cause the transportation of any gasoline represented as reformulated and intended for sale or use in any covered area unless such gasoline meets the applicable standards specified in 40 C.F.R. § 80.41. Violators of this law are subject to a maximum civil penalty of \$25,000 per day for each violation and the amount of the economic benefit or savings resulting from the violation.

2. After considering the gravity of the alleged violation, Respondent's history of compliance with the regulations, and the size of Respondent's business, EPA proposes a civil penalty of \$3,296 (hereafter "the proposed penalty").

3. The parties, desiring to settle and resolve this matter, in consideration of the mutual covenants and agreements contained herein, which consideration is acknowledged by the parties to be adequate, agree as set forth herein.

Terms of Agreement

4. The parties agree that the settlement of this matter is in the public interest and that this Settlement Agreement ("Agreement") is the most appropriate means of resolving the matter.

5. By entering into this Agreement, Respondent does not admit that it is in any way responsible for the alleged violations or that any violations have occurred.

6. The parties stipulate and agree to the following matters. It is further agreed that these stipulations are applicable to this Agreement and any enforcement or penalty proceeding arising out of this Agreement or the subject matter of this Agreement:

a. At all relevant times, Respondent was a refiner as defined within the meaning of 40 C.F.R. § 80.2.

b. On June 9, 1998, an approved EPA compliance survey was conducted at Respondent's branded retail outlet, Texaco Wesson # 3, located at 28 Waterbury Prospect Road, Prospect, Connecticut 06712.

c. As a result of the inspection, EPA determined that the Star branded retail outlet was selling premium reformulated gasoline that had a VOC emissions performance reduction of -7.83 percent. The minimum VOC emission performance reduction standard is 13.1 percent.

d. Where the gasoline contained in any storage tank at any retail outlet is found in violation, the refiner whose corporate, trade, or brand name that appears at the facility where the violation is found shall be deemed in violation. Therefore, Star is liable for one (1) violation of 40 C.F.R. § 80.78(a)(1) pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 80.79(a)(2).

e. Jurisdiction to settle this matter exists pursuant to § 211 of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7545, 40 C.F.R. § 80.20, and other provisions of law.

7. After considering the gravity of the alleged violation, Respondent's history of compliance with the regulations, EPA has determined to remit and mitigate the civil penalty to \$3,296 subject to successful completion of the terms of this Agreement.

Respondent agrees to pay \$3,296 to the United States of America within thirty (30) days from the date that this Agreement is executed by EPA and returned to Respondent by certified mail return receipt requested ("the due date"). In accordance with the Debt Collection Act of 1982, if the debt is not paid within 30 days following the due date, interest will accrue from the due date as the rate of eight percent (8%) per annum through the date of actual payment. A late payment handling charge of \$20.00 will also be imposed if the amount is not paid by the due date, with an additional charge of \$10.00 for each subsequent 30 day period. A six percent (6%) per annum penalty will be applied on any principal amount not paid within ninety (90) days of the due date.

Respondent agrees to pay the amount by check made payable to the "United States of America," and to mail the payment to:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Washington Accounting Operations
P.O. Box 360277M
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15251
Attn.: AED/MSEB - 4856

A photocopy of the check shall be mailed simultaneously to:

J. L. Adair, Attorney/Advisor
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Mobile Source Enforcement Branch
Air Enforcement Division (2242-A)
401 M Street, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20460
Attn.: AED/MSEB - 4856

8. Time is of the essence to this Agreement. Upon failure to timely perform pursuant to paragraph 7 of this Agreement, Respondent agrees to pay a stipulated penalty of \$6,592. This stipulated penalty is in addition to the proposed penalty. Upon such default this amount shall be immediately due and owing. The parties further agree that upon such default or failure to comply, EPA may refer this matter to the United States Attorney General for collection pursuant to § 211(d) of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7545(d), commence an action to enforce this Agreement or to recover the civil penalty pursuant to § 211 of the Clean Air Act; or pursue any other remedies available to it. Respondent specifically agrees that in the event of such default or failure to

comply, EPA may proceed in an action based on the original claim of violation of § 211 of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7545, and Respondent expressly waives its right to assert that such action is barred by 28 U.S.C. § 2462, other statutes of limitation, or other provisions limiting actions as a result of passage of time.

a. EPA agrees to provide a written notice to Respondent before finding Respondent in default of this Agreement. EPA agrees to send the notice by certified mail, return receipt requested. Respondent shall have five (5) business days to receive the notice in the mail. Thereafter, Respondent shall have ten (10) business days to make all payments or cure the default. The notice shall be sent to Respondent at its last known business address.

9. This Agreement becomes effective upon the date executed by EPA, at which time a copy will be returned to Respondent.

10. Respondent hereby represents that the individual or individuals executing this Agreement on behalf of Respondent are authorized to do so and that such execution is intended and is sufficient to bind Respondent.

11. Respondent waives its rights, if any, to a hearing, trial or any other proceeding on any issue of fact or law relating to the matters consented to herein.

12. The terms of this Agreement are contractual and not a mere recital. If any provision or provisions of this Agreement are held to be invalid, illegal or unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall not in any way be affected or impaired thereby.

13. The validity, enforceability, and construction of all matters pertaining to this Agreement shall be determined in accordance with applicable federal law.

14. Upon completion of the terms of this Agreement, this matter shall be deemed terminated and resolved. Nothing herein shall limit the right of EPA to proceed against Respondent in the event of default or noncompliance with this Agreement; for violations of § 211 of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7545, which are not the subject matter of this Agreement; or for other violations of law; or with respect to other matters not within the scope of the Agreement. This Agreement in no way affects, or relieves Respondent of responsibility to comply with other state, federal or local law or regulations.

The following agree to the terms of this Agreement:

Star Enterprise

by: Wm J Mathe

Date: 4/9/99

United States
Environmental Protection Agency

by: Bruce C. Buckheit

Date: 4/29/99

Bruce C. Buckheit, Director
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance



ATTACHMENT 1

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

DEC 28 1998

CERTIFIED MAIL
RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

OFFICE OF
ENFORCEMENT AND
COMPLIANCE ASSURANCE

Mr. Dorian Kavar, Attorney
Law Department
Star Enterprise
12700 Northborough Drive
Houston, Texas 77067

Re: File No. AED/MSEB - 4856

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF THE CLEAN AIR ACT AND
REQUEST FOR INFORMATION PURSUANT TO SECTION 114 OF THE
CLEAN AIR ACT

Dear Mr. Kavar:

On June 9, 1998, an approved U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") compliance survey was conducted at a Texaco branded retail outlet, located at Texaco Wesson #3, 28 Waterbury Prospect Road, Prospect, Connecticut 06712. The survey was conducted to determine compliance with section 211(k) of the Clean Air Act ("Act"), 42 U.S.C. § 7545(k), and the regulations issued thereunder (40 C.F.R. part 80, subpart D). Where inappropriate fuels are used in internal combustion engines, the emissions of harmful gases can increase significantly. Notwithstanding improvements in vehicle emission controls, emissions from motor vehicles continue to make up a very large portion of all air pollution. Congress has established a program of improvement and regulation of fuels to protect our air quality from unnecessary pollution associated with the misfueling of vehicles.

The applicable regulations provide that no person may manufacture and sell or distribute, offer for sale or distribution, dispense, supply, offer for supply, store, transport, or cause the transportation of any gasoline represented as reformulated and intended for sale or use in any covered area unless such gasoline meets the applicable standards specified in 40 C.F.R. § 80.41. This law also subjects violators to a maximum civil penalty of \$25,000 per day for each violation

in addition to recovery of the amount of the economic benefit or savings resulting from the violation.

As a result of the inspection, EPA has determined that a Texaco branded retail outlet, Texaco Wesson #3, which is located in the VOC-Control Region 2 reformulated gasoline covered area, was selling premium gasoline in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 80.78(a)(1) in that the premium gasoline failed to meet the minimum VOC emissions performance reduction percentage standard specified in 40 C.F.R. § 80.41. The gasoline had a VOC emission performance reduction of -7.83 percent which violates the minimum VOC emissions performance reduction of 13.1 percent for VOC-control Region 2. Where the gasoline contained in any storage tank at any retail outlet is found in violation of 40 C.F.R. § 80.78(a)(1), the refiner whose corporate, trade, or brand name, appears at the facility where the violation was found is deemed liable. As the branded refiner, Star Enterprise is liable for violation of 40 C.F.R. § 80.78(a)(1) pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 80.79(a)(2).

Sections 211 and 205 of the Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7545 and 7524, authorize the Administrator of EPA to assess a civil penalty of up to \$25,000 for every day of each violation and the economic benefit or savings resulting from the violation. In determining the appropriate penalty for the noticed violation, we consider the gravity of the violation, the economic benefit or savings (if any) resulting from the violation, the size of your business, your history of compliance with the Clean Air Act, actions taken by you to remedy the violation and to prevent recurrence of further violations, the effect of the penalty on your ability to continue in business and such other matters as justice may require.

We believe it is in your interest to demonstrate that remission or compromise of the penalty amount is appropriate. However, in order to assist us in developing the appropriate penalty and settlement positions, we have prepared the enclosed Request for Information. Under the law you are required to submit this information or be subject to additional penalties and other sanctions above and beyond those assessed for the fuel violation identified in this Notice. In addition, if you do not submit this information in a timely manner, we will be forced to

make assumptions with regard to the factors to consider in determining the appropriate amount of civil penalty which may not be in your interest or whether remission or compromise of the civil penalty amount is appropriate.


We encourage early settlement of such matters. The settlement process provides substantial flexibility for reducing the proposed penalty, particularly if the alleged violation is corrected promptly. If we cannot settle this matter promptly, we reserve the right to file an administrative complaint or refer this matter to the United States Department of Justice with a recommendation to file a civil complaint in federal district court.

The EPA attorney designated below has been assigned to this case. All information should be sent to the case attorney. Please contact this attorney regarding the Notice of Violation and Request for Information.

Jocelyn L. Adair, Attorney
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Mobile Sources Enforcement Branch (2242-A)
Air Enforcement Division
401 M Street, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20460
Phone number: (202) 564-1011

Please let me once again emphasize that while we take our obligation to enforce these requirements seriously, we will make every effort to reach an equitable settlement in this matter.

Sincerely yours,


Bruce C. Buckheit, Director
Air Enforcement Division

Enclosure