

Rule 57 Aquatic Values Data Sheet

Page 1 of 6

Chemical or product name: Boron
C.A.S #: 7440-42-8

Developed by: Bill Dimond
Approved by: D. Bush
Approval date: 12/29/2011
Literature Search Date: 9/28/2011

FAV*: 69,000 ug/l
AMV*: 34,000 ug/l
FCV*: 7,200 ug/l

(Tier: I)
(Tier: I)
(Tier: I)

ACUTE DATA

Species	Test type (EC or LC50)	Duration (hours)	Test conditions (FT.M, etc.)	Hardness/ Alkalinity ¹ mg/L	Chemical	LC50/EC50 ug/L	SMAV ug/L	GMAV ug/L	Rank	Reference
Fathead Minnow	LC50	96	SR,M	84	H ₃ BO ₃	75,900	77,777	77,777	1	1
(<i>Pimephales promelas</i>)	LC50	96	S,M	91	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	79,700				10
Water Flea	LC50	48	SR,M	84	H ₃ BO ₃	85,200	85,114	85,114	2	1
(<i>Ceriodaphnia dubia</i>)	LC50	48	S,M	96/94	H ₃ BO ₃	45,500				9
	LC50	48	S,M	290/95	H ₃ BO ₃	50,800				9
	LC50	48	S,M	168/167	H ₃ BO ₃	50,600				9
	LC50	48	S,M	508/167	H ₃ BO ₃	62,800				9
	LC50	48	S,M	100/94 ²	H ₃ BO ₃	99,400				9
	LC50	48	S,M	90/188 ²	H ₃ BO ₃	134,100				9
	LC50	48	S,M	90/60 ³	H ₃ BO ₃	83,800				9
	LC50	48	S,M	90/60 ³	H ₃ BO ₃	60,900				9
	LC50	48	S,M	90/60 ⁴	H ₃ BO ₃	72,100				9
	LC50	48	S,M	90/60 ⁴	H ₃ BO ₃	78,800				9
	LC50	48	S,M	120/75 ⁵	H ₃ BO ₃	62,400				9
	LC50	48	S,M	120/75 ⁵	H ₃ BO ₃	75,500				9
	LC50	48	S,M	120/75 ⁵	H ₃ BO ₃	85,200				9
	LC50	48	S,M	120/75 ⁵	H ₃ BO ₃	90,800				9
	LC50	48	S,M	120/75 ⁵	H ₃ BO ₃	89,900				9

ACUTE DATA (Continued)

Page 2 of 6

Species	Test type (EC or LC50)	Duration (hours)	Test conditions (FT,M, etc.)	Hardness/ Alkalinity ¹ mg/L	Chemical	LC50/EC50 ug/L	SMAV ug/L	GMAV ug/L	Rank	Reference
Water Flea (continued) (<i>Ceriodaphnia dubia</i>)	LC50	48	S,M	90 ⁶	H ₃ BO ₃ H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	102,000				10
				91 ^{6,7}		165,000				
				89 ^{6,7}		109,000				
				282 ⁷		104,000				
				469 ⁷		93,000				
				85 ⁸		91,000				
				87 ⁹		115,000				
				84 ¹⁰		142,000				
Amphipod (<i>Hyalella azteca</i>)	LC50	96	SR,M	84	H ₃ BO ₃	94,900	136,600	136,600	3	1
	LC50	96	S,M	106 ¹¹	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	107,000				10
				302 ¹¹		151,000				
				507 ¹¹		170,000				
				111 ¹²		269,000				
				291 ¹²		203,000				
				475 ¹²		188,000				
				102 ¹³		104,000				
				102 ¹⁴		127,000				
				103 ¹⁵		64,000				
Fatmucket (<i>Lampsilis siliquidea</i>)	LC50	96	S,M	90	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	137,000	137,000	137,000	4	10
Black Sandshell (<i>Ligumia recta</i>)	LC50	96	S,M	91	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	147,000	147,000	147,000	5	10

ACUTE DATA (Continued)

Page 3 of 6

Species	Test type (EC or LC50)	Duration (hours)	Test conditions (FT,M, etc.)	Hardness/ Alkalinity ¹ mg/L	Chemical	LC50/EC50 ug/L	SMAV ug/L	GMAV ug/L	Rank	Reference
Water Flea	LC50	48	S,U	166	H ₃ BO ₃	226,000	161,830	161,830	6	2
(<i>Daphnia magna</i>)	LC50	48	S,M	85	Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	141,000				3
	LC50	48	S,U	148	H ₃ BO ₃	133,000				4
Razorback Sucker	LC50	96	S,U	233-330	H ₃ BO ₃	233,000	254,965	254,965	7	5
(<i>Xyrauchen texanus</i>)	LC50	96	S,U	233-330	H ₃ BO ₃	279,000				5
Annelid	LC50	96	S,M	110-135	H ₃ BO ₃	261,000	269,366	269,366	8	6
(<i>Lumbriculus variegatus</i>)	LC50	96	S,M	110-135	H ₃ BO ₃	278,000				6
Colorado Squawfish	LC50	96	S,U	233-330	H ₃ BO ₃	279,000	383,499	383,449	9	5
(<i>Ptychocheilus lucius</i>)	LC50	96	S,U	233-330	H ₃ BO ₃	527,000				5
Bonytail	LC50	96	S,U	233-330	H ₃ BO ₃	280,000	393,141	393,141	10	5
(<i>Gila elegans</i>)	LC50	96	S,U	233-330	H ₃ BO ₃	552,000				5
Fingernail clam	LC50	96	S,M	102	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	>447,000	447,000	447,000	11	10
(<i>Sphaerium simile</i>)										
Winter Stonefly	LC50	96	S,M	98	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	476,000	476,000	476,000	12	10
(<i>Allocaenia vivipara</i>)										
Washboard	LC50	96	S,M	88	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	>544,000	544,000	544,000	13	10
(<i>Megaloniaias nervosa</i>)										
Chinook Salmon	LC50	96	S,U	211	H ₃ BO ₃	725,000	800,366	598,133	14	7
(<i>Oncorhynchus tshawytscha</i>)	LC50	96	S,U	41.7	H ₃ BO ₃	566,000				7
	LC50	96	S,U	41.7	H ₃ BO ₃	>1,000,000 ¹⁶				7
	LC50	96	S,U	41.7	H ₃ BO ₃	>1,000,000 ¹⁶				7

ACUTE DATA (Continued)

Page 4 of 6

Species	Test type (EC or LC50)	Duration (hours)	Test conditions (FT,M, etc.)	Hardness mg/L	Chemical	LC50/EC50 ug/L	SMAV ug/L	GMAV ug/L	Rank	Reference
Coho Salmon (<i>Oncorhynchus kisutch</i>)	LC50	96	S,U	211	H ₃ BO ₃	447,000	447,000			7
Midge (<i>Chironomus tentans</i>)	LC50	48	S,M	110-135	H ₃ BO ₃	1,503,000	1,296,309	1,335,560	15	6
	LC50	48	S,M	110-135	H ₃ BO ₃	1,503,000				6
	LC50	48	S,U	115	H ₃ BO ₃	964,290				8
Midge (<i>Chironomus decorus</i>)	LC50	48	S,U	85	Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	1,376,000	1,376,000			3
Brown Planarian (<i>Dugesia tigrina</i>)	LC50	96	SR,M	32	H ₃ BO ₃	1,357,720	1,357,720	1,357,720	16	1

CHRONIC DATA

Species	Test type (ELS, etc.)	Duration (days)	Study Conditions (FT,M etc.)	Hardness mg/L	Chemical	MATC ug/L	SMCV ug/L	GMCV ug/L	Rank	Reference
Amphipod (<i>Hyaella azteca</i>)	LC	42	SR,M	100	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	9,300	9,300	9,300	1	10
Water Flea (<i>Daphnia magna</i>)	LC	21	SR,M	148	H ₃ BO ₃	9,330	9,330	9,330	2	4
Fathead Minnow (<i>Pimephales promelas</i>)	LSG	7	SR,M	60	H ₃ BO ₃	14,100	15,020	15,020	3	1
	ELS	32	SR,M	100	H ₃ BO ₃ and Na ₂ B ₄ O ₇	16,000				10

Notes

* Value rounded to 2 significant figures.

¹ Hardness values given for all tests; if alkalinity value available, given after hardness as hardness/alkalinity

² Results from tests of pH effect on toxicity. Test series included pH-unmodified waters, and waters with pH modified by carbon dioxide atmosphere. Carbon dioxide-modified water test results not used because carbon dioxide treatments may have compromised test organism performance, based on poor control performance. Reported values are for tests in waters without carbon dioxide treatment.

³ Results from tests of chlorides effects on toxicity (inconclusive).

⁴ Results from tests of sulfates effects on toxicity (inconclusive).

⁵ Results from tests of dissolved organic carbon effects on toxicity (inconclusive).

⁶ Results from tests of effect of boron compound type on toxicity.

⁷ Results from tests of hardness effect on toxicity.

⁸ Results from tests of pH effects on toxicity; pH 6.6.

⁹ Results from tests of pH effects on toxicity; pH 7.6.

¹⁰ Results from tests of pH effects on toxicity; pH 8.4.

¹¹ Results from tests of waters with chloride and hardness covarying.

¹² Results from tests of waters with hardness varying (via Ca and Mg SO₄ addition) but chloride constant.

¹³ Results from tests of pH effects on toxicity; pH 6.6.

¹⁴ Results from tests of pH effects on toxicity; pH 7.6.

¹⁵ Results from tests of pH effects on toxicity; pH 8.4.

¹⁶ Values not used in previous review. However, this review considers the "greater than" data points to reliably establish a minimum LC50, and therefore uses the values for GMAV development.

References Used:

1. #019013: Sanders and Associates, LLC. 2007. Toxicity of boron to the aquatic organisms—*Hyalella azteca* (benthic crustacean), *Dugesia tigrina* (flatworm); *Ceriodaphnia dubia* (water flea) and *Pimephales promelas* (fathead minnow). Report to Michigan Department of Environmental Quality. April 30, 2007.
2. #008973: Lewis, M.A.; and L.C. Valentine. 1981. Acute and chronic toxicities of boric acid to *Daphnia magna* Straus. Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 27: 304-315.
3. #014096: Maier, K.J.; and A.W. Knight. 1991. The toxicity of waterborne boron to *Daphnia magna* and *Chironomus decorus* and the effects of water hardness and sulfate on boron toxicity. Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 20: 282-287.
4. #ATL0003: Gersich, F.M. 1984. Evaluation of static renewal chronic toxicity test method for *Daphnia magna* Straus using boric acid. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 3: 89-94.
5. #014544: Hamilton, S. 1995. Hazard assessment of inorganics to three endangered fish in the Green River, Utah. Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf. 30: 134-142.
6. #015445: Sanders, D. 1998. Tier II boron value data supplement. Rept., RMT Applied Biology, Appleton, WI. August 7, 1998.
7. #014097: Hamilton, S.; and K. Buhl. 1990. Acute toxicity of boron, molybdenum, and selenium to fry of Chinook Salmon and Coho Salmon. Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 19: 366-373.
8. #015444: Sanders, D. 1999. Tier II boron value data supplement. Rept., RMT Applied Biology, Appleton, WI. February 15, 1999.
9. Dethloff, G.M., W.M Stubblefield, and C.E.Schlekat. 2009. Effects of water quality parameters on boron toxicity to *Ceriodaphnia dubia* . Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 57:60-67.
10. Soucek, D.J., A. Dickinson, and B.T. Koch. 2011. Acute and chronic toxicity of boron to a variety of freshwater organisms. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 30(8): 1906-1914.

References Reviewed, but not used

- Kanabur, V.V. and D. Sannadurgappa. 2001. Acute toxicity of phenol and cresol to a freshwater fish. Environ. Ecol. 19(4):756-758.

(Paran FAV
11/22/11 B. Diamond

```
S:\WRD_SWASIAWATER-1\FAV\FAV.EXE
HOW MANY SHAUS OR SHCUs ARE IN THE DATA SET?
? 16
WHAT ARE THE 4 LOWEST VALUES?
? 77777
? 85114
? 136600
? 137000
PAU = 68522.9
Do you want to run another calculation? (Y or N)
? -
```

7
7
7
5

Min. data req. met	Acute Factor
2	13
3	8
4	7
5	6.1
6	5.2
7	4.3

Rule 57 Aquatic Values Work Sheet

Chemical Name: Boron
C.A.S. #: 7440-42-8

AQUATIC MAXIMUM VALUE CALCULATIONS

A. Minimum 8 species requirement is **not** met. Minimum requirements met = n/a

Minimum requirements missing for Tier I =

Acute factor =

1. Toxicity **is not** dependent on a water characteristic

a. FAV calculation

2. Toxicity **is** dependent on a water characteristic

a. Slope = (Table)

b. FAV equation:

3. Go to C.

B. Minimum 8 species requirement **is** met (Tier I)

1. Toxicity **is not** dependent on a water characteristic

a. FAV calculation: 68,522.9 ug/l (see attached) round to 69,000 ug/l

2. Toxicity **is** dependent on a water characteristic

a. Slope = (Table)

b. Ranked genus mean acute intercepts: Table

c. Final acute intercept = (Att.)

In of final acute intercept =

d. FAV equation =

C. Aquatic Maximum Value (AMV) calculation:

$68,522.9/2 = 34261.45$ round to 34,000 ug/l

FINAL CHRONIC VALUE CALCULATIONS

- A. Minimum 8 species requirement is **not** met (Tier II). Minimum requirements met = 3
Minimum requirements missing for Tier I =

1. Acute to chronic ratio

- a. Number ACRs meeting minimum data requirements = 3 (Table ____)
b. Acute to chronic ratio = 9.470010106

2. Toxicity **is not** dependent on a water characteristic

$$\text{FCV} = 68522.9 / 9.470010106 = 7235.778973, \text{round to } 7,200 \text{ ug/l}$$

3. Toxicity **is** dependent on a water characteristic

- a. Slope = (Table __)
b. Aquatic chronic intercept = (Table __)
In of aquatic chronic intercept =
c. FCV equation =

- B. Minimum 8 species requirement **is** met (Tier I)

1. Toxicity **is not** dependent on a water characteristic

- a. FCV = ____ (Att. ____)

2. Toxicity **is** dependent on a water characteristic

- a. Slope = (Table __)
b. Ranked genus mean chronic intercepts: Table ____
c. Final chronic intercept = ____ (Att. ____); In of final chronic intercept =
d. FCV equation =

Table 1. Boron ACR Values Calculations

11/22/2011

Species	Reference	LC50	MATC	ACR	SMACR
<i>Hyaella azteca</i> ¹	10	107,000	9,300	11.505376	11.50538
<i>Daphnia magna</i>	4	133,000	9,330	14.255091	14.25509
<i>Pimephales promelas</i>	1	75,900	14,100	5.3829787	5.17822
	10	79,700	16,000	4.98125	

Final ACR is cube root of the SMACRs = 9.470010106

¹ *H. azteca* LC50 and MATC generated in 100b water.