



## **OFFICIAL MEETING OF THE NATIONAL AND GOVERNMENTAL ADVISORY COMMITTEES (NAC/GAC)**

### **SUMMARY**

**December 17, 2013**

EPA East Building  
1201 Constitution Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20460

Call-In Number: 866-299-3188; Participant Code: 202-233-0072  
Video Connection Link: <https://epa.connectsolutions.com/nac-gac-mtg/>

*Note: The U.S. National and Governmental Advisory Committees (NAC/GAC) are federal advisory committees chartered by Congress, operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA); 5 U.S.C., App. 2. The committees provide advice to the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) on the implementation of the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation. The findings and/or recommendations of the committees do not represent the views of the Agency, and this document does not represent information approved or disseminated by EPA.*

---

---

## Table of Contents

---

---

Call to Order and Introductions .....	1
Opening Remarks.....	1
Welcome and Overview of the Agenda .....	2
Update on U.S. Priorities and Guidance: 20th Anniversary .....	2
Member Comments and Discussion .....	3
Commission for Environmental Cooperation Operational Plan Overview and North American Partnership for Environmental Community Action Grants Update .....	4
Member Comments and Discussion .....	5
Joint Public Advisory Committee Report-Out.....	6
Member Comments and Discussion .....	6
Public Comment Period .....	7
Discussion on the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation 20th Anniversary.....	7
First Charge Question .....	7
Second Charge Question .....	9
Next Steps .....	10
Adjournment .....	11
Action Items.....	11
Summary Certification.....	13
Appendix A: Meeting Participants.....	14
Appendix B: Meeting Agenda .....	16
Appendix C: Charge Questions for December 2013 NAC/GAC Meeting .....	18

## **Call to Order and Introductions**

*Oscar Carrillo, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), Office of Diversity, Advisory Committee Management and Outreach (ODACMO), U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)*

Mr. Carrillo, NAC/GAC DFO, ODACMO, called the meeting to order. He greeted the participants and thanked them for attending. Members participated by teleconference and/or videoconference using Adobe Connect. Mr. Carrillo conducted the roll call for those attending via teleconference/videoconference, and then those attending in-person introduced themselves.

## **Opening Remarks**

*Denise Benjamin-Sirmons, Director, ODACMO, EPA*

*Mark Joyce, Associate Director, ODACMO, EPA*

Mr. Mark Joyce, Associate Director, ODACMO, welcomed the participants. He expressed his appreciation to the NAC/GAC members for the work they performed to prepare for the meeting. He then introduced Ms. Denise Benjamin-Sirmons, the Director of ODACMO, the new EPA office that has primary responsibility for EPA's diversity efforts and the Advisory Committee Management Program. Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons formerly served at the U.S. Small Business Administration; she has a Master's degree in Law with honors from George Washington University, and earned a J.D. *cum laude* from Howard University.

Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons thanked Mr. Carrillo; Ms. Stephanie McCoy, ODACMO; and Mr. Joyce for their support of the NAC/GAC. She also expressed her gratitude to the NAC/GAC members and EPA staff for arranging their schedules to attend the meeting at such a busy time of the year. As Director of ODACMO, Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons currently is engaged in planning the strategic direction for the new office. She thanked the members of the Committees and stakeholders for their work, which is very important to EPA and the U.S. Government. Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons also acknowledged the efforts of the NAC and GAC Chairs with whom she has had preliminary discussions that focused primarily on the meeting format, in particular, and scheduling an in-person meeting. Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons recognized the successes of Ms. Cynthia Jones-Jackson, Associate Director, ODACMO, in fostering the work of the Committees under challenging budgetary constraints.

Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons was optimistic about EPA's budget for 2014 and was confident that there will not be another sequester in 2014. Accordingly, she will explore the options for at least one in-person meeting. Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons apologized in advance for having to leave the meeting early because of a schedule conflict and expressed her hope that the members of the Committees would have a productive meeting.

Mr. Carrillo yielded the floor to Dr. Octaviana Trujillo, Chair of the GAC, and Mr. Brian Houseal, Chair of the NAC.

## Welcome and Overview of the Agenda

*Octaviana Trujillo, Chair of the GAC*

*Brian Houseal, Chair of the NAC*

Dr. Trujillo thanked Mr. Carrillo, Ms. Jones-Jackson and Ms. McCoy for assisting the Committees and stated that she was looking forward to working with Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons. Mr. Houseal extended his greetings to the NAC/GAC members and EPA staff and expressed his appreciation of Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons' efforts to plan an in-person meeting for the NAC/GAC in 2014. He acknowledged the difficulty of working via teleconference and asked NAC members to feel free to contact him via telephone or email.

Mr. Carrillo provided an overview of the agenda and then introduced Ms. Nishida.

## Update on U.S. Priorities and Guidance: 20th Anniversary

*Jane Nishida, Acting Assistant Administrator, Office of International and Tribal Affairs (OITA), EPA*

*JoAnn Chase, Director, American Indian Environmental Office (AIEO), OITA*

Ms. Nishida welcomed the participants and thanked ODACMO staff for their input. She noted some recent changes at EPA: a new Director for the newly organized ODACMO and a new EPA Administrator. Ms. Nishida thanked former OITA Director Michelle DePass for her excellent service to EPA and reported that Ms. DePass was appointed Dean of the Milano School of International Affairs, Management and Urban Policy at the New School in New York City. On behalf of EPA Administrator Gina McCarthy, Ms. Nishida expressed EPA's commitment to establishing a dialogue with the NAC/GAC members and the Agency's gratitude to the NAC/GAC for providing advice on interacting with the Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC). Administrator McCarthy is looking forward to participating in the July 17, 2014, CEC Council Session in Yellowknife, Northwest Territories, Canada, and meeting in-person the NAC/GAC members who plan to attend. Ms. Nishida anticipated that First Nations' issues would be a focus of the Session.

Ms. Nishida described Administrator McCarthy's seven priorities:

- (1) *Making a visible difference in communities across the country.* Administrator McCarthy would like EPA to make a difference at the community level as well as promulgate national standards. The CEC's North American Partnership for Environmental Community Action (NAPECA) grants follow a similar philosophy of community-level action.
- (2) *Addressing climate change and improving air quality.* EPA is the key agency in implementing President Obama's Climate Change Action Plan. The CEC is incorporating climate change action into its operational plan, addressing blue and green, as well as black, carbon.
- (3) *Taking action on toxics and chemical safety.* EPA is committed to working with other agencies to reduce risks to human health from toxic chemicals, including those found in indoor and outdoor air, as well as food.

(4) *Protecting water.*

(5) *Launching a new era of state, tribal and local partnerships.*

(6) *Embracing EPA as a high-performing organization.*

(7) *Working toward a sustainable future.* Traditional approaches need to be supplemented with collaboration with other agencies and stakeholders.

Ms. Nishida stated that these priorities will be incorporated into the work of all program and regional offices at EPA, as well as the Agency's work with the CEC.

Ms. Nishida acknowledged the NAC/GAC's expressed interest in working with tribal nations and introduced Ms. Joann Chase, Director, AIEO, OITA, who spoke about the dedication of the new leadership to EPA's work with tribal nations. Ms. Chase expressed her appreciation of Ms. DePass' guidance and noted that the transition to Ms. Nishida's leadership had proceeded smoothly. She stated that Administrator McCarthy's action-oriented approach is welcomed by the tribal nations.

Ms. Chase reported on recent interactions with tribal nations. On November 12, 2013, EPA participated in a listening session with tribal leaders that was associated with the White House Tribal Nations Conference, which took place on November 13, 2013. Administrator McCarthy addressed the plenary session, expressing EPA's commitment to partnering with tribal governments. In addition, Administrator McCarthy and Jodi Gillette, Senior Policy Advisor for Native American Affairs, White House Domestic Policy Council, have engaged in a candid discussion of tribal issues.

Ms. Chase indicated that OITA had completed administration of its first training course for EPA staff and launched the second training series, focusing on tribal consultation. Feedback on the first course was very positive.

She explained that EPA oversees the Indian Environmental General Assistance Program (IGAP). Under the leadership of Ms. DePass, Ms. Nishida, Administrator McCarthy and the Deputy Administrator, EPA has succeeded in maintaining the resources that fund the IGAP. EPA finalized the *Guidance on the Award and Management of General Assistance Agreements for Tribes and Intertribal Consortia* in 2013. Another EPA-tribal program that has continued during the current atmosphere of fiscal constraint is EPA's Tribal ecoAmbassadors Program, which fosters links with Indian academics to address environmental problems. Ms. Chase acknowledged the specific challenges that global climate change poses to tribal nations and stated that EPA is dedicated to engaging tribal nations, as well as learning from tribal elders, in the area of climate change adaptation.

### ***Member Comments and Discussion***

Ms. Nishida asked the NAC/GAC members to assist with identifying community events at which the successes of projects under the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation (NAAEC) might be highlighted.

Dr. Trujillo thanked Ms. Nishida and Ms. Chase for their updates. She expressed her appreciation of their work with Ms. Gillette to help EPA understand better the government-to-government nature of the relationship between the United States and tribal governments.

Dr. Trujillo asked for details about the planned celebration of the 20th Anniversary of the NAAEC. Ms. Nishida responded that a 20th Anniversary Task Force has been formed, comprised of representatives from the United States, Mexico and Canada. The Task Force still is in the process of developing specific recommendations, but will aim for a celebratory approach of past accomplishments and future goals. Mr. Patrick Huber, OITA, added that in its most recent meeting, the Task Force discussed key projects to highlight from the 2013/2014 CEC Operational Plan. Mr. Huber will provide the NAC/GAC with a summary of the activities of the 20th Anniversary Task Force to date.

Ms. Gail Small (Native Action), NAC member, asked Ms. Chase to enumerate the action-oriented results from EPA's meeting with the tribal leaders. Ms. Nishida responded that the eight tribal representatives in attendance, who were joined by Administrator McCarthy and Assistant Administrators from most program offices, presented general concerns and those that are specific to individual tribes. Ms. Chase added that the concerns of the tribal leaders were wide-ranging. Chief among them were the devastating impacts of sequestration and the need for protection of natural resources, particularly headwaters and sacred sites. Ms. Chase emphasized that the Agency and Administrator McCarthy are committed to working with tribal leaders to address to the greatest degree possible the budgetary concerns of tribes that resulted from the sequestration.

Dr. Trujillo commended the Agency for continuing to maintain the funding levels for the IGAP but inquired about the ways in which EPA plans to target resources to issues. An example is the impact of hydraulic fracturing (fracking) on the Blackfeet Nation. Prioritizing issues also is a concern. Ms. Chase replied that EPA will seek tribal input to frame funding priorities.

Mr. David Markell (Florida State University), NAC member, compared the seven priorities of Administrator McCarthy with the CEC Operational Plan, observing that the CEC Operational Plan did not have a strong focus on climate change adaptation or water issues. Ms. Nishida responded that the NAPECA grants address adaptation issues, and although the CEC Operational Plan is not as focused on water issues, the Big Bend project relates to water issues. Administrator McCarthy will seek guidance from the NAC/GAC on incorporating the Agency's priorities into the CEC Operational Plan.

## **Commission for Environmental Cooperation Operational Plan Overview and North American Partnership for Environmental Community Action Grants Update**

*Irasema Coronado, Executive Director, CEC Secretariat*

Ms. Irasema Coronado, Executive Director, CEC Secretariat, provided an overview of progress on project activities under the CEC Operational Plan. The Operational Plan was informed by the CEC's 2010–2015 Strategic Framework and key environmental areas identified in 2013: climate change, greening transportation and addressing waste in trade. Ms. Coronado highlighted the successes of the North American AirNow-International project, which is gaining momentum, including implementation at the *Sistema Nacional de Información de la Calidad del Aire*

(SINAICA) and development of a Mexican air quality index. Another CEC project, Improving Indoor Air Quality to Reduce Exposure to Airborne Contaminants in Alaskan Native Populations and Other Indigenous Communities in North America, showed measureable successes, reducing the number of days in the hospital among Alaska Native populations. North American Black Carbon Emissions Estimations Guidelines is aiming to identify reliable inventories and establish baselines. The CEC is developing a North American Informational Platform on Climate Change, with a planned launch date in 2014. The North American Pollutant Releases and Transfers (PRTR) Project is refining an online database for tracking pollutant releases in North America. The CEC's Green Building in North America project is developing a toolkit of best practices and working with Mexico on capacity building. The CEC project on North American truck and bus manufacturing is working to improve environmental performance in the supply chain. The CEC also is aiming to improve air quality at land ports of entry and reduce emissions from marine transportation. CEC efforts to enhance environmental enforcement and compliance cooperation have focused on ozone-depleting chemicals and spent batteries. In addition, the CEC is working to understand the effects of chemicals in domestic products, especially cleaning products. The CEC is closing out its past work on Sound Management of Chemicals (SMOC).

Ms. Coronado reviewed the accomplishments to date and planned activities for 2013–2014 for the North American Collaboration for Conservation of Transboundary Protected Areas. The CEC's North American blue carbon assessment will focus on coastal habitats. The Integrated Modeling and Assessment of North American Forest Carbon Dynamics and Climate Change Mitigation Options project will focus on three pilot sites—one each in Canada, the United States and Mexico—and model the effects of land-cover changes over time on carbon dynamics. The Catalyzing North American Grasslands Conservation and Sustainable Use Through Partnerships project will fund pilot projects for ranchers to adopt beneficial management practices.

Ms. Coronado indicated that the Submission on Enforcement Matters (SEM) process has moved forward. It is in full compliance with timelines and has completed a record number of determinations. The NAPECA grants program received 560 proposals and recommended 46 applicants to submit full proposals. It will make funding decisions public in January 2014. The CEC is continuing to develop the North American Environmental Atlas. There has been a good response to its redesigned website.

Ms. Coronado asked the NAC/GAC members send their questions about the CEC Operational Plan and NAPECA grants to her via email.

### ***Member Comments and Discussion***

Dr. Trujillo indicated that Mr. Carrillo will distribute a copy of Ms. Coronado's PowerPoint slides to NAC/GAC members via email.

In response to a question raised by Ms. Anna Romero-Lizana (World Trade Center), NAC member, in the chat conversation, Ms. Coronado stated that the access to the SEM website is not password-protected.

## **Joint Public Advisory Committee Report-Out**

*David Angus, Chair, Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC)*

Mr. David Angus, Chair, JPAC, reported on the JPAC's recent activities. He stated that a major part of the JPAC's focus for 2013 has been the 20th Anniversary Review. The goal of the review has been learning from the past 20 years to create priorities for the next two decades. The year's activities culminated in the JPAC Regular Session in October 2013, held in Washington, D.C. The meeting's agenda included three expert panels.

In April 2013, the JPAC issued a call for information and comments from the public reviewing the first 20 years of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and the NAAEC. The comments, summarized in a document that was provided to the NAC/GAC members in the meeting materials, recognized the strengths of the CEC as an international body.

Recommendations included the need for greater awareness of the CEC's activities; better engagement of individuals and businesses; deeper relationships with provincial and state governments; engagement of indigenous governmental entities; and a new mission that addresses issues such as climate change, transportation, water and transboundary concerns.

Mr. Angus indicated the JPAC currently is planning for next year's focus. Input from the Washington, D.C., meeting is being incorporated to inform the focus for 2014.

### ***Member Comments and Discussion***

Mr. Houseal praised Mr. Angus for the high quality of the Washington, D.C., meeting and asked when the document that the JPAC is preparing for the 20th anniversary of the NAFTA/NAAEC will be available. He thought it might be useful to the NAC/GAC members in addressing their charge. Mr. Angus replied that the report is being finalized and will be released within the next few weeks; it will include a synopsis of the information that the JPAC received from its call for information as well as a full report from the Washington, D.C., meeting.

Dr. Trujillo suggested that some of the NAC/GAC members might want to assist the CEC and JPAC in engaging indigenous peoples. She proposed convening a panel at the next JPAC meeting. Mr. Angus responded that the issue of engaging indigenous peoples had been raised at the most recent JPAC teleconference and received strong support. At a minimum, there will be a panel on indigenous peoples at each future JPAC conference. In addition, the JPAC is considering having engagement of indigenous peoples as the theme at the next JPAC meeting. Ms. Small volunteered to help identify issues on engaging indigenous peoples for the upcoming JPAC meeting. Mr. Angus agreed to arrange a teleconference call with Ms. Small, Dr. Trujillo and others who might be interested in helping to plan the meeting.

Mr. Markell inquired about the advice that the JPAC had offered to the CEC Council to reinstate the CEC's budget to former levels. He also asked about the current CEC budget. Mr. Angus replied that the JPAC offered its support to the CEC Council to advocate for the restoration of its \$9 million budget. In the long term, the JPAC is concerned that funding is not being adjusted for inflation and is limiting the effectiveness of the CEC. Ms. Sylvia Correa, Senior Director of the North American Program, OITA, added that the United States is making all possible efforts to restore funding, but the current political and budgetary situation makes it difficult to predict success.



Mr. Markell asked for details about the CEC's budget, including the adjustments that were made to accommodate reduced resources. Ms. Coronado answered that all of the initiatives of the 2013/2014 Operational Plan were continuing, but staffing reductions and other measures were taken to reduce internal costs.

Ms. Mary Klein (NatureServe), NAC member, who attended the Washington, D.C., JPAC meeting, reported that the JPAC had recommended that the work of the CEC Council be better aligned with the political priorities of the member nations. She noted that the CEC is competing for scarce financial resources and must provide clearer justification to support its funding requests.

Dr. Trujillo thanked Mr. Angus and Ms. Coronado, wished them happy holidays, and stated that she is looking forward to the JPAC's report.

## **Public Comment Period**

At 2:12 p.m., Dr. Trujillo opened the meeting for public comments. Several members of the public had contacted Mr. Carrillo about attending the meeting, but no oral public comments or questions were provided in response to Dr. Trujillo's request. Mr. Carrillo indicated that no written comments had been submitted to EPA prior to the meeting.

## **Discussion on the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation 20th Anniversary**

Mr. Carrillo shared the NAC/GAC's charge questions (see Appendix C) with the meeting participants using Adobe Connect. Mr. Houseal suggested that the members of the Committees discuss each charge question in turn. Dr. Ivonne Santiago (University of Texas at El Paso), NAC member, volunteered to compile the information for the NAC advice letter. Ms. Therese Goodmann (City of Dubuque), GAC member, volunteered to compile the GAC members' responses for the GAC advice letter.

### ***First Charge Question***

Ms. Klein commented that the list of recommended issues on which the CEC should focus in the next decade, derived from the JPAC's call for information and comments, was excellent but lengthy. The list includes issues related to climate change, transportation, energy, water and biodiversity. Communication with stakeholder audiences would be facilitated if the issues were prioritized. Mr. Houseal agreed with the need to prioritize, commenting that the NAC/GAC has been clear in its advice to the EPA Administrator about which issues should be emphasized by the CEC. He suggested that the NAC/GAC prioritize the potential areas of future focus to advise the Administrator. Mr. Raymond Lozano (New Detroit), NAC member, concurred that the JPAC's list was very comprehensive, and the NAC/GAC would need to prioritize issues to provide its recommendations.

Ms. Klein suggested that some individual issues might be represented by cross-cutting priorities. Ms. Goodmann stated that there are issues associated with water that are related to biodiversity. In addition, engagement of indigenous communities and stakeholders could be removed from the

list and presented as part of a recommended overarching approach for the CEC. Mr. Timothy Bent (Bridgestone America), NAC member, agreed with the need to distill the list of priorities. Mr. Salud Carbajal (County of Santa Barbara), GAC member, noted that the issue of climate change already is very broad and includes many issues. He suggested selecting three or four priorities and including the rest of the list as subsets of these main themes. Dr. Santiago pointed out that for climate change, some suggestions might be included as a subset of the general priority of climate change but others are suggestions for specific activities. Mr. Houseal noted that EPA is in the process of formulating a draft policy on climate change. Input from the NAC/GAC on this issue would be timely. Mr. Carbajal, who serves on the CEC's State, Local and Tribal Leaders Task Force on Climate Preparedness and Resilience, indicated that the Task Force is charged with providing advice to President Obama on the ways in which the United States might provide international leadership on climate preparedness and resilience. Dr. Cecilia Martinez (Center for Energy and Environmental Policy), NAC member, stressed the importance to trilateral agreements of implementing the President's Climate Action Plan.

Dr. Santiago expressed her opinion that the JPAC had done a good job in identifying the environmental accomplishments of the NAAEC and NAFTA, as well as the improvements needed. She asked whether the NAC/GAC members would like to add to the JPAC's lists of accomplishments and needed improvements. She proposed an email survey of the members to identify and prioritize the 10 most significant successes among those identified by the JPAC. Dr. Santiago agreed to develop a survey form to distribute to the NAC/GAC members for this purpose.

Ms. Small suggested that to highlight the CEC's accomplishments, the CEC's past expenditures could be quantified by issue and region. Dr. Santiago concurred, recognizing the value of the JPAC's summary of the results of its call for information but noting that it is based on opinions and perceptions, not facts. Ms. Small agreed that considering outcomes would provide the NAC/GAC with an understanding of the progress that has been made by the CEC on environmental issues, which would allow the NAC/GAC to better advise the CEC for the future. Dr. Santiago suggested that an outcomes-based assessment would help the NAC/GAC determine whether the CEC's priorities had changed over the years. Dr. Trujillo agreed that consideration of performance measures might be fruitful for advising the CEC on future priorities. Mr. Bent also was of the opinion that conducting a financial analysis of the CEC's past work would be very important. Ms. Goodman asked Mr. Carrillo whether an accounting of CEC's past expenditures by issue and region, including measures of project outcomes, is available, and if so, whether it could be shared with the NAC/GAC members. Mr. Carrillo replied that he was not aware of a compilation of this information, noting that former NAC member Dr. Robert Paster had tried unsuccessfully to obtain these data. It would require an analysis of the CEC's budget each year for the past 20 years. Ms. Small suggested consulting the CEC's annual reports, which Ms. Correa might be able to provide to the NAC/GAC. Mr. Houseal proposed adding the development of a compilation of performance measures and expenditures as a recommended priority for the CEC to the survey of the NAC/GAC members. Dr. Santiago seconded this proposal, noting that it was not within the purview of the NAC/GAC to create a compilation.

Dr. Santiago suggested that an example of data that might be informative about CEC's accomplishments are the outcomes of the SEMs, including a summary of the number of requests versus the number of resolutions. She stressed the importance of the SEMs as an activity of the

CEC. Mr. Houseal responded that a record of SEM decisions is archived by the CEC, but he was not sure that a cumulative summary exists.

Dr. Trujillo indicated that Dr. Martinez had requested clarification of the phrase “integration of trade and the environment” in the first charge question. Mr. Carrillo responded that the phrase was meant to indicate that efforts to increase trade under NAFTA should consider the environment. Dr. Santiago asked whether in general, there is a requirement for environmental impact statements for new trade agreements. Mr. Houseal answered that most countries have an environmental impact process, although sometimes it is not implemented. Mr. Bent added that in the private sector, efforts are being made to induce decision makers to consider environmental issues when making business decisions and business issues when making environmental decisions.

Mr. Roger Vintze (California Department of Toxics Substances Control), GAC member, suggested that there is a need for a binding requirement to conduct an environmental impact assessment for projects that will affect both sides of an international border. He proposed including this recommendation in the advice letter.

Mr. Bent noted that the CEC has many major accomplishments, but not all of its goals have been achieved. He suggested that a high-level analysis of cases be conducted.

Mr. Houseal asked for input from other members of the NAC/GAC about future CEC priorities. Ms. Ginny Broadhurst (Northwest Straits Commission), GAC member, stated that ocean acidification is a major environmental concern in Washington State. She asked whether the CEC plans to include the implications of this issue on trade and the environment among its priorities. Mr. Vintze indicated that alternative energy production is very important for California. Many projects are being fast tracked, causing hardship in tribal areas.

Mr. Houseal noted that a 1-day meeting on tribal issues is scheduled to coincide with the upcoming CEC Council meeting.

### ***Second Charge Question***

Ms. Broadhurst indicated that she has information about a conference planned for April 2014 in Seattle, Washington, the Salish Sea Ecosystem Conference, which presents an opportunity to communicate about the NAAEC/NAFTA 20th anniversary. Mr. Bent suggested in general that the NAC/GAC members represent the CEC at prominent environmental gatherings. A committee member proposed developing a briefing package for colleagues to bring to conferences if none of the NAC/GAC members would be attending a particular meeting. Mr. Houseal added that a communications package would be helpful to the NAC/GAC members who act as representatives of the CEC. Ms. Klein asked for clarification about whether it would be appropriate for the NAC/GAC members to act as representatives of the CEC to members of the larger community. Ms. Jones-Jackson responded that Ms. DePass and Ms. Nishida had asked specifically for the NAC/GAC members to serve as “megaphones” for the work of the CEC. She indicated that Mr. Carrillo would determine whether the CEC was developing any communications kits that might be used by the NAC/GAC members.

Dr. Santiago noted that the first two charge questions are closely related. She suggested that the CEC develop a fact sheet, pointing out that citizens often are unaware of the CEC until they become involved in a crisis that is relevant to the CEC.

Ms. Romero-Lizana noted that St. Louis, Missouri, is celebrating its 250th anniversary and is communicating about events via a calendar of events to distribute via email or hardcopy; there has been a strong response of information to include in the calendar. She suggested creating such a calendar of events to help solicit ideas of events to publicize the 20th anniversary of the NAAEC.

Ms. Klein stated that she is most comfortable with assuming the role of spokesperson within her own community and communicating the community's concerns to the NAC/GAC. There are six or seven upcoming conferences that she plans to attend. She thought it would be easier to publicize the CEC's 20th anniversary at these events rather than through a general calendar. Ms. Jones-Jackson responded that in drafting this charge, EPA originally had intended the NAC/GAC members to highlight the work of the CEC using their own individual networks.

Mr. Vintze commented that many in the community are not familiar with the CEC or the North American Development Bank (NADB) and Border Environment Cooperation Commission (BECC), other institutions created under NAFTA. More education is needed about available resources from these institutions. There is a need to demonstrate the CEC's achievements at the grassroots level. He also suggested advertising the CEC's accomplishments through the Border 2020 program. Mr. Vintze indicated that there are task forces along the border region that might publicize the 20th anniversary and approaches to engaging the CEC. He suggested that the NAC/GAC members need to become more involved in publically advancing the understanding of the Committees, the CEC and institutions engendered by NAFTA such as the NADB. Mr. Bent agreed that one of the CEC's main challenges is to increase the level of awareness, with the ultimate goal of fostering engagement.

Mr. Lozano noted the need to draw attention to CEC activities involving cooperation along the Canada-U.S. border and publicize them in the area around Detroit, Michigan.

Mr. Houseal suggesting creating an environmental digest via email to which interested parties might subscribe. This would be an approach to increase awareness about CEC activities.

## **Next Steps**

The participants discussed plans for the Committees to meet in 2014. Dr. Trujillo indicated that Mr. Carrillo would send a Doodle poll to schedule the April and October 2014 NAC/GAC meetings. Mr. Houseal and Dr. Trujillo expressed their hope that the NAC/GAC would be able to hold one face-to-face meeting in 2014. Ms. Broadhurst pointed out that a face-to-face meeting will enhance participation.

Dr. Trujillo thanked ODACMO staff for advocating for the face-to-face meeting. She anticipated that the NAC/GAC would be able to provide the CEC with advice that would enhance its work. She extended her wishes to the participants for a peaceful holiday season.

Ms. Jones-Jackson, whose arrival at the meeting had been delayed, expressed a belated welcome and season's greetings to the members of the Committees. She was very appreciative of the work being done by the NAC and GAC, as well as the dedication and commitment of the members of the Committees. Ms. Jones-Jackson announced to the members of the Committees her plans for retirement after 39 years of service at EPA. She stated that she had very much enjoyed working with the NAC/GAC members on many important issues, and will miss the work and collaboration. Ms. Jones-Jackson noted that she and Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons have been discussing ways in which to increase the visibility of the Committees, and she expressed her conviction that Ms. Benjamin-Sirmons will continue to work closely with the NAC/GAC. She expressed her gratitude to Ms. McCoy for her support of the Committees. On behalf of the NAC/GAC members, Mr. Houseal, Dr. Trujillo and the NAC/GAC members thanked Ms. Jones-Jackson individually, indicating that they will miss her leadership and expressing their best wishes for the future.

Mr. Carrillo reviewed the timeline for the advice letter. Normally, the advice letters would have been due 1 month after the meeting. For this meeting, OITA had indicated flexibility about the schedule; the deadline for the advice letters, therefore, was extended to January 31, 2014. Mr. Houseal asked the NAC/GAC members to send their responses to the charge questions to him, Dr. Trujillo, Ms. Goodmann or Dr. Santiago by January 18. Mr. Carrillo indicated that the JPAC report originally was expected on November 15, 2013, but had not yet been released. He urged the NAC/GAC members not to wait for the report to provide their responses. Ms. Goodmann and Dr. Santiago will compile the members' responses for the GAC and NAC advice letters, respectively. Dr. Santiago stated that she would distribute a draft for the NAC members' review by January 18.

## **Adjournment**

Dr. Trujillo thanked the members of the Committees and EPA staff for their efforts. Mr. Houseal and Dr. Trujillo adjourned the meeting at 3:45 p.m.

## **Action Items**

- ✧ Mr. Huber will provide the NAC/GAC members with a summary of the activities of the 20th Anniversary Task Force to date.
- ✧ The NAC/GAC members should send their questions about the CEC Operational Plan and NAPECA grants to Ms. Coronado via email.
- ✧ Mr. Carrillo will distribute a copy of Ms. Coronado's PowerPoint slides to the NAC/GAC members via email.
- ✧ Mr. Angus will arrange a teleconference call with Ms. Small, Dr. Trujillo and others who might be interested in brainstorming issues related to indigenous peoples for discussion at the upcoming JPAC meeting.
- ✧ Dr. Santiago will develop and distribute a survey form via email for the NAC/GAC members to identify and rank the most significant future priorities for the CEC among those identified by the JPAC.

- ✧ Mr. Carrillo will determine whether the CEC is developing any communications kits that might be used by the NAC/GAC members to publicize CEC activities.
- ✧ The NAC/GAC members should send their responses to the charge questions to Mr. Houseal, Dr. Trujillo, Ms. Goodman or Dr. Santiago by January 18, 2014.
- ✧ Ms. Goodman and Dr. Santiago will compile the responses from the GAC and NAC, respectively, for the advice letters.
- ✧ Dr. Santiago will distribute a draft advice letter to the NAC/GAC members for review by January 18, 2014.
- ✧ The NAC and GAC members will finalize their advice letters by January 31, 2014.

## Summary Certification

*I, Octaviana V. Trujillo, Chair of the Governmental Advisory Committee, and I, Brian Houseal, Chair of the National Advisory Committee, certify that the meeting minutes for the date of December 17, 2013, are hereby detailed, contain a record of the persons present, and give an accurate description of matters discussed and conclusions reached and copies of all reports received, issued or approved by the advisory committees. My signature date complies with the 90-day due date after each meeting required by the GSA Final Rule.*



---

Octaviana V. Trujillo  
Chair, GAC

*March 17, 2014*

---

Date



---

Brian Houseal  
Chair, NAC

*March 17, 2014*

---

Date

## Appendix A: Meeting Participants

### NAC Members

#### **Brian L. Houseal, Chair**

#### **Timothy A. Bent**

Director  
Environmental Affairs  
Bridgestone America

#### **Jorge Chapa, Ph.D.**

Professor  
Institute of Government and Public Affairs  
University of Illinois at Urbana-  
Champaign

#### **Mary L. Klein**

President and Chief Executive Officer  
NatureServe

#### **Raymond Lozano**

Director  
Racial Justice and Cultural Collaboration  
New Detroit

#### **David L. Markell, J.D.**

Steven M. Goldstein Professor  
College of Law  
Florida State University

#### **Cecilia R. Martinez, Ph.D.**

Director  
Center for Energy and Environmental  
Policy

#### **Michael J. Robinson**

Vice President  
Sustainability and Global Regulatory  
Affairs  
General Motors Company

#### **Anna Romero-Lizana**

Director  
International Business Development  
World Trade Center

#### **Ivonne Santiago, Ph.D.**

Professor  
College of Engineering  
University of Texas at El Paso

#### **Gail Small, J.D.**

Executive Director  
Native Action

### GAC Members

#### **Octaviana V. Trujillo, Ph.D.**

Tribal Council Member  
Pascua Yaqui Tribe

#### **John M. Bernal**

Deputy County Administrator  
Pima County Public Works Administration

#### **Ginny Broadhurst**

Executive Director  
Northwest Straits Commission

#### **Salud Carbajal**

First District Supervisor  
County of Santa Barbara

#### **Therese H. Goodman**

Assistant City Manager  
City Manager's Office  
City of Dubuque

#### **Alejandro M. Rodarte**

Assistant Secretary for Border Affairs  
California Environmental Protection  
Agency

#### **Carlos Rubinstein**

Commissioner  
Texas Water Development Board

#### **Cristina Viesca-Santos, J.D.**

Assistant County Attorney  
El Paso County Attorney's Office  
Environmental Crimes Unit



**Roger Vintze**  
Manager  
Enforcement and Emergency Response  
Program  
California Department of Toxic Substances  
Control

**Designated Federal Officer**

**Oscar Carrillo**  
Office of Diversity, Advisory Committee  
Management and Outreach  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**EPA Participants**

**Denise Benjamin-Sirmons**  
Director  
Office of Diversity, Advisory Committee  
Management and Outreach  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**JoAnn Chase**  
Director  
American Indian Environmental Office  
Office of International and Tribal Affairs  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Sylvia Correa**  
Senior Advisor  
North American Program  
Office of International and Tribal Affairs  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Patrick Huber**  
Office of International and Tribal Affairs  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Cynthia Jones-Jackson**  
Associate Director  
Office of Diversity, Advisory Committee  
Management and Outreach  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Mark Joyce**  
Associate Director  
Office of Diversity, Advisory Committee  
Management and Outreach  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Stephanie McCoy**  
Office of Diversity, Advisory Committee  
Management and Outreach  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Jane Nishida**  
Acting Assistant Administrator  
Office of International and Tribal Affairs  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Pam Teel**  
Office of Regional and Bilateral Affairs  
Office of International and Tribal Affairs  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Other**

**David Angus**  
Chair  
Joint Public Advisory Committee of the  
Commission for Environmental  
Cooperation  
Winnipeg Chamber of Commerce

**Irasema Coronado**  
Executive Director  
Secretariat  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation

**Lisa Valencia Sherratt**  
County of Santa Barbara

**Contractor Staff**

**Jennifer G. Lee, Ph.D.**  
The Scientific Consulting Group, Inc.

## Appendix B: Meeting Agenda



### Official Meeting of the National and Governmental Advisory Committees to the U.S. Representative to the Commission for Environmental Cooperation

#### TELECONFERENCE AGENDA

Tuesday, December 17, 2013

12:30 p.m. – 4:30 p.m. (Eastern Standard Time)

Call-In Number: 1-866-299-3188; Code: 202-233-0072

Video Connection Link: <https://epa.connectsolutions.com/nac-gac-mtg/>

EPA East Building, Room 1132

1201 Constitution Avenue NW

Washington, D.C. 20460

- 
- |            |   |
|------------|---|
| 12:30 p.m. | <b>Call to Order and Introductions</b><br>Oscar Carrillo, Designated Federal Officer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)  |
| 12:35 p.m. | <b>Opening Remarks</b><br>Cynthia Jones-Jackson, Associate Director, Office of Diversity, Advisory Committee Management and Outreach (ODACMO)<br>Denise Benjamin-Sirmons, Director, ODACMO  |
| 12:40 p.m. | <b>Welcome and Overview of Agenda</b><br>Octaviana Trujillo, Chair of the Governmental Advisory Committee (GAC)<br>Brian Houseal, Chair of the National Advisory Committee (NAC)  |
| 12:50 p.m. | <b>Update on U.S. Priorities and Guidance: 20th Anniversary</b><br>Jane Nishida, Acting Assistant Administrator, Office of International and Tribal Affairs (OITA)<br>JoAnn Chase, Director, American Indian Environmental Office, OITA |
| 1:10 p.m.  | Question & Answer Period  |

- 1:25 p.m.      **CEC Operational Plan Overview and NAPECA Grants Update**  
Irasema Coronado, Executive Director, CEC Secretariat
- 1:35 p.m.      Question & Answer Period
- 1:45 p.m.      **JPAC Report-Out**  
Dave Angus, Chair, Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC)
- 1:55 p.m.      Question & Answer Period
- 2:10 p.m.      **Public Comments Period**
- 2:25 p.m.      **Discussion on the NAAEC's 20th Anniversary**  
Octaviana Trujillo, Chair of the GAC  
Brian Houseal, Chair of the NAC
- 3:45 p.m.      **Next Steps**
- 4:30 p.m.      **Adjournment**

## Appendix C: Charge Questions for December 2013 NAC/GAC Meeting

### CHARGE QUESTIONS: NAC/GAC MEETING

*~ December 17, 2013~*

WASHINGTON, D.C.

*11/7/2013*

Dear NAC & GAC Members,

During the 2013 annual CEC Council Session in Mexico, the Ministers announced preparations for celebrating the 20th Anniversary of the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation.

The EPA Administrator would like advice from the NAC and GAC on the following topics:

- 1) 20th Anniversary of the NAAEC/NAFTA and CEC:** Provide advice regarding the implementation of the NAAEC, particularly areas where the NAAEC has contributed to higher levels of environmental protection in North America. Moving forward, identify areas where the implementation of NAAEC can be improved and areas where the CEC could advance greater integration of trade and the environment.
- 2) Communication for the 20th Anniversary:** Provide advice on communication strategies and public events to highlight the 20th Anniversary of the NAAEC/NAFTA and the CEC's accomplishments over the past two decades. For 2014, provide a list of local events where the NAC/GAC members can engage their stakeholders in highlighting the work of the CEC and the 20th Anniversary celebration.