

**Policy Assessment  
for the Review of the Ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards**

[EPA-452/R-14-006]  
August 2014

**Errata** (July 22, 2015)

1. Page *iv* – The list of appendices should be augmented as follows:  
Appendix 6A. Calculation of Approximate Equivalent 12-hr SUM06 and 12-hr W126 .. 6A-1
2. Page *iv* and 5B-1 Appendix 5B, Title – The title of this appendix should be corrected as follows, “CLASS I AREAS IN COUNTIES MEETING CURRENT STANDARD AND AT OR ABOVE 15 PPM-HRS.”
3. Page 5-27, line 9; page 5-28, line 2; page 5-79, line 18; 5-80, line 14 – The phrase “Class I areas” (which is in reference to information in Table 5-2) should be revised to “counties with Class I areas”
4. Page 5-28 and page *x*, Table 5-2 – The title of this table should be corrected as follows, for accuracy and consistency with Appendix 5B, “O<sub>3</sub> concentrations in Class I area containing counties that met the current standard and where three-year average W126 index value was at or above 15 ppm-hrs (1998-2012).”
5. Page 5-64, 2<sup>nd</sup> sentence – The ending phrase of this sentence should be corrected to the following “where the slope of the cumulative proportion line changes for FHM biosites.”
6. Page 5-79, line 19 – The phrase “county” should be inserted prior to “monitor sites” (which is in reference to information in Table 5-2).
7. Appendix 5B, Table 5B-1 – The title of this table should be corrected as follows, “Examples of Counties where Recent 3-Year O<sub>3</sub> concentrations were at or Below 75 ppb and 3-year Average W126 Index Values were at or Above 15 ppm-hrs.”
8. Appendix 6A. – This appendix, which is a duplicate of the corresponding appendix in the second draft of this document was inadvertently omitted from the final document. It is provided on the following page.

## APPENDIX 6A

### Calculation of Approximate Equivalent 12-hr SUM06 and 12-hr W126

**SOURCE:** 2007 Staff Paper, Appendix 7B (U.S. EPA, 2007).

Despite various metrics reported in the vegetation effects literature, there is no standard method for calculating equivalent levels between metrics. The maximum 3-month 12-hr SUM06 of 25 ppm-hr secondary standard that was proposed in the last review (62 FR 38877) was based on a yield loss prevention of approximately 10% in 50% of crop cases studied in the National Crop Loss Analysis Network (NCLAN) experiments. For consistency, staff judged it appropriate to use the NCLAN experiments to derive equivalents between the 12-hr SUM06 and W126. For example, below are the 12-hr SUM06 and W126 NCLAN equations to protect 50% of crop cases from a specified percent yield loss (Lee and Hogsett 1996):

Metric	Weibull Equation
12-hr SUM06	Predicted Relative Yield Loss = $1 - \exp(-[\text{SUM06}/87.42]^{1.82})$
12-hr W126	Predicted Relative Yield Loss = $1 - \exp(-[\text{W126}/96.05]^{1.48})$

In the first equation, solving for a SUM06 of 25 ppm-hr equals a predicted relative yield loss of 10%. Solving the second equation for a 10% yield loss equals a W126 of 21 ppm-hr. Thus, staff considers a 12-hr SUM06 of 25 ppm-hr and a 12-hr W126 of 21 ppm-hr approximately equivalent.

### References

- Lee, E. H.; Hogsett, W. E. (1996) Methodology for calculating inputs for ozone secondary standard benefits analysis: part II. Report prepared for Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Air Quality Strategies and Standards Division, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Research Triangle Park, N.C., March.
- U.S. EPA (U.S. Environmental Protection Agency). (2007). Review of the national ambient air quality standards for ozone: Policy assessment of scientific and technical information: OAQPS staff paper [EPA Report]. (EPA/452/R-07/003). Research Triangle Park, NC.  
[http://www.epa.gov/ttn/naaqs/standards/ozone/data/2007\\_01\\_ozone\\_staff\\_paper](http://www.epa.gov/ttn/naaqs/standards/ozone/data/2007_01_ozone_staff_paper)