



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION IX

75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105-3901

MAR 11 2013

James N. Goldstene, Executive Officer
California Air Resources Board
1001 I Street, P.O. Box 2815
Sacramento, California 95812

Re: Adequacy Finding for San Diego County Ozone Motor Vehicle Emissions Budgets

Dear Mr. Goldstene:

We have found adequate for transportation conformity purposes the motor vehicle emissions budgets (MVEBs) in the *Redesignation Request and Maintenance Plan for the 1997 National Ozone Standard for San Diego County (December 2012)* ("San Diego Plan") for the 1997 8-hour ozone national ambient air quality standard (NAAQS). As a result of our adequacy finding, the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG) and the U.S. Department of Transportation must use these budgets in future conformity analyses.

The San Diego Plan was adopted by the governing board of the San Diego County Air Pollution Control District (SDCAPCD) on December 5, 2012. The California Air Resources Board (CARB) formally adopted the San Diego Plan on December 6, 2012, and they submitted it to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency on December 28, 2012.

The San Diego Plan identifies MVEBs for the San Diego County area for volatile organic compounds (VOCs) and oxides of nitrogen (NO_x) for 2020 and 2025. We announced receipt of the San Diego Plan on the Internet on December 20, 2012, and requested public comment by January 22, 2013. We did not receive any comments on the budgets and San Diego Plan during the comment period. We will be acting on the San Diego in a subsequent Federal Register notice.

This letter transmits our decision that the MVEBs in the San Diego Plan for the San Diego County area are adequate for transportation conformity decisions. The adequate budgets are listed in the following table.

Motor Vehicle Emissions Budgets for Ozone San Diego County Nonattainment Area		
Budget Year	VOC tons per average summer day	NO _x tons per average summer day
2020	23	38
2025	21	30

In reaching this decision, we have reviewed the San Diego Plan, including responses to public comments on the plan, and have determined that the related MVEBs, when considered with all other emissions sources in San Diego County, are consistent with applicable requirements for maintenance of the 1997 8-hour ozone NAAQS through the year 2025. The budgets also meet the other adequacy criteria found in 40 CFR 93.118(e)(4).

We have enclosed a table that summarizes our adequacy determination. We will soon post this information on the Internet at: <http://www.epa.gov/otaq/stateresources/transconf/adequacy.htm>. We will also announce this adequacy determination in the Federal Register. This determination will become effective 15 days after the Federal Register announcement pursuant to 40 CFR 93.118(f). If you have any questions regarding this decision, please contact Amy Zimpfer at (415) 947-4146 or John Ungvarsky at (415) 972-3963.

Sincerely,



Deborah Jordan
Director, Air Division

Enclosure

cc: Lynn Terry, Deputy Executive Officer, CARB
Robert Kard, Air Pollution Control Officer, SDCAPCD
Gary L. Gallegos, Executive Director, SANDAG
Joseph Vaughn, Federal Highway Administration
Ted Matley, Federal Transit Administration
Mike Brady, CA Department of Transportation

Enclosure

Transportation Conformity Adequacy Review

Control Strategy State Implementation Plan (SIP) Under Review: <i>Redesignation Request and Maintenance Plan for the 1997 National Ozone Standard for San Diego County (December 2012)</i>		Date of SIP Revision Receipt by EPA: 1/4/13
Reviewers: John Ungvarsky	Date: 3/6/13	
Transportation Review Criteria		Reference in SIP Document/Comments
Sec. 93.118(e)(4)(i)	The plan was endorsed by the Governor (or designee) and was subject to a public hearing.	The December 28, 2012 transmittal letter submitting the <i>Redesignation Request and Maintenance Plan for the 1997 National Ozone Standard for San Diego County (December 2012)</i> ("San Diego plan" or "plan") was sent by the CARB's Executive Officer, James Goldstene, the Governor's designee. On November 2, 2012, the SDCAPCD published in the <i>San Diego Commerce</i> , a newspaper of general circulation within the San Diego area, an announcement that a public hearing would be held on December 5, 2012 to consider and approve the San Diego 8-hour maintenance plan. Copies of the plan were made available for viewing at the SDCAPCD's offices and on their web site. ¹ On December 5, 2012, the Air Pollution Control Board of San Diego County adopted the San Diego 8-hour maintenance plan at the publicly noticed public hearing. Following adoption, SDCAPCD forwarded the plan to CARB, the Governor of California's designee for SIP matters, and CARB then submitted the plan on December 28, 2012 as a revision to the California SIP to EPA for approval.

¹ The redesignation request and maintenance plan, titled "Redesignation Request and Maintenance Plan for the 1997 National Ozone Standard for San Diego County," may be found at the following SDCAPCD web address: http://www.sdapcd.org/planning/8_Hour_O3_Maint-Plan.pdf

Sec. 93.118(e)(4)(ii)	The plan was developed through consultation with federal, state and local agencies; full implementation plan documentation was provided and EPA's stated concerns, if any, were addressed.	Y	<p>The plan uses information provided by the SANDAG, SDCAPCD, and CARB. Staff consulted with SANDAG during plan preparations because SANDAG provides vehicle activity data needed for the MVEBs in the plan development, and the plan sets MVEBs that SANDAG will have to meet when approving future transportation plans.</p> <p>The SDCAPCD conducted interagency consultation on the proposed MVEBs with the San Diego Region Conformity Working Group at its September 5, 2012, meeting pursuant to CFR, Title 40, Part 93. The San Diego Region Conformity Working Group provides federal interagency coordination for the transportation/air quality conformity process. The CWG is comprised of staff representatives from SANDAG, SDCAPCD, Caltrans, the CARB, the U.S. Department of Transportation, and the USEPA.</p> <p>A workshop on San Diego plan was held on September 28, 2012. A workshop notice was distributed to all e-mail subscribers, local Economic Development Corporations and Chambers of Commerce, the USEPA, CARB, and other interested parties.</p>
Sec. 93.118(e)(4)(iii)	The motor vehicle emission budget(s) is clearly identified and precisely quantified.	Y	Section 5.3 of the San Diego plan, <i>Transportation Conformity Budgets</i> , clearly identifies the MVEBs and the information used, including references, to develop the MVEBs.
Sec. 93.118(e)(4)(iv)	The motor vehicle emissions budget(s), when considered together with all other emission sources, is consistent with applicable requirements for reasonable further progress, attainment, or maintenance (whichever is relevant to the given plan).	Y	EPA has determined that the MVEBs, when considered together with all other emission sources, are consistent with applicable requirements for maintenance of the 1997 ozone standard. The MVEBs are consistent with inventory estimates used to demonstrate continued maintenance. The MVEBs include a small safety margin by rounding up to the next whole number and adding 2 tons per day.

<p>Sec. 93.118(e)(4)(v)</p>	<p>The plan shows a clear relationship among the emissions budget(s), control measures and the total emissions inventory.</p>	<p>Y</p>	<p>Emissions inventory estimates are documented in Section 4.0 – <i>Attainment Due to Permanent, Enforceable Emissions Reductions</i>, 5.1 – <i>Attainment Inventory</i>, and Appendix A – <i>Projected Emissions Inventories</i> of the plan, and the control measures are documented in 5.2 – <i>Maintenance Demonstration</i> and Appendix B – <i>District, State, and Federal Emission Control Programs</i> of the plan. The documentation in these portions of the plan clearly shows the relationship among the inventories, control measures, and MVEBs. The MVEBs are consistent with the control measures, inventory estimates, and downward trend in emissions used to demonstrate continued maintenance.</p>
<p>Sec. 93.118(e)(4)(vi)</p>	<p>Revisions to previously submitted control strategy or maintenance plans explain and document any changes to any previous submitted budgets and control measures; impacts on point and area source emissions; any changes to established safety margins (see §93.101 for definition), and reasons for the changes (including the basis for any changes to emission factors or estimates of VMT.</p>	<p>Y</p>	<p>San Diego's 2007 8-hour attainment plan included MVEBs of 53 and 98 tpd for VOC and NO_x, respectively, for 2008. EPA found the MVEBs in the 2007 8-hour attainment plan adequate for the purposes of transportation conformity. See 73 FR 30098 (May 23, 2008). Emission reductions from federal, State, and local measures are reflected in the significantly lower MVEBs for 2020 and 2025 in the San Diego plan. Emissions inventory estimates in Section 4.0 – <i>Attainment Due to Permanent, Enforceable Emissions Reductions</i>, 5.1 – <i>Attainment Inventory</i>, and Appendix A – <i>Projected Emissions Inventories</i>, and the control measures in 5.2 – <i>Maintenance Demonstration</i> and Appendix B – <i>District, State, and Federal Emission Control Programs</i> document the resulting emission reductions from the attainment strategies developed for the San Diego area.</p>
<p>Sec. 93.118(e)(5)</p>	<p>EPA has reviewed the State's compilation of public comments and response to comments that are required to be submitted with any implementation plan.</p>	<p>Y</p>	<p>We have reviewed the comments and responses from SDCAPCD's September 28, 2012 workshop. The comments and responses from the September 28, 2012 workshop are summarized in the Workshop Report included as attachment C of SDCAPCD's submittal package in the State's SIP submittal. SDCAPCD did not receive any comments or opposition at their December 5, 2012 public hearing. No comments were received or opposition expressed at CARB's December 6, 2012 public hearing.</p>

