



# OFFICIAL MEETING OF THE NATIONAL AND GOVERNMENTAL ADVISORY COMMITTEES (NAC/GAC)

SUMMARY

# FINAL

# April 26–27, 2018

William Jefferson Clinton North EPA Conference Room 6045 1200 Constitution Avenue, NW Washington, D.C. 20004 and Via Adobe<sup>®</sup> Connect Teleconference

Note: The U.S. National and Governmental Advisory Committees are federal advisory committees chartered by Congress, operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act; 5 U.S.C., App. 2. The committees provide advice to the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) on the implementation of the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation. The findings and/or recommendations of the committees do not represent the views of the Agency, and this document does not represent information approved or disseminated by EPA.

# **Table of Contents**

Thursday, April 26, 2018
Call to Order and Introductions
Welcome
Overview of the Agenda
Update on U.S. Priorities and Guidance and Tribal Update3
Federal Government Initiatives on Marine Litter6
Public Comment Period
CEC Update on Operational Plan (OP) and NAPECA Grants8
Update on SEM and Status of Submissions9
JPAC Report10
United Nations (UN) Update on Marine Litter Initiatives
Private Sector Initiatives on Marine Litter11
Local Government Initiatives on Marine Litter
Plastic Alternatives: Developing the Innovative Ecosystem13
Summary and Next Steps13
Friday, April 27, 2018
Call to Order14
Plenary: Joint Committee Meeting
Public Comment Period15
GAC Separate Meeting15
NAC Separate Meeting16
Committees Reconvene in Plenary Session
Adjournment17
Action Items
Summary Certification
Appendix A: Meeting Participants
Appendix B: Meeting Agenda22
Appendix C: Charge Letter for April 26–27, 2018 NAC/GAC Meeting

# Thursday, April 26, 2018

#### **Call to Order and Introductions**

Oscar Carrillo, National and Governmental Advisory Committees (NAC/GAC) Designated Federal Officer (DFO), Federal Advisory Committee Management Division (FACMD), U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA or the Agency)

Mr. Oscar Carrillo, NAC/GAC DFO, FACMD, EPA, called the meeting to order and welcomed participants to the 50th meeting of the NAC and GAC committees. He thanked NAC/GAC Chairs for assisting in planning the meeting and Ms. Jane Nishida, Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of International and Tribal Affairs (OITA), and OITA staff for their input on the agenda. Mr. Carrillo expressed appreciation to Ms. Monisha Harris, Director, FACMD, for making the in-person meetings possible and to the FACMD staff for their continued support. He noted the exciting agenda topic and then introduced Ms. Harris to update the committees on FACMD activities.

#### Welcome

Monisha Harris, Director, FACMD

Ms. Harris welcomed the NAC/GAC and other attendees. The Office of Administration and Resource Management (OARM) and FACMD support all of the Agency's federal advisory committees, including the NAC and the GAC, which provide advice and recommendations to the EPA Administrator, Congress and the President on environmental issues. In engaging with the Agency's partners and stakeholders, the NAC and the GAC play an important role in helping EPA to achieve its mission to protect human health and the environment. She welcomed Ms. Nishida, Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC) Council U.S. Alternative Representative (Alt Rep), who briefed the committees later in the meeting. Ms. Harris expressed appreciation to the committees for the hours of dedication and work that they perform in advising the CEC and EPA Administrator. She then invited Dr. Theresa Pardo (University of Albany, State University of New York), Chair of the NAC, and Mr. Jeffrey Wennberg (City of Rutland, Vermont), Chair of the GAC, to provide an overview of the agenda.

## **Overview of the Agenda**

*Jeffrey Wennberg, Chair of the GAC Theresa Pardo, Ph.D., Chair of the NAC* 

Mr. Wennberg thanked the members for attending and lending their insight, expertise and guidance on advice of the greatest use that has been given to the Agency. He explained that the committees are charged to address issues related to policy and/or assist with brainstorming ideas on a variety of topics. The charge for today's meeting is focused on a singular topic—marine litter—which is somewhat of an exception. The committees are asked to provide advice on marine litter activities in the public-private sector or elsewhere that, if brought to EPA's attention, could be evaluated as models to emulate.

Dr. Pardo welcomed the committee members and thanked FACMD and OITA staff for their efforts. She remarked on the privilege of planning and structuring these meetings to spark enthusiasm and ideas that would culminate into advice for EPA. Dr. Pardo asked the meeting participants to introduce themselves.

#### Update on U.S. Priorities and Guidance and Tribal Update

Jane Nishida, Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator, OITA

Ms. Nishida welcomed colleagues from Mexico and the CEC, as well as all attendees, to the meeting. She thanked the FACMD staff for facilitating and organizing the meeting, NAC/GAC Chairs for their leadership, and OITA staff and committee members for their participation. Ms. Nishida provided an

update on EPA/CEC activities, the April 25, 2018, CEC Alt Reps meeting, planning for the June 26–27, 2018 CEC Council Session and the advice letter charge. On February 12, 2018, EPA released its fiscal year (FY) 2018–2022 Strategic Plan, which outlines overarching priorities to (1) refocus the core mission, (2) advance cooperative federalism and (3) advance the rule of law and process. Participants were referred to the full document, which can be accessed from the Agency's website, for further details. Two priorities that align with the EPA Strategic Plan—Superfund sites and lead (Pb) contamination—were highlighted. Efforts focus on accelerating the pace of cleanups and promoting reuse of contaminated Superfund sites, which affects state, local and tribal governments. EPA initially identified 21 Superfund sites targeted for immediate and intense action and recently updated the list to include sites relevant to tribes. Monitoring and regulating exposure to Pb always has been a priority for EPA and has become especially important since the event in Flint, Michigan, regarding exposure to Pb in drinking water. To address Pb contamination broadly (i.e., in water, paint and soil), EPA Administrator Mr. Scott Pruitt and U.S. Department of Health & Human Services (HHS) Administrator Mr. Alex Azar are co-chairing the Senior Staff Steering Committee of the President's Task Force on Environmental Health Risks and Safety Risks to Children (established in 1997) to implement the 2016–2018 Federal Lead Strategy. Ms. Nishida emphasized that EPA priorities leverage ongoing and new initiatives in state, local and tribal governments.

On April 25, 2018, the CEC Alt Reps, Secretariat, and Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC) members met in Washington, D.C., to discuss the June 26–27, 2018 Council Session being held in Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The theme of the 2018 Council Session is "Innovation and Partnerships for Green Growth" and OITA staff—Mark Kasman, Director, Office of Regional and Bilateral Affairs, and Luis Troche, Senior Advisor, North American Program—and North American counterparts are working to develop the agenda. The program will (1) showcase research innovation, technology and partnerships that align with EPA priorities and CEC projects, (2) engage youth and (3) engage the private sector. Parallel to the 2018 Council Session, the National Weather Center (NWC), located on the campus of the University of Oklahoma, will host the environmental ministers from the three countries and delegations to observe a demonstration of the research, technology and atmospheric monitoring capabilities that support green growth and climate resilience. The goal is to identify or further investigate projects or initiatives that align with EPA priorities and CEC projects, such as how climate variability and change affects pollination, agriculture, and food and marine transport.

Also, the CEC is partnering with two University of Oklahoma centers—the Tom Love Innovation Hub and the Ronnie K. Irani Center for the Creation of Economic Wealth—to sponsor the second CEC Youth Innovation Challenge (YIC) on green growth. The YIC winners will be announced at the 2018 Council Session and present their proposals to the environmental ministers, and the centers will work with YIC winners to further develop their projects, research proposals and product marketing for commercialization. Ms. Nishida thanked the NAC and the GAC for their successful advice on engaging youth and the private sector in the CEC. In addition, the program will feature a roundtable discussion on engaging the private sector by highlighting the University of Oklahoma's NWC public-private partnerships with the United States and Canada and efforts to partner with Mexico. The 2018 Council Public Session will convene a roundtable discussion consisting of the three environmental ministers and representatives from state and local governments, academia, and public and private sectors to discuss ways to promote and advance innovation and partnerships. The 2018 Council Session provisional agenda is soon to be published; Cesar Rafael Chavez, Executive Director, CEC Secretariat, provided further updates later in the meeting.

Members were informed that EPA established an Expert Advisory Committee consisting of private sector and academic representatives from each of the three North American countries—Canada, Mexico and the United States—to assist the CEC General Standing Committee in evaluating YIC proposals. The Committee will report to the Parties (i.e., the government of Canada, the government of the United Mexican States and the government of the United States of America) a list of recommended nominees to review, which will be forwarded to the Alt Reps for final considerations. EPA hopes that the Expert Advisory Committee engages youth local to their regions and potentially fosters mentoring relationships.

Ms. Nishida provided an update on tribal affairs on behalf of the American Indian Environmental Office (AIEO), who were attending the National Tribal Caucus (NTC) meeting held simultaneous to this meeting in Phoenix, Arizona. The NTC, the tribal advisory committee to EPA, is composed of tribal representatives from the 10 EPA Regions. The NTC and AIEO are meeting to discuss three topics: the Indian General Assistance Program, the Tribal Consultation Policy and tribal authorizations. Ongoing efforts by the CEC to engage tribes were highlighted. Ms. Nishida reported that six of the nine FY 2018 CEC-funded North American Partnership for Environmental Community Action (NAPECA) grants focus on advancing the sustainability of traditional ecological knowledge (TEK) in indigenous communities in the three North American countries. The CEC also advances TEK via the Local Environmental Observer (LEO) Network established under the Alaska Native Tribal Health Consortium. To date, the LEO Network has expanded the program beyond Alaska and the Arctic region to establish LEO centers in Bahia, California; Mexico City, Mexico; British Columbia, Canada; and the Northwest Territories, Canada. It also has more than 2,000 new observers, made more than 13,000 new observations in 2017 and is developing new projects in Sami indigenous communities in Scandinavian countries. In addition, EPA Region 10 has developed a guidance document for assisting tribes in incorporating TEK into their local projects. EPA's efforts to address tribal issues outside of the United States involve the Canada-U.S. Saint John River shared watershed project and the transboundary mining issues in British Columbia, Canada, which are of concern to tribes in Montana and Alaska.

Ms. Nishida called attention to two announcements prioritizing marine litter—the United Nations (UN) Environment Assembly resolution by Member States on preventing marine litter and plastics and the Group of Seven (G7) countries' commitment to take deliberate action to address marine litter and debris—and the CEC project titled "Building Community Solutions for Marine Litter," which have formed the backdrop for today's main topic. The NAC/GAC have been charged with providing advice on how the CEC could enhance its efforts to broadly address marine litter in the three countries.

#### Question and Answer Period

Mr. Wennberg sought clarity on the committees' advice regarding marine litter, which also is a global priority, as indicated by the UN and G7. Ms. Nishida clarified that the primary role of the NAC and GAC is to provide advice to EPA, which also can be informative internationally.

In response to a query on the status of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) negotiations, Ms. Nishida replied that discussions are ongoing and outstanding issues remain in general. Negotiations are focused on the environmental chapter and cooperative mechanisms; the latest round of talks occurred earlier in April 2018. The Office of the U.S. Trade Representative, which represents the United States in the negotiations, has made an effort to fast-track the U.S.-Mexico negotiations to a conclusion prior to the Mexican presidential election on July 1, 2018.

Dr. Vincent R. Nathan (City of San Antonio, Texas), GAC member, noted that the United States has no standards for the limits of Pb in soil, so the European standard for Pb in produce often is used. Establishing such a standard for the United States would need to consider the regulations at the state level.

Dr. Aminata Kilungo (The University of Arizona), NAC member, asked about the Superfund site standards. Ms. Nishida explained that Superfund site cleanup is a priority for the Agency and that EPA experts in the Waste Office could best verify the accuracy of those standards.

Dr. Ann Marie Chischilly (Northern Arizona University), GAC member, noted the Region 10 TEK guidelines and her work on the climate change committee to develop guidelines that were accepted by the U.S. Department of the Interior. She wondered whether a similar guidance was being developed in EPA. Ms. Nishida noted that the Office of Land and Emergency Management has developed standards, as has Region 10. The Tribal Science Council has looked at the use of TEK and confidentiality issues.

Mr. Kelly C. Wright (Fort Hall Indian Reservation), GAC member, is an expert in Superfund cleanup and serves on the Tribal Science Council, NTC and Regional Tribal Caucus. He complimented EPA on its efforts regarding the Colorado River Gold King Mine event and its handling of the Flint, Michigan, crisis. Mr. Wright suggested that any enforcement of standards by delegations to states should consider that each tribe is different, the incorporation of TEK in geographical locations varies, and frequent followup is necessary. Ms. Nishida explained that the Superfund site cleanup is a priority for EPA; standards exist, but these could be revisited. Dr. Nathan added that the Colorado River U.S.-Mexico treaty was established based on the Law of the River, which was a TEK concept.

Ms. Marina Brock (Massachusetts Department of Health and Environment), GAC member, asked about the partners in the Federal Strategy on Lead. Ms. Nishida will ensure that a list of the member agencies on the coordinated Federal Strategy on Lead is forwarded to the committees.

Mr. Wennberg commented on some of the excellent examples of cooperative federalism in EPA regarding state and local governments, but noted that others could be improved. Ms. Sally Ann Gonzales (Arizona House of Representatives), GAC member, commented on her work in the Arizona government and noted that a list of the exemplary programs on cooperative federalism would be helpful. Ms. Nishida called attention to the newly established partnership between NTC and the Environmental Council of States and the efforts to identify good examples of cooperative federalism that could be shared with the NAC and the GAC in the future.

Ms. Sara Hopper (DowDuPont), NAC member, elaborated on her experience with other agencies (e.g., the U.S. Department of Agriculture) on federal policies that provide state and local governments the flexibility to tailor their own environmental programs, but such a decentralized approach can be challenging to regulate on the national level. This issue also could affect the establishment of partnerships in the three countries.

Ms. Nishida appreciates the comments and feedback on the Agency's Strategic Plan and will ensure that the committees' questions are answered by the appropriate EPA office in a timely manner.

#### **Federal Government Initiatives on Marine Litter**

Robert S. Benson, Acting Chief, Partner Programs Branch, Office of Water (OW)

Robert S. Benson, Acting Chief, Partner Programs Branch, OW, reported on the domestic activities of EPA's Trash-Free Waters (TFW) Program, an analytical, strategic and decentralized program supported Agency-wide that addresses a quintessential non-point-source problem and that has an internal listserv of 200 members. Mr. Benson noted that the issue of trash in waters was traditionally referred to as marine debris, a term that the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) maintains today per its authorizing statues. Marine debris—large pieces of material resulting from national disasters, shipwrecks, or fishing gear—that end up in the ocean differs from the smaller pieces of trash, which EPA refers to as marine litter or aquatic trash. He emphasized marine litter as a global problem and priority, a pollutant and water quality problem not a problem of aesthetics.

Mr. Benson discussed the impact of aquatic and plastic trash, the cost to the United States and the role of federal agencies in addressing marine litter. Approximately 80 percent of aquatic trash comes from land-

based sources, and plastics comprise 60 to 80 percent of marine litter and are ingested by marine lifeforms. The potential marine litter-related human health is being evaluated. More than 51 billion (B) pieces of litter end up on U.S. roads each year, costing more than \$11.5 B annually in cleanup and local governments spend millions of dollars each year on cleanup efforts. The Ocean Conservancy monitors and reports on the types of trash being collected worldwide. Among the top 10 items collected, single use items, including cigarette butts, plastic beverage bottles, bottle caps, and straws, were predominant.

Mr. Benson noted that 8 million tons of plastic enter the ocean annually, of which, microplastics are ubiquitous. If this trend continues, it is estimated that there will be 1 pound of trash in the ocean for 3 pounds of fish by 2020. The TFW Program focuses on addressing prevention and methods to improve human behaviors. He strongly emphasized that EPA and the TFW Program thinks that plastics do offer societal benefits for the purpose in which they were designed, but recognizes that plastics become an issue when they end up in the oceans and break down into microparticles. EPA is focused on preventing plastics from entering the waterways, encouraging the American Chemical Council (ACC) and others to consider non-toxic recyclable alternatives to plastic and conducting research to better understand the impact of microplastics on human health that could inform decision-making and policy. Mr. Benson reported on the international and U.S. calls for action and the federal agency roles to address marine litter, including the Interagency Marine Debris Coordinating Committee led by NOAA.

Mr. Benson elaborated on the four focus areas of the TFW Program (1) research, (2) international efforts, (3) public/private partnerships and (4) regional strategies. For research, TFW convened the Microplastics Experts Workshop held June 28–29, 2017, to set priorities and develop recommendations. A final report was published on December 4, 2017, and can be accessed from EPA's website. Other efforts include conducting technical webinars, sponsoring fish tissue studies and advising on citizen science sampling protocols. In addition, the Office of Research and Development at EPA has made microplastics research a priority and an official EPA microplastics research working group has been established. Internationally, TFW supports U.S. delegations at international marine trash conferences and engages in multi-national and bilateral work, including pilot projects in the Caribbean and South America.

Regarding public-private partnerships, EPA is working with the private sector and corporate sponsors to collaborate on source-reduction efforts and solutions to the marine plastics problem via technology innovation. Mr. Benson highlighted one example of an EPA- public-private partnership, the Trash-Free Trinity Program, that involves multiple stakeholder engagement and investments to address marine litter in the Texas Trinity River. Regional strategies, an area of greatest interest to the CEC, includes working with EPA Regions on strategic planning and developing tools and resources to support state/local programs. Mr. Benson called attention to two EPA publications— *Aquatic Trash Prevention National Great Practices Compendium* and the *Atlas of Gulf States*— and highlighted new national TFW projects.

#### Question and Answer Period

Mr. Donald K. Harris (Amerris Consulting, LLC), NAC member, noted that the Flint River Watershed Coalition (Flint, Michigan) focuses on the biological and chemical aspects of the water, has a robust youth component and would be an initiative with which to consider partnering. Mr. Benson commented on TFW's citizen science efforts that are engaging youth.

Mr. Donald Harrris wondered about the impact of cigarette butts on marine litter and suggested including tobacco manufactuers in EPA's TFW efforts. Mr. Benson commented that Ocean Conservancy and the Trash Free Seas Alliance (TFSA) have taken the lead on this issue and that Altria (formerly Phillip Morris) is a member of the TFSA. Mr. Harris also pointed out that major tourist attractions and resorts are temporarily closing their beaches for underwater cleanups, which could affect the local economy and jobs. Ms. Hopper had knowledge that many of the Carribbean islands and certain regions in the United

States do not have recycling programs. Members suggested that approaches to consider include engaging the Caribbean Hotel and Tourism Association, as well as cities in the United States, in plastic recycling (e.g., partnerships). Leveraging successful pilot studies and convening stakeholder meetings would be places to start.

Ms. Nazarat Sandoval (Michigan Department of Environmental Quality), GAC member, called attention to the Alliance for the Great Lakes and its Adopt-a-Beach Program as a successful group with programs to leverage.

Dr. Donna L. Lybecker (Idaho State University), NAC member, suggested striking a balance between responsibility and regulation by framing the message to the public on preventing/reducing marine litter in a way that speaks to the spiritual side of individuals rather than focusing solely on the cost.

Dr. Chischilly pointed out that the lack of codes for dumping trash and lack of proper enforcement of existing codes are issues in some tribal communities. Citizen-initiated efforts—such as the campaign to clean up beaches in Mumbai, India, run by UN Environment Champions of the Earth Inspiration and Action Award winner and Mumbai-based attorney Afroz Shaz—can be studied as models.

## **Public Comment Period**

No public comments were offered.

#### CEC Update on Operational Plan (OP) and NAPECA Grants

Cesar Rafael Chavez, Executive Director, CEC Secretariat

Mr. Chavez updated members on the 2017–2018 OP cooperative projects and ongoing initiatives and the FY 2018 NAPECA grants. He noted that the 2018 projects are being accelerated and are scheduled to be completed by the end of the calendar year. This adjustment reflects the budget and timeline considerations related to the CEC's transitioning to a new institutional approach.

Mr. Chavez detailed the progress to date of the 10 active 2017–2018 OP cooperative projects approved at the 2017 Council Session.

- 1. **Monitoring Health Impacts From Extreme Heat Events.** Collaboration agreements with health agencies in Arizona, Chihuahua and British Columbia are currently being drafted.
- 2. **Reducing Pollution From Maritime Transport.** The Emission Control Area designation proposal for Mexico has been finalized, and a meeting on best practices for reducing pollution from shipping and port operations was held March 20–22, 2018.
- 3. **Improving Black Carbon Emissions Inventory Data for Small-Scale Biomass Combustion.** Data collection surveys are being implemented for 21 U.S. states, and the scope and process for data collection activities is being planned for Canada and Mexico.
- 4. **Measuring Mitigation of Food Loss and Food Waste (FLW).** The FLW Protocol Steering Committee and the Group of Experts will hold an in-person meeting May 15–17, 2018, to discuss methodologies and best practices. The request for proposals for a youth engagement consultant has been published, and proposals are due by May 3, 2018.
- 5. **Increasing Industrial Energy Efficiency Through ISO 500001.** An International Organization for Standardization (ISO) 50001 energy management training tailored for supply chains was

designed and launched, and the U.S. Department of Energy's 50001 Ready Navigator Tool has been translated into French and Spanish for training.

- 6. **Supporting Sustainable Trade of CITES (Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species).** Priority action plans for implementation of CEC-developed trilateral action plans were identified. A CEC-Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES) website was launched, and a video was produced to disseminate trinational efforts to support sustainable trade in sharks, tarantulas, turtles/tortoises and timber species.
- 7. **Conserving Shorebirds Through Community Engagement.** Conservation monitoring and outreach activities are in progress at eight sites along the Pacific and Atlantic flyways. Site exchanges to share knowledge and best practices are planned for late April 2018. The 2018 Ecotourism Training Workshop will be held May 16–18, 2018, on the Georgia Barrier Islands, Saint Simons Island, Georgia.
- 8. Science for Monarch Butterfly and Pollinator Conservation. The Monarch Butterfly Research and Monitoring Workshop was held February 6–8, 2018, in Montreal, Quebec, Canada. Monitoring of nectar resources and monarch populations is ongoing in northeastern Mexico. Research on the natal origins of monarch butterflies at overwintering sites in Mexico is in progress.
- 9. Strengthening Adaptive Capacity of Marine Protected Areas. A scoping exercise for the Coastal Mitigation and Adaptation Toolkit was conducted in parallel to the January 23–24, 2018, Workshop on Resources for Coastal Mitigation and Adaptation in Marine Protected Areas held in La Paz, Baja, California.
- 10. **Building Community Solutions for Marine Litter.** Data on the sources, composition and areas of trash accumulation are being collected. Training and events with citizen scientists also are being conducted. A series of binational stakeholder meetings will take place between representatives from the United States and Canada on May 4, 2018, in Imperial Beach, California, and on May 7, 2018, in Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada.

Mr. Chavez reported on ongoing initiatives at the CEC. A new continental land coverage map at a 30-meter resolution for the North American Land Change Monitoring System was published. The North American Environmental Atlas continues to expand with updated map layers on blue carbon and protected areas. The North American Pollutant Releases and Transfers *Taking Stock Report* Volume 15 was published on April 24, 2018. The database for the North American Portal on Climate Pollutants is being updated with the most recent data submissions to the United Nations Framework Convention of Climate Change.

Mr. Chavez updated the committees on the CEC's community grants program and the NAPECA grants. The CEC funded nine NAPECA grants for FY 2018. Of the nine grants, six are focused on TEK; three support projects in Canada; three in Mexico; and three in the United States. He noted that projects were funded for 1-year and are scheduled to be completed in the calendar year.

#### Update on SEM and Status of Submissions

Robert Moyer, Director, Submissions on Enforcement Matters (SEM), Legal Senior Advisor, CEC Secretariat

Lisa Goldman, Office of General Counsel, EPA

Mr. Robert Moyer, Director, SEM, CEC Secretariat, reported on the active submissions, submissions terminated by Council votes and outreach activities. Four submissions are currently active and are being reviewed, including the *Mexico City Metrobus* and *Transboundary Agricultural Burning* submissions. The *Alberta Tailings Pond II* submission is being considered for a factual record by the CEC Secretariat. A draft of a factual record for the *Agricultural Waste Burning in Sonora* submission was submitted to the Council, and comments are due by May 8, 2018.

Mr. Moyer reported that seven submissions were dismissed by the Council, of the seven, two were dismissed unanimously due to a pending legal proceeding and one was dismissed on a 2:1 vote. Two submissions were dismissed without a written explanation being provided, which preceded the Executive Orders establishing policies for voting on factual records.

The CEC Secretariat is partnering with the Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC) on outreach activities for 2018. Funds may be available to support speakers; NAC and GAC members interested in participating are welcome to contact Mr. Moyer for further details.

# JPAC Report

Gustavo Alanis-Ortega, Chair, JPAC

Mr. Gustavo Alanis Ortega, Chair, JPAC, presented an update on JPAC activities. The November 2017 JPAC meeting was held in Chicago, Illinois, and convened a public forum on the theme titled "NAFTA's Environmental Side Agreement: Assessing the Past, Looking Towards the Future." The session brought together a select group of environmental experts to report on the role of the CEC in the context of the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation (NAAEC), to discuss the impact of the CEC, and to discuss future directions.

The JPAC submitted an advice letter to the Council on the November 2017 session that detailed the recommendations, which focused on the convening role of the CEC; leveraging resources; stakeholder engagement; knowledge generation and sharing and public mechanism related to environmental laws.

The JPAC is actively planning the public forum for the June 26–27, 2018 Council Session and the fall 2018 JPAC meeting, which will focus on outreach and visibility of the CEC.

## United Nations (UN) Update on Marine Litter Initiatives

Carla Fredrich, Program Officer, UN Environment, North America Office

Ms. Carla Friedrich, Program Officer, UN Environment, described the UN Environment Programme (UNEP), the UN Environment's marine litter efforts and noted the issue. Annually, 8 million tons of plastic end up in the oceans. Plastic constitutes 60 to 80 percent of all marine litter. Marine litter harms more than 600 marine species, costs approximately \$8 B in damage to the marine ecosystem and is potentially harmful to human health. The UNEP was established in 1972; is the leading global environment authority of the UN; is headquartered in Nairobi, Kenya, and has the mission to provide leadership and encourage partnership in caring for the environment across key programmatic areas. The UNEP has a global presence, including a regional office in Washington, D.C.

Ms. Friedrich explained that the UNEP and UN Environment are responsible for implementing the environment-related Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) indicators for the UN and the 17 SDGs for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. She noted that approximately half of the 17 SDGs are directly environmental in focus or address the sustainability of natural resources, poverty and health. The UN Environment Assembly, the world's highest level decision-making body on the environment, has

recognized marine litter and microplastics as a key priority in its 2014, 2016 and 2017 resolutions. The fourth UN Assembly will convene in March 2019 in Nairobi, Kenya.

Ms. Friedrich described the Global Partnership on Marine Litter, the relaunch of the Marine Litter Network and the Clean Seas global campaign. She called attention to the 2018 World Environment Day scheduled for June 5, 2018. India is the host country, and the theme is "Beat Plastic Pollution." New Orleans, Louisiana, will be the host city for the United States.

### Question and Answer Period

Dr. Nathan noted that efforts to remove marine litter deposited deep into the ocean bed also should be considered; he sought clarity on the scope of the UN marine litter initiatives. Mr. Friedrich clarified that the UN Environment marine litter initiatives are focusing upstream to prevent additional plastics from ending up in the oceans.

Mr. Donald Harris pointed out that Southeast Asia is the source of a large percentage of the marine litter from plastic waste, but fewer countries from Southeast Asia participate in the UN Environment marine litter initiatives than from regions that contribute less marine litter.

# **Private Sector Initiatives on Marine Litter**

Stewart Harris, Director, Marine and Environmental Stewardship, Plastics Division, American Chemistry Council (ACC)

Jennifer Ronk, Sustainability and Advocacy Manager, North America, Dow Packaging and Specialty Plastics, The Dow Chemical Company (Dow) (via Adobe<sup>®</sup> Connect)

Mr. Stewart Harris, Director, Marine and Environmental Stewardship, Plastics Division, ACC, presented ACC's perspective on marine debris. Representing U.S. plastics manufacturers, the ACC recognizes that the societal benefits of using plastics (e.g., energy and cost savings and reductions in food waste and greenhouse gas emissions) are lost if the product harms the natural environment. Southeast Asia contributes to approximately 60 percent of plastic marine debris, which is caused primarily by waste mismanagement. Many countries in this region continue to have inadequate infrastructure despite rapid economic development. He called attention to the *Declaration of the Global Plastics Associations for Solutions on Marine Litter* document, an outcome of the 2011 UN/NOAA International Marine Debris Conference, which was published in 2016.

Mr. Harris next detailed ACC's efforts to address the global declaration six-point strategy, the progress to date, domestic and international partnerships for litter prevention, marine debris projects, and recycling and recovery initiatives. As of 2017, the ACC had 75 members from 40 countries working on 355 projects. The ACC is engaged in several domestic partnerships that include the installation of waste bins in coastal California areas, the Rozalia project, SAVE THE BAY<sup>™</sup> and the Beachy Clean public campaign. The ACC supports governmental policy to enact marine litter initiatives, such as the Microbead-Free Waters Act of 2015 and the Save Our Seas Act. The ACC also is involved in international partnerships, including Net-Works<sup>™</sup> recycling programs in the Philippines and programs in partnership with the University of Toronto. The goal of the Trash Free Seas Alliance<sup>®</sup> is to improve countries' infrastructure (i.e., trash collection) to reduce marine debris. Through a \$150,000,000 fund—the Closed Loop Ocean program—developing countries are provided low-interest loans to improve their waste management infrastructure.

Mr. Harris outlined additional programs in the United States aimed at promoting recycling. The Materials Recovery for the Future program is a sortation and recycling project for flexible film. Through a memorandum of understanding between the ACC and EPA, the Wrap Recycling Action Program

(WRAP) focuses on the recycling of flexible plastic film. WRAP aims to double the rate of film recycling by 2020 to 2 billion pounds. Mr. Harris concluded his talk by mentioning the importance of stewarding plastic pellets used in the manufacturing industry to prevent unnecessary loss and called attention to the 25-year Operation Clean Sweep<sup>®</sup> initiative design to reduce pellet loss.

Ms. Jennifer Ronk, Sustainability and Advocacy Manager, North America, Dow Packaging and Specialty Plastics, The Dow Chemical Company, presented on plastic innovation and marine litter prevention from a plastic pellet producer's perspective. She reported on Dow's 2025 sustainability goals and the efforts to address those goals that include decreasing waste, increasing recycling and recovery, and eliminating marine litter.

Ms. Ronk detailed examples of ways Dow is putting into practice its initiatives to reduce and eliminate marine litter, such as the Produce Rescue Center and the Dow INTUNE<sup>™</sup> compatibilization technology to increase the recyclability of multi-material, multi-layered consumer products. This is accomplished by reducing the complexity or number of layers of materials. The EnergyBag<sup>™</sup> Program focuses on converting non-recycled plastic items into usable energy.

Ms. Ronk emphasized the importance of leadership and science-driven partnerships to implement these programs. Dow has partnered with Closed Loop Ocean to help solve infrastructure problems in Southeast Asia. She described five approaches (advocacy, research, development, stewardship, and education and outreach) that Dow is using to help solve the problem of marine litter.

#### Question and Answer Period

Mr. Donald Harris noted the common practice of oversized packaging relative to the internal contents and asked about recyclable products. Ms. Stephanie McCoy, FACMD, ORAM, EPA, wondered whether the plastic wrap used to package beverages was recyclable. Ms. Ronk explained that polyethylene products are currently the only type of plastics that are recycled. Recommendations to manufacturers to produce recyclable packaging products are ongoing, and engineering strategies are being developed.

## Local Government Initiatives on Marine Litter

Julie Lawson, Director, Mayor's Office of the Clean City, District of Columbia

Ms. Julie Lawson, Director, Mayor's Office of the Clean City, District of Columbia, described work the Mayor's Office of the Clean City in Washington, D.C., is doing to reduce/prevent marine litter. She titled her presentation "From Streets to Streams to the Sea: Reducing Plastic Pollution in Washington, D.C." and began with two issues that prompted the need for policy changes. In 2008, EPA declared the Anacostia River impaired by trash under the Clean Water Act due to significant levels of debris that prevented full use of the river. Therefore, the three local governments—Montgomery and Prince George's Counties and Washington, D.C.—now must meet annual goals to prevent trash entering the waterway and remove existing trash.

Ms. Lawson discussed the historical timeline of the activities to date, including policy changes and interventions. In 2009, trash traps were installed in Nash Run tributary to prevent waste from entering the Anacostia River. Approximately 50 percent of the trash collected from the tributary consisted of plastic bags. A year later, the Anacostia River Cleanup and Protection Act was enacted, imposing a 5-cent fee for each purchased disposable paper or plastic bag. This Act reduced plastic bag use by 60 percent with 3 weeks of the law taking effect and today is being maintained at 72 percent.

Prior to joining the Mayor's Office of the Clean City, Ms. Lawson was executive director of Trash Free Maryland (TFMD). She emphasized how the efforts of TFMD affected D.C. and the surrounding areas

and expanded her talk to include the entire state of Maryland. She elaborated on a 2008 public opinion survey conducted by the Alice Ferguson Foundation and the Trash Free Potomac Watershed Initiative in collaboration with D.C., Maryland and Virginia jurisdictions. As a direct outcome of this survey, the Regional Litter Prevention Campaign was launched in 2011. This campaign recognizes the significance to environmental efforts of increasing public awareness and changing community behaviors. In 2015, Maryland passed a law banning the use of microbeads, and Maryland implemented a ban on foam-based food packaging the following year.

Ms. Lawson noted some of the efforts of the Mayor's Office of the Clean City, including citywide cleanups and the Adopt-A-Block and Adopt Your City Programs. D.C. also is implementing programs to curb the rate of rodent infestation in the city. One long-term goal of the office's environmental programs is to ensure the Anacostia River is fishable and swimmable by 2032.

#### Question and Answer Period

In response to a question from Dr. Pardo about the characteristics of a successful trash-free program, Ms. Lawson responded that the key to developing a coherent multi-prong trash-free program that aims to inform policy change is to determine the area needing the most improvement and design and develop interventions to address that need. Programs developed should be relevant to the community being served.

#### Plastic Alternatives: Developing the Innovative Ecosystem

Daniella D. Russo, CEO, Think Beyond Plastic

Ms. Daniella Russo, CEO, Think Beyond Plastic, discussed alternatives to plastics and the role of innovation. Think Beyond Plastic partnered with UN Environment to develop the 2017 Innovation Challenge that attracted the attention of more than 1,300 innovators, entrepreneurs, mentors and other participants from across the globe. Ms. Russo emphasized that the focus is on innovation rather than research and development. The goal is to transition research into commercially viable solutions.

Ms. Russo detailed the six components of the Think Beyond Plastic's innovation ecosystem that include demand creation; identify and formulate research; accelerate commercialization; develop the investment engine; regional pilots and economic policies. She described the services provided in Think Beyond Plastic's Innovation Center and touched on mentoring and strategic partnerships.

Ms. Russo next highlighted new materials and products that the Innovation Center is helping to accelerate to viable alternatives to plastics. Think Beyond Plastic is partnering with California State University, Monterey Bay to launch the Sam Farr Innovation Center, a major step in supporting the innovation ecosystem.

#### **Summary and Next Steps**

Mr. Carrillo explained the logistics for the following day and completion of the meeting agenda. Dr. Pardo noted that the lightning talks from NAC and GAC members on marine litter have been rescheduled for Day 2 of the meeting. The meeting was recessed at 5:35 p.m. EDT.

# Friday, April 27, 2018

# **Call to Order**

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Carrillo, who noted that the day's agenda focused on the business meeting of the NAC/GAC. He introduced Ms. Stephanie McCoy, FACMD, ORAM, EPA, to provide logistical information regarding travel vouchers and other matters.

### **Plenary: Joint Committee Meeting**

Dr. Pardo explained the logistics for the business meeting. Members planned to spend time reviewing the charge, transition to the 5-minute lightning talks on marine litter, and call for public comments. Committees planned to meet separately to formulate recommendations for the advice letters. She invited NAC and GAC members to present their marine litter initiatives.

Dr. Chischilly presented the tribal perspective on marine litter prevention. She noted that this report was generated by staff at the Institute for Tribal Environmental Professionals (ITEP) at Northern Arizona University and thanked Riley Smith, ITEP, for her efforts. Tribes rely on lakes for sustenance, and amounts of food consumed can be significant. In fact, the marine-based food consumption levels for tribes in Seattle, Washington, are such that each individual is likely consuming mercury from seafood at four times the limit imposed by EPA. A concern in the tribal communities is that access to clean food, including wild-caught fish with safe mercury levels, is limited. Dr. Chischilly provided an overview of the ongoing efforts in the tribal community to actively address marine litter, including projects to build community solutions, opportunities for incorporating TEK into projects, and coastal tribes' involvement in marine protection rights. She noted that a detailed report was circulated to the committees prior to the meeting.

Mr. Donald Harris presented on how the single-use product concept is being used to reduce the generation of plastic waste. He noted two examples that are likely to reduce marine litter: Taiwan announced its plans to ban the use of plastic straws by 2030, and plans to ban microbeads in the United States. Although banning products cannot be dismissed as a strategy, Mr. Harris commented that changing attitudes on littering should be the first priority. Moving away from the single-use concept should be considered broadly.

Dr. Nathan described the *Honolulu Strategy*, a framework developed in 2011 by the global marine debris community as a product of the Fifth International Marine Debris Conference held in collaboration with UNEP. This conference focused on marine habitats, global economy, biodiversity and public health awareness. He noted the history of litter and the strategies to reduce litter in general. Regulations and controls were not in place in the 1940s, and permissions were given to bury waste and/or dump contents to the oceans. Dr. Nathan highlighted the city of Houston's Rivers, Lakes, Bays N' Bayous Trash Bash<sup>®</sup>, a 1-day waterway cleanup event. In 2018, youth under the age of 18 accounted for 50 percent of the total volunteers. To date, the 109,421 volunteers in the program successfully removed 2.274 tons of trash and 11,065 tires from the Galveston Bay Watershed.

Ms. Sandoval reported on the state of Michigan's efforts to prevent trash from entering the Great Lakes. She elaborated on the Alliance for the Great Lakes and its 25-year Adopt-a-Beach Program, which aligns with the 2014–2019 Great Lakes Land-Based Marine Debris Action Plan. Adopt-a-Beach volunteers have organized cleanup campaigns across the Great Lakes region, developed standards and procedures for collecting samples and generated data. Ms. Sandoval noted the Michigan Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) Coastal Management Grants. Further details can be accessed from the DEQ website.

#### Question and Answer Period

Ms. Sally Ann Gonzales (Arizona House of Representatives), GAC member, pointed out that need for single use products in tribal communities that are located in remote regions and do not have access to water and cleaning supplies.

Members called attention to the lessons learned from the River Rouge (Detroit, Michigan) cleanup efforts. Dr. Chischilly suggested partnering with schools to engage youth in marine litter initiatives.

Dr. Kilungo noted a long-term approach to addressing marine litter, reduction from the source and a short-term approach, changing human behaviors. Dr. Pardo added that a third focus area, efforts to address litter downstream.

#### **Public Comment Period**

No public comments were offered.

#### GAC Separate Meeting

Mr. Wennberg opened the GAC discussion and reminded members of the charge. The committee was asked to provide advice to EPA for the CEC to further advance the CEC agenda. In the broader context, if the parties then agree on goals and objectives based on the committee's recommendations, the opportunity exists to further the agenda in the three countries.

Dr. Nathan observed that the chemical industry is not assuming ownership of the fact that the products they produce contribute to the marine litter issue and has shifted responsibility to the individual. He suggested that the committee should focus on ways to message, train and commit individuals to preventing marine litter. Youth engagement efforts usually are successful. The government can impose regulations on industry, but consumers still would need to be educated on recyclable plastics. Ms. Patty Acomb (City of Minnetonka), GAC member, pointed out that manufacturers are responsive to supply, demand and market for plastics. Until that changes, the problem will persist. Recommendations should focus on changing behaviors, not industry.

Members discussed recyclable plastics and behaviors. Consumers are not asked to choose the type of plastic bag to use; labeling the products as recyclable or non-recyclable and giving consumers a choice would be helpful. Educating the consumer on product labeling would be necessary but will not solve the problem. Mr. Wright commented that plastic containers often are the only choice available to the consumer. Focusing training on the youth educates the parents as well. Dr. Nathan commented on the use of color-coded bags to segregate recyclable and non-recyclable plastics.

Mr. Wennberg moved the discussion to recommendations for the advice letter. Members commented that recommendations could be structured to address multiple layers of the problem. Education would be at the core of such a strategy. The top-down approach of government regulating industry is less likely to be effective than strategies that focus on education. The Master Water Stewards Program focuses on water quality and has an educational component, so it could be a good model. Use of the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act concept would be another potential approach. Participants recommended that the groups involved consider imposing a tax on products that pose a burden on the environment, which could then be used to establish a fund to support innovative projects to develop alternative products. The advice letter also should emphasize the need for research on the public health implications of plastics. Participants suggested that the three countries consider partnering on a marine litter mitigation effort.

#### NAC Separate Meeting

Dr. Pardo opened the NAC discussion by restating the charge. She reiterated that the goal is to provide advice on best practices regarding marine litter activities.

Members discussed potential best practices, incentive programs, policy development, outreach and partnerships. Ms. Hopper recommended including in the advice letter that a more in-depth analysis and accurate characterization is required to develop best practices. Leveraging the resources of the TFW Program and the expertise of Mr. Benson could lead to formulation of best practices on marine litter. Mr. Andrew P. Carey (U.S.–Mexico Border Philanthropy Partnership [BPP]), NAC member, called attention to the challenge of implementing best practices in developing countries, which typically are low-resource settings and lack the necessary infrastructure (e.g., solid waste removal services) to support litter prevention. Mr. Carlos Perez (Galica, LLC), NAC member, pointed out that marine litter is a result of existing problems, such as inadequate public sanitation and social infrastructure.

Members discussed potential approaches to improve community behavior and develop new governmental policies. Members recommended building an effective public policy campaign to promote marine litter management. Changing community behavior and enacting new policies are important strategies. Dr. Chischilly suggested improving community solid waste management practices and incentivizing recycling. Members noted the importance of identifying and evaluating data that describe the approaches most effective in changing human behavior. Mr. Donald Harris noted the significance of engaging existing organizations and youth. Partnering with the fishing industry could be considered. Another incentivizing approach is creating programs that will employ individuals from the community to clean litter.

Members discussed the formation of international collaborations to mitigate marine litter. Implementing marine litter initiatives in developing countries requires engagement with the UN. Leverage existing public-private partnerships. Members thought that creating microfinancing services for low-income areas (e.g., tribal communities) would be an effective incentivizing approach. Identifying cost-effective measures to promote cooperation between countries should be considered. A member suggested that each country contribute financially to the UN-based initiative to prevent marine litter and plastics.

Concerning outreach, some members expressed interest in contacting corporations (e.g., McDonald's) to help implement public awareness about waste. Ms. Simone Sagovac (Southwest Detroit Community Benefits), NAC member, emphasized the importance of educating the public regarding the contribution of land-based waste to the development of marine litter. Some members expressed concern about targeting youth for litter mitigation initiatives because younger people may not have the tools to implement certain practices. Other members agreed that engaging youth is important to sustain long-term approaches. The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) and its programs could serve as a model for implementing regional initiatives. Also, the three countries could work with CDC to implement each nation's best practices.

Members provided closing comments and suggestions. Dr. Pardo recommended that the members review case studies (e.g., Atmospheric Trust Litigation) that relate to marine litter.

#### **Committees Reconvene in Plenary Session**

Reports From the NAC and GAC Chairs

Committee Chairs Dr. Pardo and Mr. Wennberg explained that deliberations will be finalized and NAC and GAC advice letters generated, which will be shared with each committee's respective members for their comments. Final advice letters will be forwarded to EPA.

## Adjournment

Dr. Pardo and Mr. Wennberg adjourned the meeting at 12:01 p.m. EDT.

## **Action Items**

- ✤ Mr. Carrillo will forward to the committees a link to EPA's Strategic Plan.
- ✤ Mr. Carrillo will forward to the committees speakers' PowerPoint presentation slides.
- Mr. Wennberg will forward to the committees a list of EPA exemplary programs related to cooperative federalism.
- Members will forward to Mr. Carrillo information on state and local environmental groups focused on coastal water cleanups that EPA could engage in the marine litter initiative and/or the TFW Program.
- Members wanting to participate as speakers in the CEC Secretariat SEM 2018 outreach activities should contact Mr. Moyer.
- Dr. Pardo will share her draft advice letter on best practices being implemented by state and local governments, the private sector, academia and local communities to address marine litter with the NAC members for their comments.
- Mr. Wennberg will share his draft advice letter on best practices being implemented by state and local governments, the private sector, academia and local communities to address marine litter with the GAC members for their comments.

# **Summary Certification**

*I*, Jeffrey Wennberg, *Chair of the Governmental Advisory Committee, and I*, Theresa Pardo, *Chair of the National Advisory Committee, certify that the meeting minutes for the dates of April 26–27, 2018, as hereby detailed, contain a record of the persons present and give an accurate description of matters discussed and conclusions reached and copies of all reports received, issued or approved by the advisory committees. My signature date complies with the 90-day due date after each meeting required by the GSA Final Rule.* 

Ulunday

Sheresa a Pardo

Jeffrey Wennberg Chair, GAC Theresa Pardo Chair, NAC

July 20, 2018

July 19, 2018

Date

Date

# **Appendix A: Meeting Participants**

#### **NAC Members**

**Theresa Pardo, Ph.D., Chair** Director Center for Technology in Government Associate Professor of Public Administration and Policy University at Albany - State University of New York

Andrew P. Carey Executive Director U.S.-Mexico Border Philanthropy Partnership

Ann Marie Chischilly, Ph.D. Executive Director Institute for Tribal Environmental Professionals Northern Arizona University

**Donald K. Harris** President and Founder Amerris Consulting, LLC

**Tracy Hester, J.D.** Professor of Practice University of Houston Law Center

Sara E. Hopper Manager Agricultural Division DowDuPont

Aminata P. Kilungo, Ph.D.
Mel and Enid Zuckerman College of Public Health
Department of Health and Promotion Science The University of Arizona

**Donna L. Lybecker, Ph.D.** Professor and Chair Department of Political Science Idaho State University **Carlos Perez** Principal Galica LLC

Simone Sagovac

Project Director Southwest Detroit Community Benefits Coalition

#### **GAC Members**

Jeffrey Wennberg, Chair Commissioner of Public Works City of Rutland, Vermont

**Patty Acomb** City Council Member Government Administration City of Minnetonka, Minnesota

Marina M. Brock Senior Environmental Specialist Environmental Health Division Department of Health and the Environment Barnstable County, Massachusetts

Sally Ann Gonzales State Representative Arizona House of Representatives

Vincent R. Nathan, Ph.D., M.P.H. Assistant Health Director Metropolitan Health District City of San Antonio, Texas

**C. Nazaret Sandoval** Environmental Engineer Michigan Department of Environmental Quality

Kelly C. Wright Program Manager Environmental Waste Manager Program Shoshone-Bannock Tribes Fort Hall Indian Reservation

#### **Designated Federal Officer**

Oscar Carrillo Federal Advisory Committee Management Division Office of Administration and Resources Management U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

#### **EPA Participants**

Robert Benson Acting Director Partnership Programs Branch Office of Water U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Geraldine Brown** Federal Advisory Committee Management Division U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Lisa Goldman Office of General Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

# Monisha Harris

Federal Advisory Committee Management DivisionOffice of Administration and Resources ManagementU.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Andrew Horan Office of Water U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Mark Kasman Director Office of Regional and Bilateral Affairs Office of International and Tribal Affairs U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

**Emma Maschal** Office of Water U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Stephanie McCoy
Federal Advisory Committee Management
Division
Office of Administration and Resources
Management
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Jane Nishida Acting Assistant Administrator Office of International and Tribal Affairs U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Luis Troche Senior Advisor North American Program Office of International and Tribal Affairs U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

#### **Other Participants**

**Gustavo Alanis-Ortega** Chair Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC)

**Cintia Ameziia** Secretariat of Environment and Natural Resources

**Cesar Rafael Chavez** Executive Director Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC) Secretariat

Nathalie Daoust CEC Liaison

**Carla Feiedrich** Program Officer United Nations Environment North America Office

#### **Stuart Harris**

Director Marine and Environmental Stewardship Plastics Division American Chemical Council **Lisa Lawson** Director Mayor's Office of the Clean City District of Columbia

#### **Robert Moyer**

Unit Director Submissions on Enforcement Matters Commission for Environmental Cooperation

Marcela Orozco JPAC Liaison Officer

Jennifer Ronk Sustainability and Advocacy Manager, North America The Dow Chemical Company

Daniella Russo CEO Think Beyond Plastic™

#### **Contractor Staff**

**Carolyn J. Fisher, Ph.D.** The Scientific Consulting Group, Inc. **Appendix B: Meeting Agenda** 





# Official Meeting of the National and Governmental Advisory Committees to the U.S. Representative to the Commission for Environmental Cooperation

# April 26-27, 2018 U.S. EPA WJC North 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, D.C. 20004 Tel: 202-564-2294 fax: 202-564-8129 4/26/2018 ~FINAL~ AGENDA

#### ~EPA NETI Conference Room 6045 WJC North ~

#### Thursday, April 26, 2018

9:00 a.m.	Registration
9:30 a.m.	Call to Order and Introductions Oscar Carrillo, Designated Federal Officer, EPA
9:35 a.m.	Welcome Monisha Harris, Director, Federal Advisory Committee Management, EPA
9:40 a.m.	<b>Overview of Agenda</b> Theresa Pardo, Chair of the National Advisory Committee Jeff Wennberg, Chair of the Governmental Advisory Committee
9:55 a.m.	Update on U.S. Priorities & Guidance, Tribal Update Jane T. Nishida, Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator (PDAA), OITA, EPA
10:50 a.m.	BREAK
11:00 a.m.	Federal Government Initiatives on Marine Litter Robert S. Benson, Acting Chief, Partnership Programs Branch, Office of Water, EPA
12:00 p.m.	Public Comments Period

# 12:30 p.m. LUNCH

# Thursday, April 26, 2018 Continued...

1:30 p.m.	CEC Update on Operational Plan and NAPECA Grants Cesar Rafael Chavez, Executive Director, CEC Secretariat Question & Answer Period
1:55 p.m.	<b>SEM Update</b> Robert Moyer, Director, SEM & Legal Senior Advisor, CEC Secretariat Lisa Goldman, Office of General Counsel, EPA Question & Answer
2:10 p.m.	JPAC Report-out Gustavo Alanís-Ortega, Chair, Joint Public Advisory Committee Question & Answer Period
2:30 p.m.	United Nations Update on Marine Litter Initiatives Carla Friedrich, Program Officer, UN Environment, North America Office Question & Answer Period
3:00 p.m.	BREAK
3:15 p.m.	Private Sector Initiatives on Marine Litter Stewart Harris, Director, Marine & Environmental Stewardship, Plastics Division American Chemistry Council (ACC) Jennifer Ronk, The Dow Chemical Co. Question & Answer Period
4:00 p.m.	Local Government Initiatives on Marine Litter Julie Lawson, Director for D.C. Mayor's Office of the Clean City Question & Answer Period
4:30 p.m.	Plastic Alternatives: Developing the Innovation Eco-system Daniella D. Russo, CEO, Think Beyond Plastic™ Question & Answer
5:00 p.m.	Lightning Talks from NAC/GAC Members on Marine Litter Initiatives NAC & GAC Members Question & Answer Period

# 5:15 p.m. Summary & Next Steps

Theresa Pardo, Chair of the National Advisory Committee Jeff Wennberg, Chair of the Governmental Advisory Committee

# 5:30 p.m. **ADJOURN**

## Friday, April 27, 2018

#### **BUSINESS MEETING:**

- 8:30 a.m. Registration
- 9:00 a.m. Call to Order Oscar Carrillo, Designated Federal Officer, EPA
- 9:05 a.m. Plenary: Joint Committee Meeting Theresa Pardo, Chair of the National Advisory Committee Jeff Wennberg, Chair of the Governmental Advisory Committee
  - Discussion on Fall 2018 meeting
- 9:30 a.m. Public Comment Period
- 9:45 a.m. Committees Meet Separately GAC stays in "6045" Conference Room NAC meets in "1132" Conference Room
- 12:00 p.m. LUNCH
- 1:00 p.m. Committees Reconvene in Plenary Session Report-outs From NAC/GAC Chairs
- 3:00 p.m. ADJOURN

# Appendix C: Charge Letter for April 26–27, 2018 NAC/GAC Meeting

# **CHARGE LETTER: NAC/GAC MEETING** *April 27–28, 2018* WASHINGTON, **DC**

Dear NAC and GAC Members,

Since our last meeting in September 14-15, 2017, the Council agreed on "Innovation and Partnerships for Green Growth" as the focus for the current NAPECA grant cycle. The CEC funded nine local projects through this initiative. In addition, the JPAC held a meeting in November 9, 2017 on "NAFTA'S Environmental Side Agreement: Assessing the Past, Looking Towards the Future."

**The main topic for our April meeting is Marine Litter**. This issue continues to be highlighted in international fora with a recent resolution at United Nations Environment Assembly meeting and a commitment of G7 countries to take deliberate action to address marine litter and debris. The CEC has also highlighted the importance of this issue and is currently implementing a project based in border watersheds to address marine litter with citizen science and stakeholder input to prevent/reduce land-based sources of waste.

# EPA would welcome NAC/GAC advice focused on **best practices being implemented by state and local governments, private sector, academia and local communities to:**

- Prevent/reduce sources of debris and plastics from entering into waterways to become marine debris/litter;
- Innovative uses of alternative materials that are able to decay or compost reducing the impact on waterways and coastal ecosystems;
- Mitigate marine debris and plastics that has found its way into waterways and coastal areas; and
- Increase public awareness and action to address the problem of marine debris/plastics.

The advice could focus on land-based sources of debris, including plastics and micro-plastics, that enter waterways and could target key/major source sectors, including tourism related sectors. Best practices could include operations, partnerships, incentives, and product stewardship. The objective of this advice is to identify innovative practices, leading sectors implementing these practices, and motivating drivers/cost-benefits to share and advance with our partners in North America.

Furthermore, as is customary for our meetings, you will also be briefed by Jane Nishida, Acting Assistant Administrator for EPA's Office of International and Tribal Affairs, and the CEC Secretariat Executive Director, Cesar Rafael Chavez and the CEC Joint Public Advisory Committee Chair, Gustavo Alanis-Ortega. Finally, the committees are welcome to provide advice on other trade and environment issues related to the NAAEC