ANNEX 4 IPCC Reference Approach for Estimating CO_2 Emissions from Fossil Fuel Combustion

It is possible to estimate carbon dioxide (CO_2) emissions from fossil fuel consumption using alternative methodologies and different data sources than those described in the Estimating Emissions from Fossil Fuel Combustion Annex. For example, the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) reporting guidelines request that countries, in addition to their "bottom-up" sectoral methodology, complete a "top-down" Reference Approach for estimating CO_2 emissions from fossil fuel combustion. Volume 2: Energy, Chapter 6: Reference Approach of the *2006 IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories* (IPCC 2006) states, "comparability between the sectoral and reference approaches continues to allow a country to produce a second independent estimate of CO_2 emissions from fuel combustion with limited additional effort and data requirements." This reference method estimates fossil fuel consumption by adjusting national aggregate fuel production data for imports, exports, and stock changes rather than relying on end-user consumption surveys. The basic principle is that once carbon (C)-based fuels are brought into a national economy, they are either saved in some way (e.g., stored in products, kept in fuel stocks, or left unoxidized in ash) or combusted, and therefore the C in them is oxidized and released into the atmosphere. Accounting for actual consumption of fuels at the sectoral or sub-national level is not required. The following discussion provides the detailed calculations for estimating CO_2 emissions from fossil fuel combustion from the United States using the IPCC-recommended Reference Approach.

Step 1: Collect and Assemble Data in Proper Format

To ensure the comparability of national inventories, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) has recommended that countries report energy data using the International Energy Agency (IEA) reporting convention. National energy statistics were collected in physical units from several Energy Information Administration (EIA) documents in order to obtain the necessary data on production, imports, exports, and stock changes.

It was necessary to modify these data to generate more accurate apparent consumption estimates of these fuels. The first modification adjusts for consumption of fossil fuel feedstocks accounted for in the Industrial Processes and Product Use chapter, which include the following: unspecified coal for coal coke used in iron and steel production; natural gas, distillate fuel, and coal used in iron and steel production; natural gas used for ammonia production; petroleum coke used in the production of aluminum, ferroalloys, titanium dioxide, ammonia, and silicon carbide; and other oil and residual fuel oil used in the manufacture of C black. The second modification adjusts for the fact that EIA energy statistics include synthetic natural gas in coal and natural gas data. The third modification adjusts for the inclusion of ethanol in motor gasoline statistics. Ethanol is a biofuel, and net carbon fluxes from changes in biogenic carbon reservoirs in croplands are accounted for in the estimates for Land Use, Land-Use Change, and Forestry (see Chapter 6). The fourth modification adjusts for consumption of bunker fuels, which refer to quantities of fuels used for international transportation estimated separately from U.S. totals. The fifth modification consists of the addition of U.S. Territories data that are typically excluded from the national aggregate energy statistics. The territories include Puerto Rico, U.S. Virgin Islands, Guam, American Samoa, Wake Island, and U.S. Pacific Islands. These data, as well as the production, import, export, and stock change statistics, are presented in Table A-258.

The C content of fuel varies with the fuel's heat content. Therefore, for an accurate estimation of CO_2 emissions, fuel statistics were provided on an energy content basis (e.g., Btu or joules). Because detailed fuel production statistics are typically provided in physical units (as in Table A-258 for 2017), they were converted to units of energy before CO_2 emissions were calculated. Fuel statistics were converted to their energy equivalents by using conversion factors provided by EIA. These factors and their data sources are displayed in Table A-259. The resulting fuel type-specific energy data for 2017 are provided in Table A-260.

Step 2: Estimate Apparent Fuel Consumption

The next step of the IPCC Reference Approach is to estimate "apparent consumption" of fuels within the country. This requires a balance of primary fuels produced, plus imports, minus exports, and adjusting for stock changes. In this way, C enters an economy through energy production and imports (and decreases in fuel stocks) and is transferred out of the country through exports (and increases in fuel stocks). Thus, apparent consumption of primary fuels (including crude oil, natural gas liquids, anthracite, bituminous, subbituminous and lignite coal, and natural gas) can be calculated as follows:

$$Apparent\ Consumption = Production\ +\ Imports\ -\ Exports\ -\ Stock\ Change$$

Flows of secondary fuels (e.g., gasoline, residual fuel, coke) should be added to primary apparent consumption. The production of secondary fuels, however, should be ignored in the calculations of apparent consumption since the C contained in these fuels is already accounted for in the supply of primary fuels from which they were derived (e.g., the estimate for apparent consumption of crude oil already contains the C from which gasoline would be refined). Flows of secondary fuels should therefore be calculated as follows:

$$Secondary\ Consumption = Imports\ -\ Exports\ -\ Stock\ Change$$

Note that this calculation can result in negative numbers for apparent consumption of secondary fuels. This result is perfectly acceptable since it merely indicates a net export or stock increase in the country of that fuel when domestic production is not considered.

Next, the apparent consumption and secondary consumption need to be adjusted for feedstock uses of fuels accounted for in the Industrial Processes and Product Use chapter, international bunker fuels, and U.S. territory fuel consumption. Bunker fuels and feedstocks accounted for in the Industrial Processes and Product Use chapter are subtracted from these estimates, while fuel consumption in U.S. Territories is added.

The IPCC Reference Approach calls for estimating apparent fuel consumption before converting to a common energy unit. However, certain primary fuels in the United States (e.g., natural gas and steam coal) have separate conversion factors for production, imports, exports, and stock changes. In these cases, it is not appropriate to multiply apparent consumption by a single conversion factor since each of its components has different heat contents. Therefore, United States fuel statistics were converted to their heat equivalents before estimating apparent consumption. Results are provided in Table A-259.

Step 3: Estimate Carbon Emissions

Once apparent consumption is estimated, the remaining calculations are similar to those for the "bottom-up" Sectoral Approach (see Estimating Emissions from Fossil Fuel Combustion Annex). Potential CO_2 emissions were estimated using fuel-specific C coefficients (see Table A-260).[112] The C in products from non-energy uses of fossil fuels (e.g., plastics or asphalt) that is stored was then estimated and subtracted (see Table A-262). This step differs from the Sectoral Approach in that emissions from both fuel combustion and non-energy uses are accounted for in the Reference Approach. Finally, to obtain actual CO_2 emissions, net emissions were adjusted for any C that remained unoxidized as a result of incomplete combustion (e.g., C contained in ash or soot). The fraction oxidized was assumed to be 100 percent for petroleum, coal, and natural gas based on guidance in IPCC (2006) (see Annex 2.1 Methodology for Estimating Emissions of CO_2 from Fossil Fuel Combustion).

Step 4: Convert to CO_2 Emissions

Because the *2006 IPCC Guidelines* recommend that countries report greenhouse gas emissions on a full molecular weight basis, the final step in estimating CO_2 emissions from fossil fuel consumption was converting from units of C to units of CO_2. Actual C emissions were multiplied by the molecular-to-atomic weight ratio of CO_2 to C (44/12) to obtain total CO_2 emitted from fossil fuel combustion in million metric tons (MMT). The results are contained in Table A-261.

Comparison Between Sectoral and Reference Approaches

These two alternative approaches can both produce reliable estimates that are comparable within a few percent. Note that the reference approach includes emissions from non-energy uses. Therefore, these totals should be compared to the aggregation of fuel use and emission totals from Emissions of CO_2 from Fossil Fuel Combustion and Carbon Emitted from Non-Energy Uses of Fossil Fuels Annexes. These two sections together are henceforth referred to as the Sectoral Approach. Other than this distinction, the major difference between methodologies employed by each approach lies in the energy data used to derive C emissions (i.e., the actual surveyed consumption for the Sectoral Approach versus apparent consumption derived for the Reference Approach). In theory, both approaches should yield identical results. In practice, however, slight discrepancies occur. An examination of past Common Reporting Format (CRF) table submissions during UNFCCC reviews has highlighted the need to further investigate these discrepancies. The investigation found that the most recent (two to three) inventory years tend to have larger differences in consumption and emissions estimates occurring earlier in the time series. This is a result of annual energy consumption data revisions in the EIA energy statistics, and the revisions

---

[112] Carbon coefficients from EIA were used wherever possible. Because EIA did not provide coefficients for coal, the IPCC-recommended emission factors were used in the top-down calculations for these fuels. See notes in Table A-261 for more specific source information.

have the greatest impact on the most recent few years of inventory estimates. As a result, the differences between the Sectoral and Reference Approach decrease and are resolved over time. For the United States, these differences are discussed below.

Differences in Total Amount of Energy Consumed

Table A-264 summarizes the differences between the Reference and Sectoral Approaches in estimating total energy consumption in the United States. Although theoretically the two methods should arrive at the same estimate for U.S. energy consumption, the Reference Approach provides an energy consumption total that is 1.5 percent lower than the Sectoral Approach for 2017. The greatest differences lie in lower estimates for coal and petroleum consumption for the Reference Approach (1.6 percent and 3.1 percent, respectively) and higher estimates for natural gas consumption for the Reference Approach (0.4 percent).

There are several potential sources for the discrepancies in consumption estimates:

- *Product Definitions.* The fuel categories in the Reference Approach are different from those used in the Sectoral Approach, particularly for petroleum. For example, the Reference Approach estimates apparent consumption for crude oil. Crude oil is not typically consumed directly, but refined into other products. As a result, the United States does not focus on estimating the energy content of the various grades of crude oil, but rather estimating the energy content of the various products resulting from crude oil refining. The United States does not believe that estimating apparent consumption for crude oil, and the resulting energy content of the crude oil, is the most reliable method for the United States to estimate its energy consumption. Other differences in product definitions include using sector-specific coal statistics in the Sectoral Approach (i.e., residential, commercial, industrial coking, industrial other, and transportation coal), while the Reference Approach characterizes coal by rank (i.e., anthracite, bituminous, etc.). Also, the liquefied petroleum gas (LPG) statistics used in the bottom-up calculations are a composite category composed of natural gas liquids (NGL) and LPG.

- *Heat Equivalents.* It can be difficult to obtain heat equivalents for certain fuel types, particularly for categories such as "crude oil" where the key statistics are derived from thousands of producers in the United States and abroad.

- *Possible inconsistencies in U.S. Energy Data.* The United States has not focused its energy data collection efforts on obtaining the type of aggregated information used in the Reference Approach. Rather, the United States believes that its emphasis on collection of detailed energy consumption data is a more accurate methodology for the United States to obtain reliable energy data. Therefore, top-down statistics used in the Reference Approach may not be as accurately collected as bottom-up statistics applied to the Sectoral Approach.

- *Balancing Item.* The Reference Approach uses *apparent* consumption estimates while the Sectoral Approach uses *reported* consumption estimates. While these numbers should be equal, there always seems to be a slight difference that is often accounted for in energy statistics as a "balancing item."

Differences in Estimated CO_2 Emissions

Given these differences in energy consumption data, the next step for each methodology involved estimating emissions of CO_2. Table A-265 summarizes the differences between the two methods in estimated C emissions.

As mentioned above, for 2017, the Reference Approach resulted in a 1.5 percent lower estimate of energy consumption in the United States than the Sectoral Approach. The resulting emissions estimate for the Reference Approach was 1.4 percent lower. Estimates of natural gas emissions from the Reference Approach are higher (0.5 percent), and coal and petroleum emission estimates are lower (2.6 percent and 1.8 percent, respectively) than the Sectoral Approach. Potential reasons for these differences may include:

- *Product Definitions.* Coal data are aggregated differently in each methodology, as noted above. The format used for the Sectoral Approach likely results in more accurate estimates than in the Reference Approach. Also, the Reference Approach relies on a "crude oil" category for determining petroleum-related emissions. Given the many sources of crude oil in the United States, it is not an easy matter to track potential differences in C content between many different sources of crude; particularly since information on the C content of crude oil is not regularly collected.

- *Carbon Coefficients.* The Reference Approach relies on several default C coefficients by rank provided by IPCC (2006), while the Sectoral Approach uses annually updated category-specific coefficients by sector that are likely to be more accurate. Also, as noted above, the C coefficient for crude oil is more uncertain than that for specific secondary petroleum products, given the many sources and grades of crude oil consumed in the United States.

Although the two approaches produce similar results, the United States believes that the "bottom-up" Sectoral Approach provides a more accurate assessment of CO_2 emissions at the fuel level. This improvement in accuracy is largely a result of the data collection techniques used in the United States, where there has been more emphasis on obtaining the detailed products-based information used in the Sectoral Approach than obtaining the aggregated energy flow data used in the Reference Approach. The United States believes that it is valuable to understand both methods.

References

EIA (2018a) *Monthly Energy Review, October 2018*. Energy Information Administration, U.S. Department of Energy. Washington, D.C. DOE/EIA-0035(2018/10).

EIA (2018b) *Annual Coal Report 2017*. Energy Information Administration, U.S. Department of Energy. Washington, D.C. DOE/EIA-0584(2018).

EIA (1995-2017). *Petroleum Supply Annual*, Energy Information Administration, U.S. Department of Energy, Washington, DC, Volume I. DOE/EIA-0340.

EIA (1992). Coal and lignite production. *EIA State Energy Data Report 1992*, Energy Information Administration, U.S. Department of Energy, Washington, DC.

EPA (2010). Carbon Content Coefficients Developed for EPA's Mandatory Reporting Rule. Office of Air and Radiation, Office of Atmospheric Programs, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, D.C.

IPCC (2006). *2006 IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories*, Prepared by the National Greenhouse Gas Inventories Programme, Eggleston H.S., Buendia L., Miwa K., Ngara T., and Tanabe K. (eds.). Published: IGES, Japan.

SAIC (2004). Analysis prepared by Science Applications International Corporation for EPA, Office of Air and Radiation, Market Policies Branch.

USGS (1998). *CoalQual Database Version 2.0*, U.S. Geological Survey.

Table A-258: 2017 U.S. Energy Statistics (Physical Units)

Fuel Category (Units)	Fuel Type	Production	Imports	Exports	Stock Change	Adjustment	Bunkers	U.S. Territories
Solid Fuels (Thousand Short Tons)	Anthracite Coal	1,912	[1]	[1]	[1]			
	Bituminous Coal	353,520	[1]	[1]	[1]			
	Sub-bituminous Coal	351,502	[1]	[1]	[1]	367		
	Lignite	67,675	[1]	[1]	[1]	4,746		
	Coke		58	1,209	(21)			
	Unspecified Coal		7,777	96,953	(29,451)	3,031		1,963
Gas Fuels (Million Cubic Feet)	Natural Gas	26,981,637	3,042,391	3,167,857	(254,100)	339,728		55,000
Liquid Fuels (Thousand Barrels)	Crude Oil	3,413,376	2,908,670	422,518	(95,227)			
	Nat Gas Liquids and Liquefied Refinery Gases	1,380,702	71,427	512,495	(10,191)			4,005
	Other Liquids	0	471,784	171,592	8,685			
	Motor Gasoline	27,566	11,784	273,483	(3,860)	237,215		34,263
	Aviation Gasoline		165	0	47			
	Kerosene		1,429	2,267	10			411
	Jet Fuel		58,273	67,161	(1,706)		181,199	8,044
	Distillate Fuel		54,975	504,155	(20,457)	104	13,526	18,586
	Residual Fuel		69,015	112,240	(12,098)	9,000	70,833	20,195
	Naphtha for petrochemical feedstocks		11,373	0	(162)			
	Petroleum Coke		3,662	215,873	1,536	12,304		
	Other Oil for petrochemical feedstocks		4,323	0	(195)	1,240		
	Special Naphthas		5,405	0	(26)			
	Lubricants		14,901	36,215	(347)			172
	Waxes		1,724	1,479	184			
	Asphalt/Road Oil		13,666	7,399	(1,184)			
	Still Gas		0	0	0			
	Misc. Products		64	279	(11)			13,144

[1] Included in Unspecified Coal
Note: Parentheses indicate negative values.
Sources: Solid and Gas Fuels: EIA (2018a and 2018b); Liquid Fuels: EIA (1995-2017).

Table A-259: Conversion Factors to Energy Units (Heat Equivalents)

Fuel Category (Units)	Fuel Type	Production	Imports	Exports	Stock Change	Adjustment	Bunkers	U.S. Territories
Solid Fuels (Million Btu/Short Ton)	Anthracite Coal	22.57						
	Bituminous Coal	23.89						
	Sub-bituminous Coal	17.14				28.16		
	Lignite	12.87				12.87		
	Coke		21.48	24.63	21.48			
	Unspecified		25.00	25.97	20.86	140.86		25.14
Natural Gas (BTU/Cubic Foot)		1,036	1,025	1,009	1,036	1,036		1,036
Liquid Fuels (Million Btu/Barrel)	Crude Oil	5.72	6.05	5.74	5.74		5.74	5.74
	Nat Gas Liquids and Liquefied Refinery Gases	3.70	3.70	3.70	3.70		3.70	3.70
	Other Liquids	5.83	5.83	5.83	5.83		5.83	5.83
	Motor Gasoline	5.06	5.06	5.06	5.06	5.06	5.06	5.06
	Aviation Gasoline		5.05	5.05	5.05		5.05	5.05
	Kerosene		5.67	5.67	5.67		5.67	5.67
	Jet Fuel		5.67	5.67	5.67		5.80	5.67
	Distillate Fuel		5.83	5.83	5.83	5.83	5.83	5.83
	Residual Oil		6.29	6.29	6.29	6.29	6.29	6.29
	Naphtha for petrochemical feedstocks		5.25	5.25	5.25		5.25	5.25
	Petroleum Coke		6.02	6.02	6.02	6.02	6.02	6.02
	Other Oil for petrochemical feedstocks		5.83	5.83	5.83	5.83	5.83	5.83
	Special Naphthas		5.25	5.25	5.25		5.25	5.25
	Lubricants		6.07	6.07	6.07		6.07	6.07
	Waxes		5.54	5.54	5.54		5.54	5.54
	Asphalt/Road Oil		6.64	6.64	6.64		6.64	6.64
	Still Gas		6.00	6.00	6.00		6.00	6.00
	Misc. Products		5.80	5.80	5.80		5.80	5.80

Sources: Coal and lignite production: EIA (1992); Unspecified Solid Fuels, Coke, Natural Gas and Petroleum Products: EIA (1995-2017).

Table A-260: 2017 Apparent Consumption of Fossil Fuels (TBtu)

Fuel Category	Fuel Type	Production	Imports	Exports	Stock Change	Adjustment	Bunkers	U.S. Territories	Apparent Consumption
Solid Fuels	Anthracite Coal	43.2							43.2
	Bituminous Coal	8,445.6							8,445.6
	Sub-bituminous Coal	6,024.8				10.3			6,014.4
	Lignite	870.7				61.1			809.6
	Coke		1.2	29.8	(0.5)				(28.1)
	Unspecified		194.4	2,518.1	(614.4)	427.9		49.3	(2,087.8)
Gas Fuels	Natural Gas	27,953.0	3,118.5	3,196.4	(263.2)	351.8		57.0	27,843.5
Liquid Fuels	Crude Oil	19,534.8	17,597.5	2,424.4	(546.4)				35,254.2
	Nat Gas Liquids and Liquefied Refinery Gases	5,107.2	264.2	1,895.7	(37.7)			14.8	3,528.2
	Other Liquids		2,748.1	999.5	50.6				1,698.0
	Motor Gasoline	139.3	59.6	1,382.5	(19.5)			173.2	(990.8)
	Aviation Gasoline		0.8	0.2	0.2				0.4
	Kerosene		8.1	12.9	0.1			2.3	(2.5)
	Jet Fuel		330.4	380.8	(9.7)		1,050.2	45.6	(1,045.4)
	Distillate Fuel		320.2	2,936.7	(119.2)	0.6	78.8	108.3	(2,468.4)
	Residual Oil		433.9	705.7	(76.1)	56.6	445.3	127.0	(570.6)
	Naphtha for petrochemical feedstocks		59.7		(0.9)				60.5
	Petroleum Coke		22.1	1,300.4	9.3	74.1			(1,361.7)
	Other Oil for petrochemical feedstocks		25.2		(1.1)	7.2			19.1
	Special Naphthas		28.4		(0.1)				28.5
	Lubricants		90.4	219.6	(2.1)			1.0	(126.1)
	Waxes		9.5	8.2	1.0				0.3
	Asphalt/Road Oil		90.7	49.1	(7.9)				49.4
	Still Gas								
	Misc. Products		0.4	1.6	(0.1)			76.2	75.0
Total		**68,118.5**	**25,403.2**	**18,061.5**	**(1,637.6)**	**989.6**	**1,574.4**	**654.7**	**75,188.5**

Notes: Totals may not sum due to independent rounding. Parentheses indicate negative values.

Table A-261: 2017 Potential CO₂ Emissions

Fuel Category	Fuel Type	Apparent Consumption (QBtu)	Carbon Coefficients (MMT Carbon/QBtu)	Potential Emissions (MMT CO₂ Eq.)
Solid Fuels	Anthracite Coal	0.04	28.28	4.5
	Bituminous Coal	8.45	25.45	788.0
	Sub-bituminous Coal	6.01	26.22	578.3
	Lignite	0.81	26.68	79.2
	Coke	(0.03)	31.00	(3.2)
	Unspecified	(2.09)	25.34	(194.0)
Gas Fuels	Natural Gas	27.84	14.46	1,475.8
Liquid Fuels	Crude Oil	35.25	20.31	2,624.8
	Nat Gas Liquids and LRGs	3.53	16.84	217.8
	Other Liquids	1.70	20.31	126.4
	Motor Gasoline	(0.99)	19.46	(70.7)
	Aviation Gasoline	0.00	18.86	0.0
	Kerosene	(0.00)	19.96	(0.2)
	Jet Fuel	(1.05)	19.70	(75.5)
	Distillate Fuel	(2.47)	20.17	(182.6)
	Residual Oil	(0.57)	20.48	(42.9)
	Naphtha for petrochemical feedstocks	0.06	18.55	4.1
	Petroleum Coke	(1.36)	27.85	(139.0)
	Other Oil for petrochemical feedstocks	0.02	20.17	1.4
	Special Naphthas	0.03	19.74	2.1
	Lubricants	(0.13)	20.20	(9.3)
	Waxes	0.00	19.80	0.0
	Asphalt/Road Oil	0.05	20.55	3.7
	Still Gas		18.20	
	Misc. Products	0.08	20.31	5.6
Total				**5,194.4**

Note: Totals may not sum due to independent rounding. Parentheses indicate negative values.
Sources: C content coefficients by coal rank from USGS (1998), SAIC (2004), and EIA (2018b); Unspecified Solid Fuels, EIA (1995-2017), Natural Gas and Liquid Fuels: EPA (2010).

Table A-262: 2017 Non-Energy Carbon Stored in Products

Fuel Type	Consumption for Non-Energy Use (TBtu)	Carbon Coefficients (MMT Carbon/QBtu)	Carbon Content (MMT Carbon)	Fraction Sequestered	Carbon Stored (MMT CO₂ Eq.)
Coal	125.7	31.00	3.93	0.10	2.1
Natural Gas	306.9	14.46	4.44	0.67	10.9
Asphalt & Road Oil	849.2	20.55	17.45	1.00	63.7
LPG	2,186.8	17.06	37.31	0.67	92.0
Lubricants	267.9	20.20	5.41	0.09	1.8
Pentanes Plus	81.5	19.10	1.56	0.67	3.8
Petrochemical Feedstocks	[1]	[1]	[1]	[1]	37.9
Petroleum Coke	0.0	27.85	0.00	0.30	0.0
Special Naphtha	94.9	19.74	1.87	0.67	4.6

Waxes/Misc.	[1]	[1]	[1]	[1]	0.6
Misc. U.S. Territories Petroleum	[1]	[1]	[1]	[1]	0.6
Total					**218.1**

[1] Values for Misc. U.S. Territories Petroleum, Petrochemical Feedstocks and Waxes/Misc. are not shown because these categories are aggregates of numerous smaller components.

Note: Totals may not sum due to independent rounding.

Table A-263: 2017 Reference Approach CO_2 Emissions from Fossil Fuel Consumption (MMT CO_2 Eq. unless otherwise noted)

Fuel Category	Potential Emissions	Carbon Sequestered	Net Emissions	Fraction Oxidized	Total Emissions
Coal	1,252.8	2.1	1,250.7	100.0%	1,250.7
Petroleum	2,465.8	205.0	2,260.8	100.0%	2,260.8
Natural Gas	1,475.8	10.9	1,464.8	100.0%	1,464.8
Total	**5,194.4**	**218.1**	**4,976.4**		**4,976.4**

Note: Totals may not sum due to independent rounding.

Table A-264: Fuel Consumption in the United States by Estimating Approach (TBtu)[a]

Approach	1990	1995	2000	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Sectoral	**69,703**	**74,898**	**82,514**	**83,881**	**81,170**	**76,398**	**78,902**	**77,498**	**75,701**	**77,774**	**78,450**	**77,539**	**76,799**	**76,372**
Coal	18,072	19,187	21,748	22,067	21,753	19,231	20,267	19,071	16,827	17,452	17,370	15,041	13,784	13,417
Natural Gas	19,168	22,170	23,392	23,371	23,594	23,193	24,312	24,679	25,832	26,560	27,141	27,932	28,152	27,731
Petroleum	32,463	33,542	37,374	38,443	35,823	33,974	34,323	33,748	33,042	33,762	33,939	34,567	34,863	35,224
Reference (Apparent)	**68,725**	**74,013**	**81,518**	**83,885**	**80,391**	**76,424**	**77,847**	**76,423**	**75,523**	**76,192**	**76,900**	**76,114**	**75,227**	**75,189**
Coal	17,573	18,567	20,957	21,577	21,391	19,243	19,620	18,756	16,642	17,097	17,210	14,796	13,548	13,197
Natural Gas	19,276	22,274	23,484	23,441	23,666	23,277	24,409	24,778	25,924	26,637	27,225	28,011	28,236	27,843
Petroleum	31,877	33,172	37,076	38,867	35,334	33,904	33,818	32,889	32,957	32,458	32,465	33,307	33,444	34,148
Difference	**-1.4%**	**-1.2%**	**-1.2%**	**0.0%**	**-1.0%**	**0.0%**	**-1.3%**	**-1.4%**	**-0.2%**	**-2.0%**	**-2.0%**	**-1.8%**	**-2.0%**	**-1.5%**
Coal	-2.8%	-3.2%	-3.6%	-2.2%	-1.7%	0.1%	-3.2%	-1.7%	-1.1%	-2.0%	-0.9%	-1.6%	-1.7%	-1.6%
Natural Gas	0.6%	0.5%	0.4%	0.3%	0.3%	0.4%	0.4%	0.4%	0.4%	0.3%	0.3%	0.3%	0.3%	0.4%
Petroleum	-1.8%	-1.1%	-0.8%	1.1%	-1.4%	-0.2%	-1.5%	-2.5%	-0.3%	-3.9%	-4.3%	-3.6%	-4.1%	-3.1%

[a] Includes U.S. Territories. Does not include international bunker fuels.

Note: Totals may not sum due to independent rounding.

Table A-265: CO₂ Emissions from Fossil Fuel Combustion by Estimating Approach (MMT CO₂ Eq.)[a]

Approach	1990	1995	2000	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Sectoral	**4,859**	**5,166**	**5,731**	**5,873**	**5,687**	**5,297**	**5,471**	**5,337**	**5,135**	**5,281**	**5,322**	**5,178**	**5,079**	**5,045**
Coal	1,719	1,823	2,071	2,106	2,076	1,836	1,935	1,822	1,609	1,668	1,659	1,439	1,318	1,284
Natural Gas	1,006	1,164	1,227	1,231	1,243	1,221	1,277	1,297	1,357	1,397	1,427	1,469	1,479	1,458
Petroleum	2,134	2,179	2,432	2,537	2,369	2,241	2,259	2,218	2,169	2,217	2,235	2,270	2,281	2,303
Reference (Apparent)	**4,794**	**5,132**	**5,683**	**5,888**	**5,653**	**5,330**	**5,407**	**5,280**	**5,146**	**5,183**	**5,227**	**5,093**	**4,988**	**4,976**
Coal	1,654	1,756	1,988	2,053	2,036	1,831	1,867	1,789	1,586	1,628	1,640	1,411	1,289	1,251
Natural Gas	1,013	1,170	1,233	1,235	1,247	1,226	1,283	1,303	1,363	1,401	1,432	1,473	1,485	1,465
Petroleum	2,127	2,206	2,461	2,600	2,370	2,273	2,256	2,188	2,196	2,153	2,156	2,209	2,214	2,261
Difference	**-1.3%**	**-0.7%**	**-0.8%**	**0.3%**	**-0.6%**	**0.6%**	**-1.2%**	**-1.1%**	**0.2%**	**-1.9%**	**-1.8%**	**-1.6%**	**-1.8%**	**-1.4%**
Coal	-3.8%	-3.7%	-4.0%	-2.5%	-1.9%	-0.2%	-3.5%	-1.8%	-1.4%	-2.4%	-1.2%	-1.9%	-2.3%	-2.6%
Natural Gas	0.7%	0.6%	0.5%	0.3%	0.3%	0.4%	0.5%	0.5%	0.4%	0.3%	0.3%	0.3%	0.4%	0.5%
Petroleum	-0.3%	1.2%	1.2%	2.5%	0.1%	1.4%	-0.1%	-1.4%	1.3%	-2.8%	-3.5%	-2.7%	-2.9%	-1.8%

[a] Includes U.S. Territories. Does not include international bunker fuels.

Note: Totals may not sum due to independent rounding.