

1 LOIS SCHIFFER
Assistant Attorney General
2 Environment & Natural Resources Division
United States Department of Justice

3 STEVEN O'ROURKE
4 ANN HURLEY
MICHAEL McNULTY
5 ROBERT R. KLOTZ
Environmental Enforcement Section
6 Environment & Natural Resources Division
United States Department of Justice
7 P.O. Box 7611
Washington, D.C. 20044-7611
8 Telephone: (202) 514-2779

9 ALEJANDRO N. MAYORKAS
United States Attorney
10 Central District of California
LEON W. WEIDMAN
11 Chief, Civil Division
JOANNE OSINOFF
12 Assistant United States Attorney
300 North Los Angeles Street
13 Los Angeles, California 90012
Telephone: (213) 894-6880

14 Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America
15 (See next page for names of additional counsel.)

16 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
17 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
18 WESTERN DIVISION

19 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and)
20 STATE OF CALIFORNIA,)
21 Plaintiffs,)
22 v.)
23 MONTROSE CHEMICAL CORP.)
OF CALIFORNIA, et al.,)
24 Defendants.)
25

NO. CV 90-3122-R

PARTIAL CONSENT DECREE WITH
MONTROSE CHEMICAL
CORPORATION OF CALIFORNIA,
AVENTIS CROPSCIENCE USA, INC.,
CHRIS-CRAFT INDUSTRIES, INC.,
AND ATKEMIX THIRTY SEVEN,
INC. (RELATING TO OFFSHORE
MATTERS AND DEPARTMENT OF
JUSTICE COSTS)

26 AND RELATED COUNTER, CROSS,)
27 AND THIRD PARTY ACTIONS.)
28

1 **BILL LOCKYER**
Attorney General of the State of California

2
3 **J. MATTHEW RODRIQUEZ**
Assistant Attorney General

4 **JOHN A. SAURENMAN**
BRIAN W. HEMBACHER
5 **CLARA L. SLIFKIN**
Deputy Attorney General
6 300 South Spring Street
Los Angeles, California 90013
7 Telephone: (213) 897-2702; (213) 897-9442

8 Attorneys for State of California, et al.

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 **CONSENT DECREE**

2 This Consent Decree ("Decree") is made and entered into by and among the
3 United States of America ("the United States"), on behalf of the National Oceanic and
4 Atmospheric Administration ("NOAA"), the Department of the Interior ("DOI") and the
5 United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"); and the State Lands
6 Commission, the Department of Fish and Game, the Department of Parks and
7 Recreation, the Department of Toxic Substances Control ("DTSC"), the California
8 Regional Water Quality Control Board, Los Angeles Region ("Regional Board"), the
9 California Hazardous Substance Account as defined in California Health and Safety
10 Code section 25330, the California Hazardous Substance Cleanup Fund as defined in
11 California Health and Safety Code section 25385.3 and the California Toxic Substances
12 Control Account as defined in California Health and Safety Code section 25173.6
13 (hereinafter collectively referred to as the "State"); and Defendants, Counter-claimants,
14 Cross-claimants and Third-party Plaintiffs Montrose Chemical Corporation of California
15 ("Montrose"), Aventis CropScience USA Inc. (formerly known as Rhone-Poulenc Inc.)
16 ("Aventis"), Chris-Craft Industries, Inc., ("Chris-Craft") and Atkemix Thirty Seven, Inc.
17 ("Atkemix-37") (collectively, the "DDT Defendants"). This Decree is not intended to
18 affect in any way the United States' and the State's claims against any entity other than
19 the Released Parties (as defined below).

20 **INTRODUCTION**

21 A. The United States, on behalf of NOAA and DOI in their capacities as
22 natural resource trustees (hereafter the "Federal Trustees"), and on behalf of EPA, and
23 the State, on behalf of the State Lands Commission, the Department of Fish and Game
24 and the Department of Parks and Recreation in their capacities as natural resource
25 trustees (hereafter the "State Trustees") (the Federal Trustees and State Trustees
26 collectively are referred to as "the Trustees"), filed the original complaint in this action
27 on June 18, 1990, under Section 107 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response,
28 Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, as amended ("CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. § 9607,

1 seeking, inter alia, recovery of damages, including damage assessment costs and related
2 response costs, for injury to, destruction of, and loss of natural resources resulting from
3 releases of hazardous substances, specifically including dichlorodiphenyltrichloroethane
4 and its metabolites (hereafter collectively "DDT"), and polychlorinated biphenyls
5 (hereafter "PCBs"), from facilities in and around Los Angeles, California, into the
6 environment, and for response costs incurred and for declaratory judgment for response
7 costs to be incurred by EPA in connection with releases of hazardous substances into the
8 environment at and from the Montrose Chemical Corporation Plant Property located at
9 20201 South Normandie Avenue, Los Angeles, California. The original complaint was
10 amended on June 28, 1990, again on August 16, 1991, and again on December 8, 1999
11 ("Third Amended Complaint").

12 B. In the First Claim for Relief of the complaints, the United States and the
13 State assert a claim against ten defendants, including the four DDT Defendants, under
14 Section 107(a)(1-4)(C) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a)(1-4)(C), for alleged natural
15 resource damages, including damage assessment costs and related response costs. The
16 complaints allege that the DDT Defendants are and/or were owners and/or operators of
17 the Montrose DDT manufacturing and formulation plant at 20201 Normandie Avenue,
18 Los Angeles, California. The complaints further allege, among other things, that the
19 Montrose Plant discharged wastewater containing hazardous substances, including DDT,
20 into the County Sanitation District No. 2 of Los Angeles County ("LACSD") and the
21 collection system that conveys wastewater to the Joint Water Pollution Control Plant
22 ("JWPCP") through the White's Point Outfall into the San Pedro Channel, that Montrose
23 engaged in direct ocean dumping of DDT-containing wastes, and that DDT discharged
24 into the air from the Montrose Plant Property (as defined herein) was deposited at Los
25 Angeles and Long Beach Harbors and the San Pedro Channel, and that such discharges
26 caused injury to natural resources.

27 C. In the Second Claim for Relief of the complaints, the United States and
28 DTSC assert a claim for recovery of costs incurred and declaratory judgment for costs to

1 be incurred by EPA and DTSC in response to the release or threatened release of
2 hazardous substances into the environment at and/or from the Montrose Plant Property
3 (as defined herein) pursuant to Section 107(a)(1-4)(A) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §
4 9607(a)(1-4)(A). The Third Amended Complaint specified that the second claim
5 included costs incurred and declaratory judgment for costs to be incurred by EPA and
6 DTSC in connection with, among other things, the White's Point Outfall leading to the
7 San Pedro Channel, the Palos Verdes shelf, the Consolidated Slip, and the ocean dump
8 sites used for disposal of Montrose waste.

9 D. In 1990 and 1991, the DDT Defendants answered the original complaint,
10 counterclaimed against the Plaintiffs, cross-claimed against co-defendant LACSD and
11 filed third party complaints against the City of Los Angeles and approximately 150 other
12 local governmental entities who have since settled with the United States and the State
13 (collectively, the "Settling Local Governmental Entities" or "SLGEs"). The District
14 Court's approval of such settlements is the subject of a pending appeal by the DDT
15 Defendants.

16 E. On April 24, 2000, the Court entered an order granting Plaintiffs' Motion
17 for Partial Summary Judgment holding Montrose, Atkemix-37, and Aventis liable under
18 CERCLA Section 107 for past and future response costs not inconsistent with the
19 National Contingency Plan related to portions of the Onshore Areas (as defined herein).

20 F. On September 20, 2000, the Court entered an order granting Plaintiffs'
21 Motion for Partial Summary Judgment holding Montrose and Aventis liable under
22 CERCLA Section 107 for past and future response costs not inconsistent with the
23 National Contingency Plan related to the Palos Verdes shelf.

24 G. Pursuant to a Partial Consent Decree that was entered by the Court on
25 October 20, 2000, the DDT Defendants have already paid \$5.125 million as
26 reimbursement and settlement of claims for past response costs incurred by the United
27 States and DTSC as defined therein. In addition, Montrose previously paid
28

1 \$1,354,612.37 as reimbursement of past response costs incurred by the United States
2 with respect to portions of the Onshore Areas.

3 H. Plaintiffs have previously settled with all other parties, including the
4 SLGEs, CBS Corporation, and Potlatch/Simpson, for natural resource damages and
5 response costs.

6 I. Trial in this action between Plaintiffs and the DDT Defendants commenced
7 on October 17, 2000.

8 J. Subject to the reservations and re-openers in this Decree, this Decree
9 finally and fully resolves all present and future liability of the Released Parties to the
10 United States on behalf of the Federal Trustees, and the State on behalf of the State
11 Trustees, for Natural Resource Damages (as defined herein). Subject to the reservations
12 and re-openers in this Decree, this Decree finally and fully resolves all present and future
13 liability of the Released Parties to the United States (including EPA) and DTSC and the
14 Regional Board for Response Costs and for DOJ Costs (as those terms are defined
15 herein). The Released Parties also receive contribution protection for all matters
16 addressed herein.

17 K. This Consent Decree does not resolve the Released Parties' liability to EPA
18 or DTSC for any matter related to the Onshore Areas (except DOJ Costs). EPA has not
19 selected final remedies for portions of the Onshore Areas, including: the neighborhoods,
20 the DNAPL, the storm water pathway, and on-property and near-property soils.

21 L. On August 21, 1997, EPA provided notice of its rulemaking proposing to
22 amend the Montrose Chemical NPL listing to include the effluent-affected DDT and
23 PCB contaminated sediments on the Palos Verdes shelf. See 62 Fed. Reg. 44430,
24 August 21, 1997. The DDT Defendants submitted written comments to that proposed
25 rulemaking, through their counsel, on October 16, 1997. The United States believes that
26 the DDT and PCB contaminated sediments are already included as part of the Montrose
27 Chemical NPL Site but has agreed to take no action relying on that position until the
28

1 above-noted rulemaking is concluded. No action taken by the United States in that
2 rulemaking shall affect the covenants not to sue contained in this Decree.

3 M. EPA is conducting the Palos Verdes shelf investigation under the authority
4 of CERCLA to determine the nature and extent of contamination of the Palos Verdes
5 shelf, to assess effects of the contamination on the environment and human health, and to
6 determine whether to select response actions, if any, to address the contamination.
7 Subject to the reservations and re-openers in this Decree, this Decree resolves the
8 Released Parties' potential liability for any costs associated with such response actions.

9 N. EPA has investigated a broad range of response alternatives for the Palos
10 Verdes shelf. EPA ultimately decided to focus its investigations on the no action,
11 institutional controls and in-place capping alternatives. In March 2000, EPA proposed
12 an institutional controls program for public comment. EPA is also continuing to evaluate
13 capping as a potential response action for the Palos Verdes shelf. Subject to the
14 reservations and re-openers in this Decree, this Decree resolves the Released Parties'
15 potential liability for any costs associated with such response actions.

16 O. The Trustees will use all damages to (1) reimburse past and future Damage
17 Assessment Costs, and (2) restore, replace, or acquire the equivalent of the injured
18 natural resources and/or the services provided by such resources. The Trustees will use
19 the damages for restoration of injured natural resources, including bald eagles, peregrine
20 falcons and other marine birds, fish and the habitats upon which they depend, as well as
21 providing for implementation of restoration projects intended to compensate the public
22 for lost use of natural resources. The Trustees will undertake a restoration planning
23 process to determine which restoration projects will most effectively restore the injured
24 resources as well as compensate for lost use of those resources. The details for specific
25 projects will be contained in a draft restoration plan. A final restoration plan will be
26 prepared and implemented by the Trustees after providing public notice, opportunity for
27 public input and consideration of public comments.

28

1 P. The United States and the State also have agreed on an allocation of the
2 settlement amount between EPA/DTSC Response Costs and the Trustees' damage
3 assessment costs and Natural Resource Damages. The United States and the State have
4 agreed that the DDT Defendants shall pay a total of \$30 million to the Trustees to resolve
5 any potential liability of Released Parties for Natural Resource Damages and shall pay a
6 total of \$43 million to EPA and DTSC to resolve any potential liability of the Released
7 Parties for Response Costs. None of the settlement amount nor any of the interest earned
8 thereon shall be used for or credited to the Onshore Areas. As specified in Paragraph
9 11.C, the United States and the State have agreed that, under certain conditions, \$10
10 million of this \$43 million may be used either (1) by DTSC for response actions or (2) by
11 the Trustees for natural resource restoration.

12 Q. This settlement is made in good faith after arm's-length negotiations
13 conducted under the supervision of Special Master John Francis Carroll. The United
14 States, State of California, and DDT Defendants agree, and this Court by entering this
15 Consent Decree finds, that this Consent Decree has been negotiated by the Parties in
16 good faith, that settlement of this matter and entry of this Decree will avoid further
17 complicated litigation between the Parties, is the most appropriate means to resolve the
18 matters covered herein, and is fair, reasonable and in the public interest.

19 **NOW, THEREFORE**, with the consent of the Parties to this Decree, it is hereby
20 **ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

21 **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

22 1. This Court has personal jurisdiction over the Parties. This Court has
23 personal jurisdiction over the non-DDT-Defendant Released Parties, which submit to this
24 Court's jurisdiction for purposes related to implementation of this Consent Decree. This
25 Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action and the Parties to this Decree
26 pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1345, 1651 and 1367, and Sections 106, 107 and 113(b)
27 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606, 9607 and 9613(b), and the principles of supplemental
28 jurisdiction. The Parties and the Released Parties waive all objections and defenses that

1 they may have to jurisdiction of the Court or to venue in this District and to service of
2 process. The Released Parties consent to and shall not challenge entry of this Consent
3 Decree or this Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent Decree.

4 **APPLICABILITY OF DECREE**

5 2. The provisions of this Decree, including the covenants not to sue and
6 contribution protection, shall be binding on, apply to, and inure to the benefit of the
7 United States, the State, the DDT Defendants and their successors and assigns, and for
8 the purposes of Paragraphs 8 through 10, 12 through 15, and 27, the Released Parties,
9 their successors and assigns. No change in the ownership or organizational form or
10 status of the Released Parties shall affect their rights or obligations under this Decree.

11 **EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/ENTRY OF JUDGMENT**

12 3. This Decree was negotiated and executed by the Parties hereto in good
13 faith at arm's length to avoid the continuation of expensive and protracted litigation and
14 is a fair and equitable settlement of claims which were vigorously contested. The DDT
15 Defendants do not admit any of Plaintiffs' allegations or claims set forth herein and deny
16 any liability whatsoever for Plaintiffs' claims against the DDT Defendants set forth in the
17 complaints. The Released Parties do not admit that any area other than the Montrose
18 Plant Property has been impacted by hazardous substance releases from the Montrose
19 Plant Property. This Decree should not constitute or be interpreted, construed or used as
20 evidence of any admission of liability, law or fact. Except as otherwise provided in the
21 Federal Rules of Evidence, this Consent Decree is not admissible in evidence against any
22 Party by any person or entity not a Party to the Decree in any judicial or administrative
23 proceeding.

24 4. Upon approval and entry of this Decree by the Court, this Decree shall
25 constitute a final judgment between and among the United States and the State, and the
26 DDT Defendants regarding the matters addressed and resolved by this Decree.

27
28

1 **DEFINITIONS**

2 5. This Decree incorporates the definitions set forth in Section 101 of
3 CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601, including but not limited to the definitions of the terms
4 “release” and “response.” In addition, whenever the following terms are used in this
5 Decree, they shall have the following meanings:

6 A. "Damage Assessment Costs" shall mean all costs associated with the
7 planning, design, implementation and oversight of the Trustees' damage assessment
8 process, which addresses the extent and quantification of the injury to, destruction of or
9 loss of natural resources and the services provided by these resources resulting from
10 releases of hazardous substances alleged in the First Claim for Relief of the complaints,
11 and with the planning of restoration or replacement of such natural resources and the
12 services provided by those resources, or the planning of the acquisition of equivalent
13 resources or services, and any other costs necessary to carry out the Trustees'
14 responsibilities with respect to those natural resources, including all related enforcement
15 costs, including without limitation all costs and interest thereon identified in the expert
16 reports submitted in this action by Plaintiffs' expert Wiley Wright, C.P.A.

17 B. “Date of Entry of this Decree” shall mean the date on which the District
18 Court has approved and entered this Decree as a judgment.

19 C. “Date of Final Approval of this Decree” shall mean the later of (1) the date
20 on which the District Court has approved and entered this Decree as a judgment and all
21 applicable appeal periods have expired without an appeal being filed, or (2) if an appeal
22 is taken, the date on which the District Court’s judgment is affirmed and there is no
23 further right to appellate review. However, if no party appears in District Court to
24 oppose entry of this Decree, then the Date of Final Approval of this Decree shall mean
25 the Date of Entry of this Decree.

26 D. “Date of Lodging of this Decree” shall mean the date that this Decree is
27 lodged, or a copy of it is filed, with the Court.

28

1 E. "DOJ Costs" means costs incurred by or through the United States
2 Department of Justice ("DOJ") in this action; however, the term "DOJ Costs" does not
3 include 1) any costs incurred to enforce this Decree, 2) any response costs that may be
4 incurred by or through DOJ with respect to Onshore Areas after the Date of Entry of this
5 Decree or 3) any response costs that may be incurred by or through DOJ with respect to
6 proceedings initiated under Paragraphs 9 or 14 of this Decree.

7 F. "Montrose Plant Property" shall mean for purposes of this Decree the
8 thirteen (13) acre parcel at 20201 South Normandie Avenue, Los Angeles, California at
9 which, among other things, Montrose Chemical Corporation of California operated a
10 DDT manufacturing and, later, a formulation plant.

11 G. "Natural Resource Damages" shall mean damages, including loss of use,
12 restoration costs, resource replacement costs or equivalent resource values, Damage
13 Assessment Costs, and any other costs that have been incurred in the past or will be
14 incurred in the future by the Trustees or any other person pursuant to Trustee approval,
15 authorization or direction, with respect to injury to, destruction of, or loss of any and all
16 natural resources in and around the Offshore Areas.

17 H. "Offshore Areas" for purposes of this Decree shall mean all of the
18 following areas to which hazardous substances, including without limitation DDT,
19 originating from the Montrose Plant Property or the Stauffer Dominguez Plant Property
20 have or may come to be located: the areas in and around Santa Catalina and the other
21 Channel Islands, the Palos Verdes shelf including the Palos Verdes Slope, the San Pedro
22 Channel, the White's Point Outfall, the Long Beach Harbor and the Los Angeles Harbor
23 (excluding Consolidated Slip as defined in Paragraph 5.I below), Santa Monica Bay and
24 San Pedro Bay, those offshore areas described in the February 6, 1990 draft Damage
25 Assessment Plan and/or the March 8, 1991 draft Injury Determination Plan published by
26 the Trustees (excluding Consolidated Slip as defined in Paragraph 5.I below), any ocean
27 dumpsites used for disposing of wastes from the Montrose Plant Property and any
28 offshore areas to which hazardous substances, including without limitation DDT, aurally

1 or otherwise originating from the Montrose Plant Property or the Stauffer Dominguez
2 Plant Property have or may come to be located.

3 I. "Onshore Areas," for purposes of this Consent Decree only, shall mean the
4 Montrose Plant Property and the areas that EPA or DTSC has investigated or may
5 investigate in the future (excluding Offshore Areas, as defined above) because EPA or
6 DTSC believes that hazardous substances may have come to be located there from the
7 Montrose Plant Property, including, without limitation, the following: the real property
8 located at 1401 West Del Amo Blvd., Los Angeles, California and owned by Jones Inc;
9 groundwater contaminated by hazardous substances at or emanating from the Montrose
10 Plant Property; those portions of the Normandie Avenue Ditch adjacent to and south of
11 20201 Normandie Avenue; the Kenwood Drain; the Torrance Lateral; the Dominguez
12 Channel (from Laguna Dominguez to the Consolidated Slip); the LACSD J.O. "D"
13 sewer from manholes D33 to D 5 (approximately Francisco St. to 234th St.); the LACSD
14 District 5 Interceptor sewer from manholes A475 to A442 (approximately Francisco St.
15 to Sepulveda Blvd.); the real property on which the sewer rights-of-way are located for
16 those portions of the District 5 Interceptor and J.O. "D" sewer identified above; the real
17 property burdened by the adjacent railroad rights-of-way for those portions of the District
18 5 Interceptor and J.O. "D" sewers identified above; the area bounded by Del Amo Blvd.,
19 Western Ave., Torrance Blvd. and Normandie Ave.; the area bounded by Normandie
20 Ave., Del Amo Blvd., Vermont Ave., and Torrance Blvd; and the portion of the Los
21 Angeles Harbor known as the Consolidated Slip from the mouth of the Dominguez
22 Channel south to but not extending beyond Pier 200B and 200Y.

23 J. "Parties" shall mean the United States, the State, and the DDT Defendants.

24 K. "Released Parties" shall mean the DDT Defendants, their predecessor or
25 successor entities, and direct or indirect parents or subsidiaries, to the extent of any
26 derivative liability attributable to any such entities, and further includes any of such
27 entities' current or former officers, directors, and employees, provided and to the extent
28 that any such individuals were acting within the scope of their duties and in their capacity

1 as officers, directors, or employees; and, for the purposes of Paragraphs 8, 9, 10, and 12,
2 13, 14, 15, and 27, "Released Parties" includes Stauffer Management Company, Imperial
3 Chemical Industries PLC, ICI International Investments, Inc., Zeneca Inc., Zeneca
4 Holdings, Inc., Stauffer Chemical Company (a former corporation organized under the
5 laws of the State of Delaware), Rhodia Inc., Aventis CropScience USA LP, together with
6 their predecessor or successor entities, and direct or indirect parents or subsidiaries, to
7 the extent of any derivative liability attributable to any such entities, and further includes
8 any of such entities' current or former officers, directors, and employees, provided and to
9 the extent that any such individuals were acting within the scope of their duties and in
10 their capacity as officers, directors, or employees.

11 L. "Response Costs" shall mean for purposes of this Decree all costs of
12 response as provided in Section 107(a)(1-4)(A), (B) and (D) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §
13 9607(a)(1-4)(A), (B) and (D), and as defined in Section 101(25) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C.
14 § 9601(25), that the United States (including EPA), or the State (including DTSC or the
15 Regional Board), or any other person have incurred in the past or will incur in the future
16 with respect to the Offshore Areas.

17 M. "Stauffer Dominguez Plant Property" shall mean that real property located
18 at 20720 South Wilmington Avenue, Dominguez, California and formerly occupied by
19 Stauffer Chemical Company.

20 N. "United States" shall mean the United States of America, including its
21 departments, agencies and instrumentalities.

22 **DDT DEFENDANTS' PAYMENT;**

23 **ESTABLISHMENT OF ESCROW ACCOUNT**

24 6 A. The DDT Defendants shall pay to Plaintiffs \$73 million plus any interest
25 earned on that amount in the Escrow (as defined below).

26 B. Within ten (10) business days of the Date of Lodging of this Decree, the
27 DDT Defendants shall create an escrow account (the "Escrow") bearing interest on
28 commercially reasonable terms, in a federally-chartered bank with an office in the State

1 of California, and pay into the Escrow a total sum of \$50 million (the “First Escrowed
2 Settlement Amount”). The DDT Defendants shall bear all costs of establishing and
3 maintaining the Escrow. The DDT Defendants shall notify Plaintiffs in writing of the
4 creation and funding of the Escrow immediately after the above payment has been made,
5 and provide on request all documentation concerning the account, including any
6 agreements concerning the determination of interest rates.

7 C. On or before May 1, 2001, the DDT Defendants shall pay an additional \$23
8 million into the Escrow (the “Second Escrowed Settlement Amount”).

9 D. The First and Second Escrowed Settlement Amounts paid into the Escrow
10 shall remain in the Escrow and may not be withdrawn except to make the payments
11 required by Paragraph 7 and/or 11 of this Decree or unless a final judicial determination
12 by the District Court is made that entry of this Decree will not be approved and all
13 applicable appeal periods have expired without an appeal, or if an appeal is taken, the
14 date on which the District Court spreads the mandate issued by the appellate court not
15 approving the Decree. In the event that final judicial approval is not obtained, the
16 settlement amount paid into the Escrow and all accrued interest shall be returned to the
17 DDT Defendants.

18 **NATURAL RESOURCE DAMAGES PAYMENTS**

19 7. A. Within ten (10) business days after the Date of Final Approval of this
20 Decree, or on May 11, 2001, whichever date is later, the DDT Defendants shall make a
21 payment of the sum of \$30 million from the Escrow account together with a proportional
22 share of accrued interest to the Department of the Interior, on behalf of the State Trustees
23 and the Federal Trustees, by Electronic Funds Transfer (“EFT”) in accordance with
24 instructions to be provided to the DDT Defendants by the Trustees. Transmittal letters
25 indicating that the EFT and escrow and payment disbursements have occurred shall be
26 sent to the Parties in accordance with Paragraph 29 of this Decree and to:

27 Charles McKinley, Esq.
28 Office of the Solicitor
U.S. Department of the Interior
600 Harrison Street, Suite 545

1 San Francisco, CA 94197-1373

2 and

3 Bruce Nesslage
4 DOI Restoration Fund Manager
5 1849 "C" Street, N.W.
6 Mail Stop 4449
7 Washington, D.C. 20240

8 The EFT and transmittal letters shall reflect that the payment is being made to the
9 "Natural Resources Damage Assessment and Restoration Fund, Account No. 14X5198."

10 The Department of the Interior will assign these funds a special project number to allow
11 the funds to be maintained as a segregated account within the Department of the Interior
12 Natural Resource Damage Assessment and Restoration Fund (the "Montrose NRD
13 Account").

14 B. The Department of the Interior shall, in accordance with law, manage and
15 invest funds in the Montrose NRD Account. Any return on investments or interest
16 accrued on the Account shall be used by the Natural Resource Trustees to address
17 injuries to natural resources caused by releases of hazardous substances at or from the
18 Montrose Plant Property. The Department of the Interior shall not make any charge
19 against the Montrose NRD Account for any investment or management services
20 provided.

21 C. The Department of the Interior shall hold all funds in the Montrose NRD
22 Account, including return on investments or accrued interest, subject to the provisions of
23 this Decree and any memorandum of understanding entered into by the Natural Resource
24 Trustees. The Natural Resource Trustees retain the ultimate authority and responsibility
25 to use funds received for Natural Resource Damages in accordance with the provisions
26 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9601, et seq., this Decree, and other relevant federal and state
27 law governing use of recoveries for Natural Resource Damages to address those injured
28 resources described in the Introduction.

COVENANTS NOT TO SUE FOR NATURAL RESOURCE DAMAGES

1 8. Except as specifically provided in Paragraphs 9 and 10 of this Decree, the
2 United States, the State, and agencies or instrumentalities thereof, each hereby covenants
3 not to sue or to take any other civil or administrative action against the Released Parties
4 for any and all civil or administrative liability to the United States, the State, and
5 agencies or instrumentalities thereof, for Natural Resource Damages under CERCLA, 42
6 U.S.C. §§ 9601, et seq., or under any other federal, state or common law.

7 **RESERVATION OF RIGHTS FOR NATURAL RESOURCE DAMAGES**

8 9. A. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Decree, the Trustees
9 reserve the right to institute proceedings against the Released Parties in this action or in a
10 new action seeking recovery of Natural Resource Damages, based on (1) injury to,
11 destruction of, or loss of natural resources resulting from conditions which were
12 unknown to the Trustees on the Date of Lodging of this Decree ("Unknown
13 Conditions"); or (2) information received by the Trustees after the Date of Lodging of
14 this Decree which indicates there is injury to, destruction of, or loss of natural resources,
15 of a type unknown to the Trustees as of the Date of Lodging of this Decree ("New
16 Information")

17 B. Each of the following shall not be considered to be Unknown Conditions
18 or New Information within the meaning of Paragraph 9.A (1) or (2): (1) an increase
19 solely in the Trustees' assessment of the magnitude of the injury, destruction or loss to
20 natural resources, or in the estimated or actual Natural Resource Damages; (2) a
21 determination by the Trustees that a previously identified natural resource injury was
22 caused by any DDT Defendant's release of a hazardous substance, including hazardous
23 substances other than PCBs or DDT; or (3) any Natural Resource Damages arising from
24 any re-exposure or resuspension on the Offshore Areas of the DDT- or PCB-
25 contaminated sediments currently located there, including but not limited to, such re-
26 exposure or resuspension of sediments resulting from:

27 (a) LACSD's sampling activities (by coring, trawling or otherwise);

28

1 (b) LACSD's institution of full secondary treatment of wastewater at the
2 JWPCP and the discharge of such wastewater through the White's Point
3 Outfall;

4 (c) any response activity or similar activity performed by or at the direction of
5 any Federal or State governmental body or any other person;

6 (d) any act of God; or

7 (e) an earthquake.

8 C. The Released Parties reserve their right to contest any claims allowed by
9 Paragraph 9.A of this Decree, and the Released Parties do not by consenting to this
10 Decree waive any defenses to such claims, except that the Released Parties covenant not
11 to assert, and may not maintain, any defense based upon principles of waiver, res
12 judicata, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim splitting, or other defense based upon
13 the contention that the claims that are allowed by Paragraph 9.A of this Decree were or
14 should have been brought in the instant case. In the event that the Trustees institute
15 proceedings under Paragraph 9.A of this Decree, the Released Parties reserve the right to
16 assert potential cross-claims, counterclaims or third party claims against the United States
17 or the State, or any employee, officer, agency or instrumentality thereof, relating solely to
18 such claims asserted by the Trustees pursuant to Paragraph 9.A. Nothing in this Decree
19 shall be deemed to constitute preauthorization of a claim within the meaning of Section
20 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611.

21 D. In addition to defenses that may be asserted by Released Parties pursuant to
22 Paragraph 9.C above, and a defense that a future release of hazardous substances now
23 present in the sediments of the Offshore Areas was the result of conditions or
24 information known to the Trustees on the Date of Lodging of this Decree, the Released
25 Parties will not be liable for Natural Resource Damages arising from a future release of
26 hazardous substances now present in the sediments of the Offshore Areas, including but
27 not limited to any release resulting from: (1) LACSD's sampling activities (by coring,
28 trawling, or otherwise); (2) LACSD's institution of full secondary treatment of

1 wastewater at the JWPCP and the discharge of such wastewater through the White's
2 Point Outfall; (3) any response activity or similar activity performed by or at the direction
3 of any Federal or State governmental body or any other person; (4) any act of God; or (5)
4 an earthquake.

5 10. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Decree, the covenants not to
6 sue in Paragraph 8 shall apply only to matters addressed in Paragraph 8 and specifically
7 shall not apply to the following claims:

8 A. claims based on a failure by the DDT Defendants to satisfy the
9 requirements of this Decree;

10 B. claims for criminal liability; and

11 C. claims arising from the past, present or future disposal, release or threat of
12 release of hazardous substances that do not involve the Offshore Areas.

13 **PAYMENTS WITH RESPECT TO RESPONSE ACTIVITIES**

14 11. A. Within ten (10) business days after the Date of Final Approval of this
15 Decree, or on May 11, 2001, whichever date is later, the DDT Defendants shall pay to
16 EPA the sum of \$33 million from the Escrow account together with a proportional share
17 of the accrued interest. The DDT Defendants shall make this payment to “the United
18 States Environmental Protection Agency, Montrose Chemical National Priorities List
19 Superfund Site-Palos Verdes Shelf Operable Unit Special Account.” The payment to
20 EPA shall be made by Electronic Funds Transfer ("EFT" or "wire transfer") in
21 accordance with instructions provided by the United States to the DDT Defendants at the
22 time of Lodging of the Decree. Any EFT received after 11:00 A.M. (Eastern Time) will
23 be credited on the next business day. The DDT Defendants shall send notice of the EFT
24 to Plaintiffs as provided in Paragraph 29 of this Decree. All payments to the United
25 States under this Paragraph shall reference the Montrose Chemical Corporation of
26 California Superfund Site, Site # 9T26, DOJ Case # 90-11-3-511, and U.S.A.F.I. file
27 number 9003085. The amounts paid to EPA pursuant to this Consent Decree and
28 deposited into the above-referenced EPA special account shall be retained and used to

1 conduct or finance response actions at or in connection with the Palos Verdes shelf, or
2 transferred by EPA to the Hazardous Substance Superfund.

3 B. Within ten (10) business days after the Date of Final Approval of this
4 Decree, or on May 11, 2001, whichever date is later, the DDT Defendants shall make a
5 payment of \$10 million from the Escrow (together with a proportional share of the
6 accrued interest) into a Court Registry Account (“the Court Registry Account”). The
7 payment shall be made by certified or bank check payable to “Clerk, United States
8 District Court.” The check shall include on its face a statement that it is a payment in
9 Civil Action NO. CV 90-3122-R (C.D. Cal.) and shall be sent to:

10 Office of the Clerk
11 United States District Court for the
12 Central District of California
312 North Spring Street
Los Angeles, CA 90012-4793.

13 The DDT Defendants shall send notice of this payment to Plaintiffs as provided in
14 Paragraph 29 of this Decree. The Registry of Court shall administer the amount
15 transferred by the DDT Defendants in an interest bearing account as provided in the
16 Order Directing the Deposit of Settlement Amounts Into the Registry of Court (“Deposit
17 Order”) issued by this Court pursuant to Rule 67 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure,
18 28 U.S.C. Section 2041, and Local Rule 22 of the Local Rules for the Central District of
19 California. The Deposit Order shall be lodged concurrently with the lodging of this
20 Decree and shall be entered by the Court at the time of entry of this Decree. All funds
21 and all interest accrued thereon in the Court Registry Account shall be held in the name
22 of the “Clerk, United States District Court” for the benefit of the United States and State.
23 Upon joint application by the United States and the State and upon order of this Court,
24 monies in the Court Registry Account shall be disbursed consistent with Paragraph 11.C
25 below.

26 C. In the event EPA selects an in-situ remedial action for the Palos Verdes Shelf
27 (e.g. capping, dredging or biological treatment) and if the Record of Decision includes an
28 operation and maintenance requirement, then all funds retained in the Court Registry

1 Account (established under Paragraph 11.B above), including interest, shall be paid from
2 the Court Registry Account to DTSC for the State's use in implementing operation and
3 maintenance actions with respect to such in-situ remedial action. Or in the event EPA
4 makes a response action selection determination to not select any in-situ response action
5 (either in a Record of Decision which would not require operation and maintenance or in
6 a Removal Action Memorandum), then all funds retained in the Court Registry Account
7 (established under Paragraph 11.B above), including interest, shall be paid from the
8 Court Registry Account to the Trustees. Otherwise, the funds shall be paid from the
9 Court Registry Account (established under Paragraph 11.B above), including interest, to
10 the United States Environmental Protection Agency, Montrose Chemical National
11 Priorities List Superfund Site-Palos Verdes Shelf Operable Unit Special Account to be
12 used by EPA as specified in Paragraph 11.A. above.

13 **COVENANT NOT TO SUE FOR**
14 **RESPONSE ACTIVITIES AND COSTS RELATING TO THE OFFSHORE**
15 **AREAS AND RESERVATION OF RIGHTS**

16 12. Except as specifically provided in Paragraphs 13 and 14 of this Decree, the
17 United States, the State, and agencies and instrumentalities thereof, each hereby
18 covenants not to sue or to take any other civil or administrative action against the
19 Released Parties to compel response activities relating to the Offshore Areas, to recover
20 DOJ Costs, or to recover Response Costs, including but not limited to, costs for studies
21 and evaluations of the area covered by response activities under CERCLA Sections 106
22 and 107, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606 and 9607, or pursuant to the California Hazardous
23 Substance Account Act, California Health and Safety Code §§ 25300, *et seq.*, or any
24 other state statute or state common law. In addition, the United States, the State, and
25 agencies and instrumentalities thereof, each hereby covenants not to sue or take
26 administrative action against the Released Parties to compel response activities with
27 respect to the Offshore Areas, recover DOJ Costs, or recover Response Costs under the
28 Resource Conservation and Recovery Act ("RCRA") Sections 3008(h), 3013, or 7003,

1 42 U.S.C. §§ 6928(h), 6934, or 6973, or California Health and Safety Code § 25187.
2 The State, and agencies and instrumentalities thereof, each hereby further covenants not
3 to sue or take administrative action against the Released Parties to compel response
4 activities with respect to the Offshore Areas or to recover Response Costs under Section
5 7002 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6972.

6 13. The covenants set forth in Paragraph 12 pertain only to matters expressly
7 specified therein, and extend only to the Released Parties. Any claim or defense which
8 the United States or the State has against any other person or entity is expressly reserved.
9 The United States and the State reserve, and this Decree is without prejudice to, all other
10 rights and claims against Released Parties with respect to all other matters, including but
11 not limited to, the following:

- 12 A. any and all claims against the DDT Defendants based upon or resulting
13 from a failure to meet a requirement of this Decree;
- 14 B. claims for criminal liability;
- 15 C. claims for violations of any other federal or state law;
- 16 D. claims arising from the presence of a hazardous substance at any location
17 outside of the Offshore Areas (as defined herein), including but not limited to the
18 Onshore Areas (as defined herein), the Stauffer Dominguez Plant Property and the
19 proposed Del Amo NPL Site, as it may be defined by EPA.

20 14. A. In addition to the reservations set out in Paragraph 13, the United
21 States and the State reserve, and this Decree is without prejudice to, the right to institute
22 proceedings in this action or in a new action seeking to compel the Released Parties to
23 take a response action or reimburse the United States or the State for additional Response
24 Costs if, subsequent to the Date of Lodging of this Decree, the United States or the State:

- 25 1. receives, in whole or in part, information unknown to EPA, DTSC
26 or the Regional Board as of the Date of Lodging of this Decree, indicating that after the
27 Date of Lodging of this Decree one or more of the Released Parties released one or more
28 hazardous substances that come to be located at the Offshore Areas, and that EPA, DTSC

1 or the Regional Board determines may be a threat to human health or the environment,
2 provided that the foregoing shall not be deemed to apply to any re-exposure or
3 resuspension on the Offshore Areas of the DDT- or PCB-contaminated sediments
4 currently located there; including but not limited to, such re-exposure or resuspension of
5 sediments resulting from:

- 6 (a) LACSD's sampling activities (by coring, trawling or otherwise);
- 7 (b) LACSD's institution of full secondary treatment of wastewater at the
8 JWPCP and the discharge of such wastewater through the White's Point
9 Outfall;
- 10 (c) any response activity or similar activity performed by or at the direction of
11 any Federal or State governmental body or any other person;
- 12 (d) any act of God; or
- 13 (e) an earthquake.

14 2. discovers a condition at the Offshore Areas, that EPA, DTSC or the
15 Regional Board determines may be a threat to human health or welfare or the
16 environment, and that was unknown to EPA, DTSC or the Regional Board prior to the
17 Date of Lodging of this Decree.

18 B. The DDT Defendants reserve their right to contest any claims allowed by
19 Paragraphs 14.A.1 or 14.A.2 of this Decree, and the DDT Defendants do not by
20 consenting to this Decree waive any defenses to such claims, except that the DDT
21 Defendants covenant not to assert, and may not maintain, any defense based upon
22 principles of waiver, res judicata, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim splitting or
23 other defense based upon the contention that the claims that are allowed by Paragraphs
24 14.A.1. or 14.A.2 of this Decree were or should have been brought in the instant case. In
25 the event that the United States or the State institutes proceedings under Paragraphs
26 14.A.1 or 14.A.2 of this Decree, the DDT Defendants reserve the right to assert potential
27 cross-claims, counterclaims or third party claims against the United States, the State, or
28 any employee, officer, agency or instrumentality thereof, relating to such claims asserted

1 by the United States or the State, and the agencies or instrumentalities thereof. Nothing
2 in this Decree shall be deemed to constitute preauthorization of a claim within the
3 meaning of Section 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611, or 40 C.F.R. § 300.700 (d).

4 **COVENANTS BY RELEASED PARTIES**

5 15. A. Subject to Paragraph 9.C, the Released Parties hereby covenant not to
6 sue or to assert any civil or administrative claim or cause of action against the United
7 States, or any employee, officer, agency or instrumentality thereof, and/or against the
8 State, or any employee, officer, agency or instrumentality thereof (but not including
9 counties, cities, local governmental entities or sanitation districts), for any matters
10 relating to Natural Resource Damages including, but not limited to, the counterclaims
11 asserted in the DDT Defendants' answer to any of the complaints in this action, claims
12 arising pursuant to any other federal law, state law or common law, including, but not
13 limited to, any direct or indirect claim pursuant to Section 112 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §
14 9612, against the Hazardous Substance Superfund, any claim pursuant to Section 113(f)
15 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f), for contribution, any claim pursuant to the Federal
16 Tort Claims Act, 28 U.S.C. §§ 1346(b) and 2671, et seq., or any claim arising from any
17 express or implied contract pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1346(a)(2) or 28 U.S.C. §
18 1491(a)(1).

19 B. Subject to Paragraph 14.B, the Released Parties hereby covenant not to sue
20 and agree not to assert any civil or administrative claim or cause of action against the
21 United States, or any employee, officer, agency or instrumentality thereof, and/or the
22 State, or any employee, officer, agency or instrumentality thereof (but not including
23 counties, cities, local governmental entities or sanitation districts) with respect to the
24 Offshore Areas or this Decree, including but not limited to (1) any direct or indirect
25 claim for reimbursement from the Hazardous Substance Superfund established pursuant
26 to 26 U.S.C. § 9507, under CERCLA Sections 106(b)(2), 111, 112 or 113, 42 U.S.C. §§
27 9606(b)(2), 9611, 9612 or 9613, any claim pursuant to the Federal Tort Claims Act, 28
28 U.S.C. §§ 1346(b) and 2671 et seq., or any claim arising from any express or implied

1 contract pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1346(a)(2) or 28 U.S.C. § 1491(a)(1), or any claim
2 pursuant to the California Hazardous Substance Account Act, California Health and
3 Safety Code §§ 25300, et seq., or under any other provision of law; (2) any claim with
4 respect to the Offshore Areas under CERCLA Sections 107 or 113, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 or
5 9613, against the United States, including any department, agency or instrumentality of
6 the United States and/or the State, or any employee, officer, agency or instrumentality
7 thereof (but not including counties, cities, local governmental entities or sanitation
8 districts); or (3) any claims arising out of response activities at the Offshore Areas.

9 Nothing in this Decree shall be deemed to constitute preauthorization of a claim within
10 the meaning of Section 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611, or 40 C.F.R. § 300.700(d).

11 C. DDT Defendants covenant to and shall, within ten (10) days after the Date
12 of Final Approval of this Decree, dismiss and withdraw their appeal to the Ninth Circuit
13 of this Court's entry of the Amended Consent Decree with the Settling Local
14 Governmental Entities, the Amended Consent Decree with Potlatch/Simpson and the
15 Consent Decree with CBS (collectively, Case No. 99-56895).

16 D. The DDT Defendants covenant to and hereby do dismiss with prejudice,
17 effective upon the Date of Final Approval of this Decree, any and all counterclaims that
18 have been asserted at any time in this action. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil
19 Procedure 41(a)(1), all parties stipulate to the dismissal with prejudice of all
20 counterclaims that have been asserted at any time in this action. Pursuant to Federal Rule
21 of Civil Procedure 41(a)(2) and (c), the Court hereby orders that on the Date of Final
22 Approval of this Decree, all counterclaims that have been asserted at any time in this
23 action are dismissed with prejudice. No party hereto shall appeal the Court's disposition
24 of any of the counterclaims in this action. Nothing herein shall preclude the Released
25 Parties from asserting claims permitted by Paragraph 9.C. and 14.B.

26 E. The Released Parties covenant not to raise, in any future administrative or
27 judicial proceeding or otherwise, and hereby waive, any argument that any portion of the
28 settlement amounts paid pursuant to this Decree should be used for or credited towards

1 any response actions relating to the Onshore Areas. Defendants shall not object to the
2 manner in which Plaintiffs use, distribute, or credit the settlement amounts. No portion
3 of the settlement amounts paid pursuant to this Decree shall be credited towards any
4 future response costs relating to the Onshore Areas.

5 F. The Released Parties hereby covenant not to sue or to assert any civil or
6 administrative claim or cause of action against any other signatory to a settlement with
7 the United States and State of California that has previously been approved by the United
8 States District Court in this action, or any employee, officer, agency or instrumentality of
9 such a signatory, for any matter relating to Natural Resource Damages, Response Costs,
10 or DOJ Costs, including but not limited to any claim under Sections 107 or 113(f) of
11 CERCLA (42 U.S.C. Section 9607 and Section 9613(f)), to the same extent the Released
12 Parties are protected against claims in Paragraph 27. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the
13 scope of this covenant not to sue is limited to suits or civil or administrative actions for
14 Natural Resource Damages, Response Costs, or DOJ Costs encompassed by the
15 covenants contained in Paragraphs 8 and 12 above but which for whatever reason are not
16 encompassed by the covenants not to sue given by the United States and the State of
17 California to the signatories to the prior settlements.

18 G. The covenants set forth in Paragraph 15.A-15.E pertain only to matters
19 expressly specified therein, and extend only to the United States and State. The Released
20 Parties reserve, and this Decree is without prejudice to, all other rights, claims and
21 defenses against the United States or State, including without limitation, in response to
22 claims brought pursuant to Paragraphs 10 and 13.

23 **MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS**

24 16. On October 18, 2000, the Court took under submission the issue of liability
25 of the DDT Defendants for certain onshore areas to which hazardous substances from the
26 Montrose Plant are alleged to have been released. On October 27, 2000, the Court took
27 under submission the issue of the alleged liability of Chris-Craft as an operator of the
28 Montrose Plant. The Court may render judgment on these two issues regardless of

1 whether this Consent Decree is approved. No Party may make any motion to the Court
2 prior to the Court's rendering judgment on the foregoing two issues except for motions
3 to enter and enforce this Decree. The DDT Defendants shall not seek from the Court in
4 this action any review or relief with respect to EPA's or DTSC's conduct with regard to
5 the Onshore Areas, including without limitation, EPA's or DTSC's investigations,
6 determinations, decisions, or response actions. The foregoing sentence, however, shall
7 not apply should the United States or the State seek, after the Date of Lodging of this
8 Decree, additional relief not sought in this action before the Date of Lodging of this
9 Decree, nor shall it prevent the DDT Defendants from pursuing review or relief in a
10 separate action.

11 17. By lodging this Decree, the United States, State of California, and the DDT
12 Defendants jointly request that the Court vacate, and by entry of this Decree as an order
13 of the Court, the Court orders the vacatur of, the following orders: the portion of Civil
14 Minute Order dated June 26, 2000 (entered July 5, 2000) relating to Motion # 2; Order
15 Re: Sanctions Against State of California, dated August 1, 2000; June 5, 2000 Order
16 Denying Plaintiffs Motion to Vacate Order to EPA, and September 19, 2000 Order
17 Granting Defendants' Motion for Sanctions for Failure to Comply With Court Orders
18 (entered September 20, 2000). Such vacatur shall become effective on the Date of Final
19 Approval of this Decree. Such Orders shall have no precedential effect in any state or
20 federal administrative or judicial proceeding. The DDT Defendants hereby waive and
21 release any claim for fees and/or costs to which they could claim entitlement under any of
22 the foregoing orders and agree that upon Final Approval of this Decree, these orders are
23 a nullity for all purposes.

24 **PENALTIES FOR LATE PAYMENTS**

25 18. A. If the payments required of the DDT Defendants by Paragraphs 6, 7 and
26 11 of this Decree are not made by the dates specified in those Paragraphs, the DDT
27 Defendants shall be liable, in addition to the payments specified in Paragraphs 6, 7, and
28 11, for the following amounts for each day of delay in payment:

<u>Days of Delay</u>	<u>Payment Per Day of Delay</u>
1-14	\$ 5000/day
15-60	\$ 7500/day
Beyond 60 Days	\$ 10,000/day

Payments due under this Paragraph shall be paid by certified or bank check or warrant and disbursed, 50% to the United States and 50% to the State (the latter to be held in trust for the state signatories hereto), to the addressees identified in Paragraph 27. Stipulated penalties due under this Paragraph 18 are due within thirty (30) days following receipt by the DDT Defendants of a written demand by the United States or the State for payment of such stipulated penalties, and shall be made in accordance with instructions provided by the United States or the State to the DDT Defendants subsequent to the Date of Lodging of this Decree, with notice to the United States or the State.

B. In addition to the remedy provided for in the preceding subparagraph, if the payments required of the DDT Defendants by Paragraphs 6, 7, and 11 of this Decree are not made by the dates specified in those Paragraphs, the DDT Defendants shall be liable, in addition to the payments specified in those Paragraphs, for interest on those amounts at the same rate paid by the Escrow established pursuant to Paragraph 6.

C. In addition to the remedy provided for in the preceding subparagraphs, if the payments required of the DDT Defendants by Paragraphs 6, 7, and 11, of this Decree or by this Paragraph, are not made, the DDT Defendants shall be liable, in addition to the payments specified in those Paragraphs, for any costs and attorneys fees incurred by Plaintiffs in enforcing the terms of this Decree.

19. Payments due under Paragraph 18 shall be in addition to any other remedies or sanctions that may be available to the United States and the State on account of the DDT Defendants' failure to comply with the terms of this Decree.

RETENTION OF RECORDS

20. A. Until five years after the entry of this Decree, each DDT Defendant shall preserve and retain all records and documents now in their possession or control or

1 which come into their possession or control, that relate to the identification, nature and
2 quantity of hazardous substances at the Montrose DDT Plant, the nature and extent of
3 alleged releases of hazardous substances from the Montrose DDT Plant, or the alleged
4 release of any hazardous substance to or from the Offshore Areas. This obligation does
5 not apply to records or documents previously exchanged between the DDT Defendants
6 and the United States or the State prior to the Date of Lodging of this Decree. At the
7 conclusion of this document retention period, the DDT Defendants shall notify the
8 United States and the State at least ninety (90) days prior to the destruction of any such
9 records or documents, and upon request by the United States and the State, the DDT
10 Defendants shall produce or make available for their inspection any non-privileged
11 records or documents at a mutually convenient time and place agreed upon by the Parties.

12 B. In addition to the opportunity to obtain documents at the conclusion of the
13 retention period set forth in Paragraph 20.A, the United States and the State may request,
14 at any time during such retention period, that the DDT Defendants make available for
15 their inspection, or at the DDT Defendants' option produce, any documents retained
16 pursuant to Paragraphs 20.A. DDT Defendants shall produce or make available for
17 inspection non-privileged documents at a mutually convenient time and place after the
18 request is made.

19 C. With respect to the obligation to retain records and to produce or make
20 them available for inspection as set forth in Paragraph 20.A and B, the DDT Defendants
21 may assert that certain documents, records and other information are privileged under the
22 attorney client privilege, or any other privilege recognized under state or federal law. If
23 Plaintiffs request any privileged documents – either (1) at the time the DDT Defendants
24 provide notice of intent to destroy documents at the conclusion of the retention periods
25 from Paragraph 20.A, or (2) pursuant to Plaintiffs' request under Paragraph 20.B – the
26 DDT Defendants shall provide the United States and the State with the following
27 information relating to any documents that are requested and withheld as privileged: (1)
28 title of document or record; (2) date of document or record; (3) name and position of the

1 author of the document or record; (4) description of the subject of the document or
2 record; and (5) the specific basis for the privilege asserted. The privilege log relating to
3 the subject documents must be produced to the Plaintiffs at a mutually convenient time
4 and place after Plaintiffs request the documents that are withheld. DDT Defendants shall
5 retain the documents that are withheld as privileged, until any privilege disputes relating
6 to those documents are resolved. If Plaintiffs do not request any particular privileged
7 documents, the DDT Defendants need not produce a privilege log for such non-requested
8 documents.

9 E. This Paragraph in no way effects or limits any obligation of the DDT
10 Defendants to retain records under any other administrative or judicial order or
11 agreement, whether such order or agreement is currently extant or created in the future.
12 Further, this Paragraph in no way effects or limits any obligation of the DDT Defendants
13 to retain records under any other judicial, statutory, or common law doctrine that would
14 otherwise require retention of records.

15 **VOIDABILITY**

16 21. In the event that a final judicial determination is made by the District Court
17 or, upon appellate review, by a higher court, that the entry of this Decree in its entirety
18 shall not be approved, this Decree and the settlement embodied herein is voidable at the
19 discretion of any party and the terms hereof may not be used as evidence in any litigation
20 or other proceeding.

21 **COMPLIANCE WITH OTHER LAWS**

22 22. This Decree shall not be construed in any way to affect any past, current or
23 future obligation of the DDT Defendants or any other person or entity to comply with
24 any federal, state or local law.

25 **RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

26 23. After the Court renders judgment on the issues described in Paragraph 16,
27 the Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for the purpose of entering such further
28

1 order, direction or relief as may be necessary or appropriate for the construction,
2 implementation or enforcement of this Decree or other consent decrees.

3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 damages, contribution and other claims for: (1) Natural Resource Damages, (2) Response
2 Costs, and (3) DOJ Costs. No contribution protection is provided pursuant to this Decree
3 for any claim for response costs under CERCLA incurred in connection with the
4 presence, release or threatened release of a hazardous substance outside the Offshore
5 Areas, as defined herein. Any rights the Released Parties may have to obtain contribution
6 or otherwise recover costs or damages from persons not party to this Decree are
7 preserved, except as provided in Paragraph 15.F.

8 28. The Trustees have determined that the payment to be made pursuant to
9 Paragraphs 6 and 7 of this Decree is an appropriate action necessary to protect and restore
10 the natural resources damaged by the release of DDT, PCBs and other hazardous
11 substances alleged in the First Claim for Relief of the complaints and that the payment
12 satisfies the requirements of Section 122(j)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(j)(2).

13 **NOTICE**

14 29. Any notice required hereunder shall be in writing and shall be delivered by
15 hand, facsimile or overnight mail as follows:

16 Notice to the United States and the State:

17 As to the United States:

18 Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section
19 Environment and Natural Resources Division
20 DOI Case #90-11-3-511
21 U.S. Department of Justice
22 P.O. Box 7611
23 Washington, D.C. 20044-7611

24 As to EPA:

25 John Lyons
26 Assistant Regional Counsel
27 U.S. EPA Region 9
28 Mailcode ORC3
75 Hawthorne St.
San Francisco, CA 94105

As to DTSC:

Barbara Coler
Division Chief, Statewide Cleanup Operations Div.
California Department of Toxic Substances Control
700 Heinz Avenue, Suite 200
Berkeley, CA 94710-2721

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 As to State of California:
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
2 Land Law Section
Office of the Attorney General
3 300 South Spring Street
Los Angeles, CA 90013
4 Facsimile No. (213) 897-2801

5 As to DDT Defendants:
President
6 Montrose Chemical Corporation of California
600 Ericksen Avenue, Suite 380,
7 Bainbridge Island, WA 98110

8 David Mulliken
Latham & Watkins
9 701 B Street, Suite 2100
San Diego, CA 92101

10 General Counsel
11 Chris-Craft Industries, Inc.
767 Fifth Avenue, 46th Floor
12 New York, N.Y. 10153

13 Peter Simshauser
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP
14 300 South Grand Avenue
Los Angeles, CA 90071

15 Joseph C. Kelly
16 Vice President and General Counsel
Stauffer Management Company
17 1800 Concord Pike
P.O. Box 15438
18 Wilmington, DE 19850-5438

19 Paul B. Galvani
Ropes & Gray
20 One International Place
Boston, MA 02110.

21

22 Each party to this Decree may change the person(s) it has designated to receive
23 notice for that party, or the addresses for such notice, by filing a written notice of such
24 change with the Court and serving said notice on each of the other Parties to this Decree.

25 30. This Decree may be executed in any number of counterparts, and each
26 executed counterpart shall have the same force and effect as an original instrument.

27

28

1 **ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

2 31. This Decree constitutes the entire understanding of the Parties with respect
3 to its subject matter. The fact that any party suggested language different from, or
4 additional to, any language ultimately adopted in this Decree shall not be taken into
5 account in interpreting this Decree.

6 **EFFECTIVE DATE**

7 32. This Decree shall be effective upon the date which this Decree has been
8 entered by the United States District Court.

9 33. By signature below, all Parties consent to this Decree.

10 **JUDGMENT**

11 THE FOREGOING Consent Decree among Plaintiffs United States and
12 State of California, and the DDT Defendants is hereby APPROVED and ORDERED.

13 There being no just reason for delay, this Court expressly directs, pursuant
14 to Rule 54(b), Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, ENTRY OF FINAL JUDGMENT in
15 accordance with the terms of this Decree; each party hereto shall bear its own costs and
16 attorney's fees except as specifically provided herein.

17
18 IT IS SO ORDERED

19
20 DATED:

21 _____
22 THE HONORABLE MANUEL REAL
23 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
24
25
26
27
28

1 FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:

2 WE HEREBY CONSENT to the entry of the Consent Decree in United
3 States, et al. v. Montrose Chemical Corporation of California, et al., No. CV 90-3122-R,
4 subject to the public notice and comment requirements of 28 C.F.R. § 50.7.

5

6

7

8 Dated: _____, 2000

LOIS SCHIFFER
Assistant Attorney General
Environment & Natural Resources Division
United States Department of Justice

10

11

12

13 Dated: _____, 2000

STEVEN O'ROURKE
ANN HURLEY
MICHAEL McNULTY
ADAM KUSHNER
ROBERT KLOTZ
Environmental Enforcement Section
Environment & Natural Resources Division
United States Department of Justice
Attorneys for the United States

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 FOR EPA:

2

3

4 Dated: _____, 2000

5

6

7

8

9

10 Dated: _____, 2000

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

KEITH TAKATA
Director of the Superfund Division
United States Environmental Protection Agency
Region 9
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105

KATHLEEN JOHNSON
JOHN J. LYONS
MICHELE BENSON
Office of the Regional Counsel
United States Environmental Protection Agency
Region 9
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105

1 FOR THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND GAME:

2 WE HEREBY CONSENT to the entry of the Consent Decree in United
3 States, et al. v. Montrose Chemical Corporation of California, et al., No. CV 90-3122-R,
4 subject to the public notice and comment requirements of 28 C.F.R. § 50.7.

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

DATE: _____

ROBERT C. HIGHT
Director of California Department of Fish and
Game

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

FOR THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF TOXIC SUBSTANCE CONTROL:

WE HEREBY CONSENT to the entry of the Consent Decree in United States, et al. v. Montrose Chemical Corporation of California, et al., No. CV 90-3122-R, subject to the public notice and comment requirements of 28 C.F.R. § 50.7.

DATE: _____

EDWIN F. LOWRY
Director of California Department of Toxic Substances Control (and on behalf of the California Hazardous Substance Account, the California Hazardous Substance Cleanup Fund, and the California Toxic Substances Control Account)

1 FOR THE CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION:

2 WE HEREBY CONSENT to the entry of the Consent Decree in United
3 States, et al. v. Montrose Chemical Corporation of California, et al., No. CV 90-3122-R,
4 subject to the public notice and comment requirements of 28 C.F.R. § 50.7.

5

6

7

8 DATE: _____

PAUL D. THAYER
Executive Officer of the State Lands
Commission

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

FOR THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION:

WE HEREBY CONSENT to the entry of the Consent Decree in United States, et al. v. Montrose Chemical Corporation of California, et al., No. CV 90-3122-R, subject to the public notice and comment requirements of 28 C.F.R. § 50.7.

DATE: _____

JOHN "RUSTY" AREIAS
Director California Department of
Parks and Recreation

1 FOR THE CALIFORNIA, REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD,
2 LOS ANGELES REGION:

3 WE HEREBY CONSENT to the entry of the Consent Decree in United
4 States, et al. v. Montrose Chemical Corporation of California, et al., No. CV 90-3122-R,
5 subject to the public notice and comment requirements of 28 C.F.R. § 50.7.
6
7

8 DATE: _____

_____ DENNIS A. DICKERSON
9 Executive Officer
10 Los Angeles Region, Regional Water Quality
11 Control Board
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 FOR DEFENDANTS AND RELEASED PARTIES:

2 WE HEREBY CONSENT to the entry of the Consent Decree in United
3 States, et al. v. Montrose Chemical Corporation of California, et al., No. CV 90-3122-R.

4

5 CHRIS-CRAFT INDUSTRIES, INC.:

6

7

8 DATE: _____ By: _____
SIGNATURE

9

10 _____
NAME (printed or typed)

11

12 _____
TITLE (printed or typed)

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 AVENTIS CROPSCIENCE USA, INC.:

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By:

SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 ATKEMIX THIRTY-SEVEN, INC.:

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By:

SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 MONTROSE CHEMICAL CORPORATION OF CALIFORNIA:

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By: _____
SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 STAUFFER MANAGEMENT COMPANY

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By: _____
SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 IMPERIAL CHEMICAL INDUSTRIES PLC

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By: _____
SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 ICI INTERNATIONAL INVESTMENTS, INC.

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By: _____
SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 ZENECA INC.

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By: _____
SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 ZENECA HOLDINGS, INC.

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By: _____
SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 STAUFFER CHEMICAL COMPANY

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By: _____
SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 RHODIA INC.

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By: _____
SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 AVENTIS CROPSCIENCE USA LP

2

3

4 DATE: _____

By:

SIGNATURE

5

6

NAME (printed or typed)

7

8

TITLE (printed or typed)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28